Notification of withdrawal of: “Reply to Beheim et al.: Reanalyses confirm robustness of original analyses”

Patrick E. Savage^{*1}, Harvey Whitehouse², Pieter François^{2,3}, Thomas E. Currie⁴, Kevin C. Feeney⁵, Enrico Cioni⁶, Rosalind Purcell⁶, Robert M. Ross^{1,7, 8}, Jennifer Larson⁹, John Baines¹⁰, Barend ter Haar¹⁰, Alan Covey¹¹, Peter Turchin^{12,13}

As we noted prominently, our initially uploaded preprint was a "non-peer-reviewed draft subject to revision". We have now recognized and corrected an important error in our data and code (details at <https://github.com/pesavage/moralizing-gods>) leading us to withdraw this version of the manuscript. Correcting this error does not change any of the conclusions of our original article¹. A correction notice and an updated version of this manuscript² have been submitted for peer review and will be posted publicly once they have completed peer review.

Please do not cite, use or distribute the previous version further. We apologize for any confusion caused.

References:

1. Whitehouse, H. *et al.* Complex societies precede moralizing gods throughout world history. *Nature* **568**, 226–229 (2019).
2. Whitehouse, H. *et al.* Reply to: Treatment of missing data determines conclusions regarding moralizing gods. (Submitted).

¹ Faculty of Environment and Information Studies, Keio University, Shonan Fujisawa Campus, Fujisawa, Kanagawa 252-0882, Japan

² Centre for Anthropology and Mind, University of Oxford, Oxford OX2 6PE, UK

³ St. Benet's Hall, Oxford OX1 3LN, UK

⁴ Human Behaviour & Cultural Evolution Group, Department of Biosciences, University of Exeter, Cornwall TR10 9FE, UK

⁵ School of Computer Science and Statistics, Trinity College Dublin, Dublin 2, Ireland

⁶ Seshat: Global History Databank, Evolution Institute, San Antonio, FL 33576, USA

⁷ ARC Centre of Excellence in Cognition and its Disorders and Department of Psychology, Royal Holloway, University of London, Surrey TW20 0EX, UK

⁸ Department of Anthropology and Archaeology, University of Bristol, Bristol, BS8 1TH, UK

⁹ Department of Modern & Classical Language Studies, Kent State University, Kent, OH 44242, USA

¹⁰ Department of Chinese Language and Culture, Asia-Africa-Institute, University of Hamburg, Hamburg 20146 Germany

¹¹ Department of Anthropology, University of Texas Austin, Austin, TX 78712, USA

¹² Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Connecticut, CT 06269, USA

¹³ Complexity Science Hub Vienna, 1080 Wien, Austria

* e-mail: psavage@sfc.keio.ac.jp