ESCOLA
Eleva

Catarina Bandeira Diaz

SYRIAN REFUGEES IN RIO DE JANEIRO
Does the Brazilian Law Lead to Invisibilization?

Research paper presented to a Social Sciences Examination Board, in partial fulfillment of the academic requirements for the completion of an individual Senior Capstone Project at Eleva School, Botafogo, Rio de Janeiro, as part of High School Graduation on the International Track.

Mentorship

Denise Pini Rosalem da Fonseca, BArch, MA, PhD

ABSTRACT

Considering a global scenario in which refugees are struggling to find asylum and after that integrate themselves, it is necessary to analyze the efficiency of different immigration policies and, more specifically, their practical implications in the lives of refugees. This present paper analyzed the general scenario of refugee integration through the lenses of a study case of the Syrian Refugees in Rio de Janeiro. The question this research aims to answer is if the considered progressive Brazilian integration laws are actually causing a process of invisibilization. The title takes an ontological stand and supports the sociological concept of the word “invisibilization”, since the object of interest is in fact the gradual process of turning invisible. The analysis of this project consists in literature review, interview with a specialist on the topic of Syrian Refugees in Rio de Janeiro, interpretation of open interviews with three refugees living in Rio and participative observation in a field research at a Refugee Festival. Analyzing all the data and personal depositions, the analysis points to two main categories of challenges for Syrian Refugees trying to integrate: a cultural isolation and local social barriers. Both types correspond to detachments from forms of their identity: isolated from their identity in Syria and not integrated enough to have an identity in Brazil. Accordingly to Brazilian legal reports, the social barrier should be facilitated if the all the policies foreseen in the Constitution and Refugee Act were actually implemented.

KEYWORDS

1) Refugee; 2) Syrian; 3) Brazilian Immigration Law; 4) Integration; 5) Invisibilization.

RESUMO

Considerando cenário global, no qual os refugiados lutam para conseguir asilo, e após este, para integrar-se, é necessário que se analisem a eficiência das políticas de imigração e, mais especificamente, suas implicações práticas na vida dos refugiados. Este estudo analisa o cenário geral da integração de refugiados através de um estudo de casos de refugiados sírios no Rio de Janeiro. A questão central desta pesquisa é discutir se a lei que prevê a integração de imigrantes no Brasil, considerada progressista, não está na realidade promovendo a sua invisibilização. A nomenclatura do título parte de um ponto de vista ontológico para dar suporte ao caráter sociológico do uso da palavra “*invisibilization*”, posto que o objeto de interesse deste estudo é, de fato, um processo gradual de tornar invisível. A metodologia utilizada consiste em uma revisão narrativa da literatura; entrevista com especialistas no tema dos refugiados sírios no Rio de Janeiro; interpretação autorizada de entrevistas realizadas por pesquisadores com três refugiados vivendo no Rio de Janeiro, e observação participante no campo de pesquisa em um Festival de refugiados na cidade. A análise dos dados e depoimentos obtidos no campo da pesquisa primária apontam para duas categorias principais com respeito à integração: o isolamento cultural e barreiras sociais locais. Ambas correspondem a formas de alienações de suas identidades: isolados de sua identidade síria e não suficientemente integrados para construir uma identidade no Brasil. De acordo com relatórios oficiais produzidos no Brasil, a esta barreira social poderia ser superada se todas as políticas previstas na Constituição e na Lei de Imigração fossem realmente implementadas.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE

1) Refugiado; 2) Sírio; 3) Lei de Imigração Brasileira; 4) Integração; 5) Invisibilização.

Author's note: Although it might be argued that the word “invisilization” is a neologism - in spite of the fact that it has been already used as a concept in recent published academic papers - we decided to adopt it in this work to highlight the aspect of a *process* (action) that results in the invisibility of an specific social group.

This work is dedicated to my grandpa Benito Diaz Paret.

CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION.....	7
2. BACKGROUND KNOWLEDGE: A NARRATIVE REVIEW.....	10
2.1. The Brazilian Immigration Law: Historical Aspects and the Present Legal Frame.....	10
2.2. To Be a Refugee in Brazil: Considerations Upon the Boundaries of the Current Brazilian Immigration Law.....	13
2.3. Integration <i>versus</i> Invisibility: What is Under Discussion.....	14
3. SYRIAN REFUGEES IN RIO DE JANEIRO.....	19
3.1. The Making of a Research about an Invisible Social Group...	19
3.1.1. Approaching an Underexplored Issue: Bibliographic Review.....	19
3.1.2. Approaching Real Refugees: Invisible Social Group.....	20
3.2. Syrians in Rio de Janeiro: A Brief Report.....	21
3.3. Four Interviews and One Refugee Event: What Can Be Seen, What Can Be Said?	24
4. FINAL CONSIDERATIONS.....	28
5. BIBLIOGRAPHIC REFERENCES.....	31
6. APPENDIXES.....	33
6.1. Appendix 1: Interview with Carolina Radusewski - The Questionnaire.....	33
6.2. Appendix 2: TCLE.....	35
6.3. Appendix 3: Taking Action – The Final Product.....	36

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I would like to acknowledge the Escola Eleva for supporting my interests of study and research through the Senior Capstone Project. This way, I had the privilege and opportunity of already working towards my academic production while still in High School. Foremost, I thank my counselor Annie Kim for introducing this program and supporting my choice of study topic.

Secondly, I would like to express my deep and sincere gratitude for my mentor Denise Pini Fonseca for providing me with the best guidance through this research: methodological, insightful and kind. It was a great honor to learn and to work under her impeccable orientation. Thank you for believing in me from day one and supporting me all along.

I am extending my heartfelt gratitude to the research collaborators that made the depth of my analysis in this present paper possible. The specialist Carolina Radusewski who I interviewed was of great importance for the contribution of this paper, in the sense that it consists of an actual generation of knowledge and not only a literary review. In addition, I would like to thank Tulin Al Hashemi, Zakaria Kasen, Usama Barbour. They are Syrian Refugees who contributed enormously with their personal experiences to my research. I am absolutely thankful for the collaboration and my access to their interviews conducted by Carolina Radusewski, as they allowed me in a reality of a population in a state of intense vulnerability and invisibility.

A very special gratitude goes out to all my teachers and educators who made me fall in love with the Political and Social Sciences. With special mention to Marcelo Tavares, my History teacher, to João Felipe Ribeiro, my Geography teacher, and to Evaldo José Palatinsky, my Philosophy teacher.

I am also grateful for the generosity of Doctors Maria Rita Villela and Marcelo Tavares for taking the time to read and comment this work.

Plus, I am grateful to my best cheerleader: Pedro Bettim. He was always keen to know how I was progressing and what I was planning to do next. Thanks for all the encouragement, emotional support and love throughout this process.

Finally, last but no means least, I am most grateful to my parents, Bruno Lourenço Diaz and Christianne Bandeira de Melo, who have always inspired me in every area of my life. Now, they inspire me as extraordinary researchers of Brazilian Academia. As my parents, they are always loving and forever interested in my personal projects. As professors and researchers, they are warriors.

Morada do Sol, Spring, 2019.

1. INTRODUCTION

It is in the early 1950's - the period of the beginning of the universalization of the rules about refugees - which Brazil commits to their protection. Nonetheless, for the majority of time during this period, the country was still under a military and civic dictatorship, which made the implementation of refugee protection specific laws very precarious and pretty much fruitless.

For this reason, effective policies for the reception of refugees in Brazil only emerged at the end of the 1970's. And, since then, with the democratization of Brazil, those policies and many more have evolved enormously. For instance, the passing of the Refugee Act (Law 9.474/97) in 1997 and the fact that Brazil has more recently become a country of resettlement are examples of the Brazilian considerable evolution on refugee protection.

Because of all the progress made, Brazil is nowadays regarded as a model for the protection of refugees in South America and has one of the most advanced refugee specific policies around the world. Evidence of this is a statement of the UNHCR (United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees) itself, as the government of Brazil has allowed the re-opening of an office of the UNHCR on its territory:

Nowadays, the countries in the region are at different stages of the process of internal consolidation of their international commitments. Brazil became the regional leader with the approval of a Refugee Act in 1997 (ACNUR, 2003 *apud* JUBILUT, 2006, p. 2).

Considering that Brazilian Law is actually acknowledged by international organs, such as the UNHCR, how is the Brazilian population so blind to the refugee question? Why refugees still have a lot of social and bureaucratic difficulties in adapting to the country? This present paper aims to answer such questions.

This research paper is based on a narrative review of the literature; interview with a specialist on the topic; personal statements of three Syrian refugees living in Rio de Janeiro, and an observatory participation as a strategy of field research. This way, the extent of this research justifies the significance of the paper in a perspective of a forthcoming complement and

contribution to this specific field of scientific study about Brazilian Refugee Specific Laws.

The gap in the literature concerning the topic of Refugees in Brazil is a very clear piece of evidence of the relevance of this paper. When researching the literature on the Internet, using scientific search engines, it is obvious the difficulty of finding peer-reviewed research papers and articles that acknowledge the presence of refugees in Brazil, particularly the Syrians. The lack of academic focus around this specific theme is clearly related to the reality of refugees living in Brazil. This means that the general lack of information with the Brazilian population about refugees in Brazilian territory is both one of the causes for the gap in the academic literature and one of its consequences.

Furthermore, this artificial cycle of blindness around the theme of refugees as a Brazilian question, besides being only a foreign issue clearly impacts the day-to-day life of refugees living in Brazil, since lack of information many times translates itself to discrimination. Therefore, this work does not only intend itself to be a contribution to reducing the literature gap, but also it wishes itself to be a form of advocating for refugees rights.

The research question the present paper will address is: Does the Brazilian Law lead to invisibilization? This question comes from a hypothesis based on the gap between the great advancement in refugee protection the Brazilian Law represents and the tough reality many refugees face daily in Brazil's territory.

One of the great advancements of Brazilian Law is actually the very principle that guides most of the refugee specific policies in the country: the principle of integration (Law No. 6.815/1980). To this fashion, there are no specific laws about refugee camps, for instance. The policy in Brazil is one of immediate integration of the arrivals in the Brazilian society. In theory, this is a very positive and advanced action for the protection of refugees, however, in practice, it actually might have some hidden great drawbacks to the refugee population. This work aims to highlight exactly this gap between what the Brazilian Law foresees and what actually happens in the routine of these refugees in Brazil.

The hypothesis which this paper targets to study is that the greater drawback caused by the theoretically advanced Brazilian Law is, in fact, a process of invisibilization of the refugees (JUBILUT, 2006). In other words, due to the fact that there is a legal effort for the direct integration of refugees in the Brazilian society - as opposed to the segregation created by refugee camps in other countries -, there is actually a process of invisibilization of this social group.

This invisibilization might happen in two fronts: 1) social, and 2) cultural. For instance, social invisibilization might have its routes in a educational problem in Brazil, because even an educated Brazilian will most likely know very little about the status of refugees in Brazil. Thus, it is almost if refugees in their essence were non-existent for the majority of the Brazilian population, although there are integration policies.

Another example of this educational barrier is the fact that many Brazilians see the Refugee Crisis strictly as an issue that only impacts Europe and Asia. This misconception might be very much related to access of information, since the international media mostly reports news about Turkey, Lebanon, United Kingdom, France, and some other European countries. Moreover, in relation to the previously mentioned cultural invisibilization, the integration policy might have drastic repercussions for refugees in the sense of making more difficult to stay connected to their identity, culture, and home.

This study, thence, has as ultimate goal the analysis of the impact of the Brazilian Law on the life of refugees and on a stipulated process of invisibilization. The analysis of the effects of Brazilian policy will be developed through statements of three Syrian Refugees in Rio de Janeiro. This way, this research can be divided into three core questions: 1) Do Syrian refugees feel a process of invisibilization in Rio de Janeiro?; 2) Which type of invisibilization is this: mostly social or cultural?, and 3) To what extent does the Brazilian Law leads to invisibilization?.

These are essential guiding questions to approach the hypothesis as a whole.

2. BACKGROUND KNOWLEDGE: A NARRATIVE REVIEW

The theme of Syrian refugees living in *Rio de Janeiro* is yet to be tackled by a systematic and in depth academic research. Because that is a relatively small population living in the city on a very silent manner – for the reasons that the literature review will suggested - that is a social group which has been *visible* only through NGOs and immigration offices.

According to the National Council for Refugees (CONARE) provided by the 4th Edition of the report “Refugees in Numbers”, Brazil recognizes, just in 2018, a total of 1.086 refugees of different nationalities (...) Syrians represent 36% of refugees in Brazil... (UNHCR 1, 2019, online) [Our free interpretation].

It must be pointed out a very particular case for Syrian in Brazil, since these refugees are welcomed by the Brazilian Immigration Law (Lei No. 9.474/1997), which is very differently for the reality of – for instance – the Venezuelan immigrants, who are not even considered refugees by the Brazilian government.

2.1. The Brazilian Immigration Law: Historical Aspects and the Present Legal Frame

The article “Refugee Law and Protection in Brazil: a Model in South America?” (JUBILUT, 2006) consists of an analysis of the development of Brazilian laws concerning refugees until the re-democratization and the path to become nowadays a resettlement country.

The main question of the article is if this relatively recent and innovative set of Refugees Laws can be considered a model in South America. Thus, the author also makes use of comparison studies between the specific policies of other Latin American countries.

The author describes positive and negative aspects of the legal protection of refugees as things currently stand. The negative aspects are the lack of a deadline for the government to decide the requests for refuge; the lack of economic, social and cultural rights in its specific law for refugees; the lack of provisions for refugee status determination in the event of massive influx of refugees; the fact that the organ vested with the responsibility of first

decisions on refuge - CONARE¹ – is within the Executive Branch of the State, which can lead to political bias; the fact that access to the judicial system is not stated explicitly in the specific law for refugees; and the lack of public policies for refugees.

On the other hand, the positive aspects are the existence of a specific and exclusive law for refugees; respect for the minimum international standards of International Refugee Law (for example, the principle of non-*refoulement*²); a broad definition of the concept of refugee; the absence of a time limit for requesting refugee status once inside Brazil; a comprehensible process of refugee status determination regulated by law; the broad composition of CONARE encompassing representatives of all organs related to the integration of refugees, as well as a representative of civil society and of UNHCR as a voice-no-vote member, and the fact that CONARE specifically does not include a representative of the organ responsible for immigration to Brazil; the granting of documents to applicants for refugee status; permission for applicants for refugees to work; the idea and practice of resettlement in solidarity; the constant public information effort; and the important role played by civil society in all phases of protection of refugees (decision-making/protection, assistance and local integration).

Through this comparative analyzes, Liliana Lyra Jubilut (2006) concludes that positive aspects outweigh the negatives. On this basis, in comparison with other countries in the region, Brazil can be considered a model for South America regarding refugee protection.

The author sustains that Brazil is very advanced on their legal mark in relation to making an effort to protect and integrate refugees. However, these statements raised a number of questions: 1) the constitutionally determined laws and Refugee Acts are what really take place in practice in the day-to-day lives of these groups?, and 2) The law provides these people with the

¹ *Conselho Nacional para Refugiados, Ministério da Justiça e Segurança Pública* (National Council for the Refugees, Justice and Public Security Ministry) Available at: <https://www.justica.gov.br/seus-direitos/refugio>

² Definition of non-*refoulement*: A principle of international law providing a refugee or asylum seeker with the right to freedom from expulsion from a territory in which he or she seeks refuge or from forcible return to a country or territory where he or she faces threats to life or freedom because of race, religion, nationality, membership in a particular social group, or political opinion (merriam-webster.com).

possibility to integrate locally? On the other hand, it might be so progressive in the sense of free integration, which might even cause them to be passed as invisible.

This hypothesis comes from the fact that even people in Brazil with higher education still perceive the reality of refugees as issue very unrelated to the country. A practical evidence of that is the lack of research on Syrian refugees in Brazil: while going through the literature, it was alarming the gap in the number of sources that regard Brazil as an important resettlement country as it is, in comparison to other countries.

To approach questions such as the above, the legal report “Refugee Law and Policy: Brazil” published by Eduardo Soares – as a Senior Foreign Law Specialist - at Law Library of *The Library of Congress* online (2016) was also studied. The report is divided into seven main categories: 1) Asylum Policies and Procedures; 2) Refugee Policies and Procedures; 3) Acquisition of Citizenship; 4) Services for Immigrants; 5) Role of State and Local Authorities; 6) Free Movement in the Country, and 7) New Legislation.

Firstly, it is highlighted that the granting of asylum is a principle identified in the Brazilian Constitution, as:

Article 4 of the Brazilian Constitution states that the international relations of Brazil are governed by, *inter alia*, the principles of the “prevalence” of human rights, cooperation among peoples for the progress of humanity, and the granting of political asylum (SOARES, 2016, online).

It is specified that the Law No. 6.815 (August 19th, 1980) - the *Estatuto do Estrangeiro*³ - creates the *Conselho Nacional de Imigração* (National Council of Immigration), which is an apparatus with the sole purpose of dealing with Immigration Policy. But, it is established that actually it is the Department of Federal Police, which is subordinate to the Ministry of Justice and Public Security, is the competent agency to enforce legislation dealing with nationality, immigration and aliens.

In addition, in the Refugee Status Act, under the Law specific to refugees, the topic of local integration is addressed to the Brazilian authorities that should consider the atypical nature of the refugees’ situation when refugees are required to present documents issued by their countries of origin

³ Lei No. 6.815/1980 – Available at: http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/LEIS/L6815.htm

or its diplomatic and consular representations. In such circumstances, the authorities should take the unfavorable situation of the refugees into account, and facilitate the recognition of certificates and diplomas for refugees seeking to obtain resident status and admission in academic institutions at all levels.

Although this facilitation is under the responsibilities of the Brazilian authorities, the certification of documents is one of the most common challenges for refugees in Rio. In Rio de Janeiro, state representatives indicate the institution of *Cáritas*⁴ for refugees who need help with the translation and recognition of documents to find work and continue their education. This way, there is a clear gap between what is provided in the Refugee Status Act and what really happens in practice.

Brazilian Law does not contain specific provisions concerning services or integration of immigrants into the society, or free medical treatment. However, according to the Constitution, it is the competence of the federal government, the states, the Federal District, and the municipalities to take care of public health and public assistance.

Indeed, the very fact that Brazilian Law does not contain specific provisions concerning services or integration of immigrants and, at the same time, expects that the State will provide all this support for refugees might consist in one of the reasons of the gap between the considerate advanced Brazilian Refugee Law and the reality of refugees while trying to integrate themselves into the Brazilian society.

2.2. To Be a Refugee in Brazil: Considerations Upon the Boundaries of the Current Brazilian Immigration Law

The research paper *“Refugiados Sírios no Rio de Janeiro: Experiências concretas de adaptação e resiliência”* (RADUSEWSKI, 2019) acknowledges the Brazilian legislation regarding refugees as “pioneer and advanced” (RADUSEWSKI, 2019, p. 23), as the country attracted the attention of both other countries and of the ones seeking refuge. However, there is the conscience of the challenges still related to adaptation. The article

⁴ *Cáritas* is an International Network of the Catholic Church, which is devoted to social work, including with refugees worldwide. Available at: <http://caritas.org.br/refugiados-e-migrantes>

understands that protection only in the legal formal level is not efficient. New measures are needed to achieve what is already foreseen in the specific legislation.

The article points out it is possible to see several similarities between the participation of the community life of the refugees and the living in the poorer areas of large cities, among them is the difficulty of use of public transportation. For the people living in the periphery of *Rio de Janeiro*, the difficulties are the high price of the tariff; for the refugees, is the lack of information and spatial orientation. In common, they have the difficulties of precarious service and insecurity. Access to housing is limited in both cases by lack of financial resources by making these groups seek accommodation at the margins of the large centers, at small homes that do not adequately accommodate the locals (RADUSEWSKI, 2019).

The author makes an interesting case for the present paper's hypothesis that there is an invisibilization process, since it places the refugee population as a vulnerable group in Rio de Janeiro such as the poorest social class (RADUSEWSKI, 2019). The marginalization of vulnerable social groups in the city of Rio de Janeiro may be a contributing factor for the imagined invisibilization process of refugees (RADUSEWSKI, 2019).

Likewise, from the data presented in the article about the regions of the city of Rio de Janeiro the majority of refugees live in, it is possible to question if there is not a hidden segregation of refugees in the city (RADUSEWSKI, 2019). Although the Brazilian Law does not predict any segregation and actually defends the direct integration of refugees, there might be an actual spatial segregation of this population due to their low average income and little financial power.

2.3. Integration *versus* Invisibility: What is Under Discussion?

The article "Becoming a Refugee: Reflections on Self-Understandings of Displacement from the Syrian Case" by Wendy Pearlman (2018), from Northwestern University, mainly discusses the definition of refugee through the perspective of Syrian refugees themselves. In such manner, it exposes the specificities of the Syrian forced migration and characteristics of

displacement, while arguing the importance understanding how do they identify with the definition of refugee.

The notion of “self-understanding” (PEARLMAN, 2019, p. 302) is too of paramount importance for the analysis in this present work, as it may reveal how they interact with different levels of integration or even invisibilization in a society other than their own.

It is significant to note that the nearly 400 displaced Syrians interviewed for this article are not in Brazil, but do unfold a number of questions about the Syrian identity as they are in a variety of host countries: Jordan, Turkey, Lebanon, the UAE, Germany, Sweden, Denmark, and the United States (PEARLMAN, 2019).

Moreover, the author exposes statistics about the enormous proportions of Syrian displacement has around the world. The numbers dated from 2018 presented in the paper make refugees from Syria the single largest national group among the record 68 million people currently displaced around the world (PEARLMAN, 2019).

This became increasingly the case as regime repression escalated, the rebellion militarized, external actors intensified their interventions, and conflict evolved into the multi-dimensional war that now has claimed some half a million lives, destroyed much of country, and forced more than half the population from their homes. As a summer 2018, more than 5.6 million Syrian were refugees in the Middle East and North Africa, about one million were seeking or had received asylum in Europe, and about 100,000 had been resettled elsewhere. Another 6.6 million were estimated to be internally displaced (PEARLMAN, 2019, p. 300).

The author, then, begins to debate the way refugees in her interviews would portray their own story and displacement. Based on these records, she delineated patterns in their depositions, from where the writer produces the thesis that explores “how one’s self-definition as a refugee might evolve gradually, and thus be the product of a process of ‘becoming’ more than ‘being’” (PEARLMAN, 2019, p. 302). So, the analysis shifts focus to the differences in delimitations between the conventional definition of the term and the one based on the subjectivity of Syrian refugees themselves.

According to the UNHCR, a refugee is:

... someone who has been forced to flee his or her country because of persecution, war or violence. A refugee has a well-founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, political opinion or membership in a particular social group. (UNHCR 2, 2019, online).

Of course, the technical definitions are crucial for the legal protection of refugees. For instance, in Brazilian Law, the definition of refugee for the national government is recorded in the 1997 Brazilian Refugee Act. In this document, the official definition is the reproduction of the classical formalization enshrined in the 1951 Convention. It says that an individual shall be recognized as a refugee if:

... due to severe and generalized violation of human rights, he or she is compelled to leave his or her country of nationality to seek refuge in a different country. (Lei No. 9.474/1997, Art. No. 1).

However, the author still supports her position of the significance of refugees' self-understandings for them as individuals and for the migration dynamics. Pearlman (2019) goes on to explore different relationships that most refugees experience as a method of analysis on to studying their self-determinations.

About the three indicative relationships studied: 1) displaced persons' relationships to their expectations of return to their homeland; 2) their relationships to their pre-flight lives, and 3) their relationships to the word "refugee" itself, the author informs that:

I explore them as one set of starting points for an inquiry into refugee status not as a legal category or geographical fact, but as a personal identification. (PEARLMAN, 2019, p. 302).

To approach the theme of "invisibilization", our main source was the article "Invisibilization and Silencing as an Ethical and Sociological Challenge" by Brenno Herzog (2018). The author defines the process of invisibilization and silencing as an important obstacle to the integration of excluded and marginalized social groups. Herzog argues that their very exclusion is actually being produced by mechanisms that make a group be seen as insignificant or "invisibilized" through the spreading of the notion that it is somehow irrelevant to the public sphere (HERZOG, 2018).

This concept of how groups are being excluded or marginalized is interesting to think of the roots of the process of neglecting the population of Syrian refugees in *Rio de Janeiro*. According to Herzog's thesis, this might be related to a narrative accepted by the majority of the population of *Rio de*

Janeiro that these refugees are not relevant to the public interests of the city and its surroundings.

In fact, it might be the case that people actually have a lot of prejudice against refugees in general. It is known that refugees all over the world, not only Syrian in *Rio de Janeiro*, unfortunately suffer the consequences of a phenomenon called “narrativism”. This means that the legitimized truths about refugees in many contexts refer only to a small group of refugees (HERZOG, 2019). This happens as a consequence of keeping the narrative narrow and only including certain groups. For instance, the generalized fear that refugees are responsible for economic crisis in receptor countries is only one narrow narrative.

However, it has impacts in discriminating the whole group, since people have this old inherited wisdom that this group can even be harmful to the public sphere, as supported by Herzog, this could be one of the main factors for exclusion and for the posterior invisibilization (HERZOG, 2018).

“Invisibilization” alludes to the discursive act of “invisibilizing” a social group. This is done by making it not be seen or mentioned through constructing the discourse around it. Often through silence or simply lack of knowledge, this process is characterized by having two main effects: it makes the problems these people face either become invisible or wrongfully appear to be their own fault (HERZOG, 2018).

As an unfortunate consequence of many factors within narrativism perpetuated by Rio’s community and the space for oblivion created by an effective integration policy, the refugees in *Rio de Janeiro* suffer from a process of invisibilization of two types.

Because of the well-intended integration laws, there is no spatial segregation for Refugees in *Rio de Janeiro*. There is not, for instance, a refugee camp. Although it may seem very progressive and positive for the refugees, it also brings negative aspects (RADUSEWISH, 2019). The segregation in camps makes refugees very visible. It is a tangible issue for the population. Proof of that is how the vast majority of the people in *Rio de Janeiro*, when thinking of refugees, will think of tents in very faraway places, like France, in Europe - what is most broadcasted by the media apparatus.

The population, however, cannot acknowledge that these refugees exist among them, as they believe these issues are so disconnect to their reality. Therefore, the first invisibilization process is actually to not be seen by Rio's community, this translates to misrepresentation, a lack of support from the general public and a lack of information, which many times can result in different types of discrimination. For the purposes of this study, this **first type** will be understood as a *social invisibilization*.

Making silence heard, giving voice to the silenced and bringing the invisibilized back into the public domain are therefore fundamental tasks of solidarity in reaching a higher degree of social integration (HERZOG, 2018, p. 1).

The **second type** is in fact a *cultural invisibilization*, since it does not refer anymore to the interaction of Rio's public and the refugees. Type of invisibilization is related to a process within their own community - in this particular case, the Syrian identity. When trying to fit in a new country, after some time or even after generations, refugees undergo a detachment of their culture. Some might adapt to another first language, others might forget principles of tradition to be more commercial in a whole new environment. When moving away from their cultural roots while having difficulties to integrate in the new territory, refugees may experience being in a gray area of invisibility.

3. SYRIAN REFUGEES IN RIO DE JANEIRO

Although it is clear the positive aspects of Brazilian welcoming policy towards Syrian refugees in the country (UNHCR 1, 2019), the practical implications and day-to-day reality in *Rio de Janeiro* for this social group in particular have a series of drawbacks (RADUSEWISK, 2019).

By living under a condition of what we called *social and cultural invisibilization*, Syrian refugees conform a social group with places a lot of difficulties to be approach by academic research as yet.

3.1. The Making of a Research about an Invisible Social Group

As a consequence of dealing with an invisible social group, this effort to perform a field research had to rely on personal connections, which were already established by people and institutions with a few Syrian refugees who agreed to collaborate.

What follows is a brief description of the methodology used for the development of this work.

3.1.1. Approaching an Underexplored Issue: Bibliographic Review

In order to approach a reality of such complexity – and yet so poorly understood in Brazil – it was mandatory that we started by building a comprehensive bibliography surrounding the theme, to prepare the way to go on the field and try to know real actors of such human tragedy. Therefore, the steps adopted for the development of this study were the following.

Initially we established a strategy for the process of online selection of sources to produce a comprehensive, relevant, suitable and up-to-date narrative review.

From July 4th to 11th, 2019 two academic online platforms - *Google Scholar* and *The Library of Congress* - were accessed adopting the following research strategy and results:

✓ From the search using the research argument “Brazilian Refugee Law” (25 results) two documents were selected: 1) the article “Refugee Law and Protection in Brazil: a Model in South America?” (JUBILUT, 2006) and 2) the legal report “Refugee Law and Policy: Brazil” (SOARES, 2016);

✓ The use of the argument “Syrian Refugees” (30.200 results) resulted on the selection of the article “Becoming a Refugee: Reflections on Self- Understandings of Displacement from the Syrian Case” (PEARLMAN, 2019);

✓ From the use of the argument “Refugee Invisibilization” (5 results) we selected the article “Invisibilization and Silencing as an Ethical and Sociological Challenge” (HERZOG, 2018), and

✓ From the use of the argument “*Direitos de Integração do Refugiado*” (900 results) (Refugee Integration Rights) two articles were selected: 1) “*Direito dos refugiados e realidade: a necessária diminuição das distâncias entre o declarado e o alcançado*”⁵ (VEDOVATO, 2011), and 2) “*Hospitalidade e Proteção Internacional ao Refugiado: do discurso à prática entre os países latinos da América do Sul e da União Europeia*”⁶ (PRADO, 2014).

✓ Finally, from the use of the argument “Refugees in Rio de Janeiro” (29 results) one article was selected: “Protection and Vulnerability in Urban Contexts: The Case of Refugees in Rio de Janeiro (MOULIN, 2013).

Furthermore, reference sources, as the online platform of the *Britannica Encyclopedia*⁷ (2019) and *Merriam Webster*⁸ (2019), were consulted in order to specify the meaning of essential concepts that are employed throughout the present work, such as: “integration”, “segregation”, “invisible”, “relegate” and “oblivion”.

3.1.2. Approaching Real Refugees: Invisible Social Group

After reading the selected material, we started looking for ways to develop a primary research to outdo the literature review format. Such opportunity came in the form of collaboration with Carolina Radusewski - a journalist from Reuters International and a specialist on Syrian Refugees in Rio de Janeiro. She is the author of the Master Thesis entitled “*Refugiados Sírios no Rio de Janeiro: experiências concretas de adaptação e resiliência*”⁹

⁵ Refugee Law and Reality: The Necessary Reduction of the Distances Between What is Declared and What is Achieved. [Our free interpretation].

⁶ Hospitality and International Protection to Refugees: From Speech to Practice Between the Latin American and European Union Countries. [Our free interpretation].

⁷ Available at: <https://www.britannica.com/>

⁸ Available at: <https://www.merriam-webster.com/>

⁹ Syrian Refugees in Rio de Janeiro: Concrete Experiences of Adaptation and Resilience. [Our free interpretation].

(RADUSEWSKI, 2019) presented to the Economy Institute of the Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (UFRJ) in October 2019.

The access to her manuscript was the materialization of a crucial research contribution, which also included: 1) a interview on the subject with her, and 2) the formal authorization (*Termo de Consentimento Livre e Esclarecido* – TCLE) to access three interviews given by Syrian Refugees living in Rio de Janeiro as collaborators of her research.

The methodology employed for the interview with Carolina Radusewski was in the format of a digital questionnaire, which was divided in two sections: 1) The first section consisted of five questions to qualify the identity of the collaborator, and 2) The second was composed of thirteen questions related to the hypothesis of this work.

Finally, we performed a participative observation of a so-called “refugees’ integration” initiative in Rio de Janeiro, during the public event called *Rio Refugia*¹⁰, which took place on the premises of *SESC Rio*¹¹ on June 20th, 2019. That was the third edition of this event, which means to congregate refugees living in Rio de Janeiro, and is organized by ACNUR, along with several NGOs, as part of the celebrations of the Refugees Day.

The methodology at this event consisted of participating on workshops, activities and fairs with the broad public; of interacting with the refugees that were working at the fair selling food and art, and of recording observed facts and occurrences in a notebook. In addition to that, the research at the festival also happened in the format of informal interviews with representatives of two organizations that support refugees that had panels there: *Abraço Cultural* and *Cáritas*.

3.2. Syrians in Rio de Janeiro: A Brief Report

Carolina Moulin on the work “Protection and Vulnerability in Urban Contexts: The Case of Refugees in Rio de Janeiro”, published online by Humanitarian Action in Situation Other Than War (HASOW) in 2013, offers an

¹⁰ Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/2019/06/26/festival-rio-refugia-atrai-multidao-e-celebra-integracao-entre-brasileiros-e-refugiados/>

¹¹ Serviço Social do Comércio. Available at: <http://www.sescrj.org.br/noticia/11/06/19/rio-refugia-2019-sesc-rj-celebra-o-dia-do-refugiado-com-programacao-especial-no-ses>

overview of the Brazilian laws concerning refugees and asylum seekers. Furthermore, the author focuses on the specificities of refugees living in the city of *Rio de Janeiro* and its Metropolitan Area.

Firstly, Carolina Moulin explains some of the attractive factors of Brazil for people seeking refuge. The geographic and cultural proximity - that can be applied when discussing refugees from Colombia or Angola - are obviously listed. However, the factor analyzed that most logically fits the experience of Syrian refugees in Rio would be their network (MOULIN, 2013).

The article discusses that networks are fundamental for understanding the mobility patterns of the refugee population in Brazil and also their survival strategies. Many times, these social networks act as nodes of informal exchange economy: a large number of refugees live off the sale of goods between their home country and Brazil (MOULIN, 2013).

Such networks are crucial for the initial integration and acceptance of the refugee in the new reality. This first inclusion usually happens through the welcome of fellow refugees and compatriots, who serve as linguistic and cultural translators - including in official procedures of applicants (MOULIN, 2013).

Concerning the specificities of *Rio de Janeiro*, the author starts by presenting the challenges of humanitarian protection of refugees in the city. Actually, Rio de Janeiro Metropolitan Area - known as "Great Rio", comprising the city of Rio de Janeiro and 16 other municipalities of the lowland surroundings, the *Baixada Fluminense*) is responsible for receiving more than half of the refugee population in Brazil (MOULIN, 2013). The author argues that this destination is elected due to the:

... centrality of Rio de Janeiro on the national scene, as an important pole of economic production, and on the world stage, as a pole of tourist attraction and representative of the Brazilian imaginary abroad (MOULIN, 2013, p. 21).

However, when analyzing the actual conditions, which all of these refugees are live in, the author explains that their employability is precarious:

Aggregated data from Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo showed that 56,4% of working-age refugees were working, although more than half occupied informal jobs (BAENNINGER & BERTINO, 2010 *apud* MOULIN, 2013, p. 23).

The article points out two possible explanations for this issue of employment: 1) difficulties with language, and 2) low professional qualification (MOULIN, 2013). Moreover, challenges while facing job placement is a reality even for refugees who have a good educational and professional background (degrees and work experience). One of the causes for this problem is the costly and slow bureaucracy of the Brazilian system to revalidate the diplomas obtained abroad (MOULIN, 2013). On that account, the lack of perspective in the job market serve as discouragement to a greater engagement of these groups, thus contributing to a process of invisibilization (MOULIN, 2013).

Furthermore, the author corroborates with the hypothesis of the impact of narrativism in the life of refugees in Rio de Janeiro and argues that there is a:

... veiled tendency, but highly widespread (...) that refugees are fugitive, criminals in their home countries, who have found sanctuary along with local outlaws (MOULIN, 2013, p. 24).

This prejudice immediately raises a misleading stigma of banditry and turns them into invisible social outcasts (MOULIN, 2013). Such perspective strengthens the urgent necessity for the development of programs to educate the local population about the reality of actual refugees living in Rio de Janeiro.

Prejudice is thus an important factor explaining the difficulties of integration of refugees in the state, despite the image conventionally accepted that the people of Brazil in general, and of Rio in particular, are open and receptive to foreigners. Recent research by the United Nations Program for Development (UNDP, 2009) showed that almost half of the Brazilian respondents are contrary to an open immigration policy and advocate rigid forms of control over foreigners in national territory. According to UNDP, “43% of Brazilians are in favor of limiting or prohibiting immigration and another 45% say that Brazil must allow people to arrive as long as there are available jobs” (MOULIN, 2013, p. 24).

After analyzing humanitarian challenges refugees face in *Rio de Janeiro* with public health and education, the author acknowledges that Brazil has a strong federal centralized system (CONARE) with the objective of determining the status of refugees and protecting them, but effusively criticizes that this sense of protection is very limited to the law and the policy technicalities of integration (MOULIN, 2013).

To a large extent, protection has been interpreted restrictively, often subsumed into the idea of legal recognition and permanence of refugees in

the country and the delimitation of their rights and obligations within the national legal framework. Although rights of residence are paramount, social, economic and cultural rights need to be incorporated into the larger debate on refugee protection (MOULIN, 2013, p. 16).

Carolina Moulin concludes her article by emphasizing the importance of active participation of the civil society, alongside the refugees themselves, as necessary elements for an effective democratization of the complex dynamics of local integration (MOULIN, 2013).

3.3. Four Interviews and One Refugee Event: What Can Be Seen, What Can Be Said?

In the interview of the 30-years old journalist Carolina Dias Radusewski, who is a postgraduate in the UFRJ Department of Economics and Sustainable Management, the primary sources Radusewski produced for her dissertation and the particularities of her article manuscript “Syrian Refugees in Rio de Janeiro: Concrete Experiences of Adaptation and Resilience” were discussed. In her studies, she focus on the sustainability social pilar and her object of research is migratory movements and Syrian refugees.

The first discussion topic was the characteristics of the Brazilian Refugee Law itself. Carolina Radusewski talked about how she considers the Brazilian Law a very advanced one compared to the current policies in European countries and worldwide. She, then, gave the example of a new migration law that passed in 2017 May to replace the Foreigner Statute. She stated: “In a nutshell, this new law decriminalizes the presence of immigrants in Brazilian territory and includes questions concerning stateless people and refugees, what makes it a very progressive measure.” Besides that, the journalist emphasizes the advantages of the refugee application process detailed in Brazilian Law. She explains that people still during the application process can access the united Health system and can enroll in public schools, which does not happen in most European countries, she said. After that, she narrated a case of a Syrian refugee that she had interviewed for academic purposes. He was settled in Rio de Janeiro, where he has a brother, for two years, when he got an opportunity to move to France. The story goes so that

he only stayed in France for a period less than a year and went back to Brazil. Nowadays, he is adjusting to Rio de Janeiro and works at an Arab food stand because he argues that the hospitality of the local population in relations to refugees is much better in Brazil.

Carolina Radusewski, then, emphasizes the difficulties refugees face to stay connected to their own culture and country of origin. She shared that from the sample of refugees that she has met and officially interviewed most of them are somewhat integrated in Rio de Janeiro's society, but have given up of trying to stay connect to their cultures. She states that it is a question of balance that is very difficult for people who were displaced seeking refuge and still are in vulnerable situations. Her assessment is that these particular cases saw disconnecting themselves to their core identity as Syrians as their only escape from a condition of isolation in Rio de Janeiro.

Throughout the whole interview, Radusewski established a connection to the refugee group to other vulnerable groups from Rio de Janeiro (usually referring to financial vulnerability). She points out that many of the challenges refugees face in order to fully integrate themselves in Rio are the same faced by people from lower social classes, such as: accessing the Brazilian public health system (SUS), enrolling their children in quality public schools, or difficulties in entering the job market. In this case of the job market, the difficulty of entering is the same for both groups, but the reasons may be very distinct. In Brazil, people from lower social classes face a structural problem of education and, many times, are not qualified for high paying positions. On the other hand, for Syrian refugees, this scenario changes a lot, since many of them were studying at the university in Syria or have graduate degrees, but the documents proving their graduations cannot be efficiently recognized in the Brazilian system – which contradicts what is prescribed in the Law. This way, highly qualified Syrian professionals enter the informal job market when they come seeking asylum in Brazil.

When asked her opinion on the hypothesis of the present paper (Does the Brazilian Law lead to Invisibilization?), she totally agrees and explains that many refugees state that they chose Brazil because of ease of entry into the country: *"The Brazilian public authorities facilitated entry, but gave no subsidy for people to actually stay and live here"* (RADUSEWSKI, 2019).

In three interviews of the refugees, there is a clear tone of hope, although there are difficulties in integration. All three of them - Tulin, Zakaria and Usama - point out that language is the main barrier faced by them. Usama, for instance, learned Portuguese while worked carrying heavy boxes with his colleges while he lived in Brasília. He said he decided to move to Rio de Janeiro because “it is better to work”.

Quando a gente chegou, não falar nada de português, entendeu? Tem que trabalhar com pessoa árabe para ajudar a gente (...) Porque aqui (Rio de Janeiro) dá para trabalhar melhor. Aqui ganha mais (Usama, July 2018).

Zakaria also shared his difficulties in finding a job. His testimony shows that one of the most important factors for Syrian refugees’ decision on if they are going to stay in a country or not is their accessibility to the job market and if they are able to send money back for their families in Syria.

Eu tava quase saindo daqui e voltando para a Turquia. Porque fiquei quase um ano sem conseguir trabalhar. Eu tenho que mandar dinheiro para a minha família, né. A luta tava aqui, em conseguir trabalho (Zakaria, May 2019).

Tulin, the woman interviewed, was the one to identify the violence in Rio de Janeiro as one of her day-to-day challenges while trying to better integrate herself in this new community.

A violência, infelizmente. Eu fico sempre com medo quando eu pego ônibus ou ando na rua. Eu fico pensando: “Talvez eu vou ser assaltada aqui.” (...) Sem a violência, eu acho que o Brasil poderia ser o melhor país do mundo mesmo (Tulin, May 2019).

In our experience in observatory participation at the *Rio Refugia!* Festival, a different connection from refugees to their cultures was observed. There, there was still this constant sense of hope, but more than that, there was a stronger sense of pride of their identity. It is crucial to note that it was an annual event with the purpose of celebrating the refugees, but still this joyful atmosphere was impactful.

In the Refugee event, we could observe the dynamics of food and handcraft goods tents organized by refugee. They all had huge lines and the atmosphere was of celebration and joy. In our perception, this was a time when they could connect to their core identity and to Rio’s community. This way, we consider the festival and other refugee-held fairs to function as a

bridge. Another positive aspect of these events is that they can profit from an activity they are clearly enjoying.

The flow of the workshops is what most caught our curiosity. At first, we saw a huge line leading up to a space indoors we could not see from the distance. When we finally got there, we realized all these people were standing and that at the end of the line there was one man sitting at a desk. He was a Syrian refugee and he was writing people's name in Arabic in little pieces of paper. Nonetheless, what shocked us the most was the fact that he was not rushing anything. He made everyone sit in front of him, talk for a while, and only after this ritual he would start writing whatever the person wanted. We did not get the chance to find out his story and specific background, but it was clear for me that the moments to talk and exchange with each one there were precious to him.

In addition, we were able to talk to people that had different projects at the Festival. We talked to people from Caritas, who explained more about the process they have with helping with documentation. Another project we found very interesting was one called *Abraço Cultural*, they work as a Languages School and the teachers are all refugees that get the chance to teach their native languages. First, they have to attend some classes on didactics, but the projects focus on the exchange of experiences and cultures between all students and teachers. As we are studying integration, this project seemed the perfect combination of both practical and cultural values.

4. FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

This research aimed to answer the research question: Does the Brazilian Law lead to invisibilization? This hypothesis and the methodological process employed in the present paper were developed around the conjecture that the Brazilian Immigration Law and its integration policy are considered a model to be followed in other countries (JUBILUT, 2006) and, at the same time, refugees in Brazil are a neglected vulnerable group.

By analyzing the Brazilian Refugee Act and CONARE together with real experiences in interviews with Syrian Refugees, this paper has showed how an integration policy can actually directly and indirectly shape how refugees are perceived daily. This perception, then, points out to a process of invisibilization. In order to precisely study this sociological phenomenon, the analysis was divided in two parts. The part one alludes to a possible social invisibility and the part two alludes to a possible cultural invisibility.

For the first part, based in the legal reports, UNHCR data and the interviews, it is evident that the way the Brazilian Immigration Law is enforced (or the very lack of its effective enforcement) strongly implicate in a scenario of invisibilization of the Syrian population in Rio de Janeiro. This happens due to the huge gap between what is present in the laws and what the local public institutions are prepared to deal with. The Syrian case is perfect for illustrating this Brazilian tendency, in the sense that the Brazilian government internationally considers the situation in Syria an absolute tragic and welcomes the Syrians who are seeking refuge. Although, it is quite easy to get in Brazil as a Syrian refugee, every next stage once inside the country is very challenging for them. This tough reality begins from the airport where there is not any official prepared to receive people who have just flew across oceans and land scared and who do not speak Portuguese.

Even afterwards, this gap from what it is prescribed in the law and what happens in practice never ceases to follow them, even in matters that should be strictly precedential and legal. For instance, the interviews conducted for this present paper and here analyzed point to a difficulty of recognizing documents from Syria, an activity, which according to the CONARE prescriptions, should be done by the Federal Police stations.

In the discussion, for a more focused study, two types of invisibilization process were defined: the social and the cultural one. Based in the literature review and the variables considered in the practical analysis experiences, the final conclusion is that the Brazilian Immigration Law – but, in fact, the disregard for its respective public policies – lead to invisibilization of the Syrian refugee population in Rio de Janeiro.

This paper also identifies a more eminent invisibilization process in the social definition rather than in the cultural. That is, refugees are more invisible in the sense that they face many challenges for their integration in the Brazilian society, Brazilians generally do not recognize the Refugee Crisis as a cause they embrace, or even that it is a cause that could be present in the Brazilian territory. While, on the other hand, they can still connect to their cultures and countries of origin, as pointed out in the interviews and in the observatory participation strategy in the field research at the Rio Refugia! Festival. The two main reasons for that are the fact that most of the Syrian refugees that come to Brazil report that they have some sort of contact and familiar network in the Brazilian territory, and the fact that there are festival and weekly fairs where refugees connect to the culture of origin even if it is for practical commercial purposes.

In summary, this paper advances our understanding of the Syrian refugees' conditions and challenges faced to integrate themselves into the Brazilian society, more specifically in Rio de Janeiro. Furthermore, it contributes to the knowledge of the impacts of a Direct Integration Policy - and its gaps and unemployment - have on refugees' lives and how this might hide them from the Brazilian population as a pressing issue, causing a process of their invisibilization. In addition, this research is revelant in the sense that it contributes for the understanding of topic that lacks in scientific interest and production in Brazil.

Although our consideration is that this paper has been successful in answering its research question, there are adjustments that should be made in future developments. In respect of the limitations of the research and recommendations for the future studies, the literature review is purposely limited in the Syrian-specific context and challenges, since it is a Syrian study case in Rio de Janeiro. However, it is recommended that future studies

consider exploring different ethnicities of refugee groups in different great urban poles in Brazil, so the understanding of the impacts of the Brazilian Law nation-wide are better perceived.

Some avenues for future research is exploring other variables that appeared as a background in the analyses of the interviews of the three refugees. In Tulin's interview, there is a question of the generational variable, while considering the discrepant levels of integration between her and her mother. Another interesting study could focus on the gender issues as perceiving adaptation and integration process of Syrian refugees in Rio de Janeiro, where the cultural aspects would be very much highlighted. Moreover, in Zakaria's interview, the curious possible research topic that comes up is in fact a question of exploitation relationships within their own Syrian refugee population, since there is an evident tendency for the informal job market where a more settled refugee can improperly and inhumanely take advantage of a fellow refugee's workforce.

5. BIBLIOGRAPHIC REFERENCES

HERZOG, B. Invisibilization and Silencing as an Ethical and Sociological Challenge. **Social Epistemology**. A Journal of Knowledge, Culture and Policy, V. 32:1, 2018. pp. 13-23. Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/02691728.2017.1383529>.

Accessed on: 11/19/2019.

JUBILUT, L.L. Refugee Law and Protection in Brazil: a Model in South America? **Journal of Refugee Studies**, Vol. 19, No. 1. Published by Oxford University Press, 2006, February. pp. 22-44. Available at: <http://www.cosmopolis.iri.usp.br/sites/default/files/trabalhos-academicos-pdfs/Journal%20of%20Refugee%20Studies-2006-Jubilut-22-44.pdf>.

Accessed on: 11/13/2019.

Lei 6.815 de 19 de agosto de 1980. Presidência da República, Casa Civil, Subchefia de Assuntos Jurídicos. Available at: http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/LEIS/L6815.htm. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.

Lei No. 9.474 de 22 de julho de 1997. Presidência da República, Casa Civil, Subchefia de Assuntos Jurídicos. Available at: http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/leis/l9474.htm. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.

MOULIN, C. Protection and Vulnerability in Urban Contexts: The Case of Refugees in Rio de Janeiro. **Hasow Discussion Paper 6**. Humanitarian Action In Situation Other Than War, September 2013. pp. 1-29. Available at: <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.404.3942&rep=rep1&type=pdf> Accessed on: 11/19/2019.

PEARLMAN, W. Becoming a Refugee: Reflections on Self-Understandings of Displacement from the Syrian Case. **Review of Middle East Studies**, 52(2). Published by Cambridge University Press, 2019. pp. 299-309. Available at: <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/review-of-middle-east-studies/article/becoming-a-refugee-reflections-on-selfunderstandings-of-displacement-from-the-syrian-case/76F616214C63E784CC0E2D1DDEFADBDB>. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.

PRADO, L.T. **Hospitalidade e proteção internacional ao refugiado**: do discurso à prática entre os países latinos da América do Sul e a União Europeia. Monografia de graduação, Setor de Ciências Jurídicas da Universidade Federal do Paraná. Curitiba, 2014. 74pp.

SOARES, E. Refugees Law and Policy: Brazil. **Law Library**, The Library of Congress Online, Last revised on 06/21/2016. Available at: <https://www.loc.gov/law/help/refugee-law/brazil.php>. Accessed on: 11/13/2019.

RADUSEWISH, C. **Refugiados Sírios no Rio de Janeiro**: experiências concretas de adaptação e resiliência. Manuscrito, Pós-graduação em Economia e Gestão de Sustentabilidade, Instituto de Economia, Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, 2019. 87 pp.

UNHCR 1 (The UN Refugee Agency). **Dados sobre refúgio no Brasil**. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/dados-sobre-refugio/dados-sobre-refugio-no-brasil/>. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.

UNHCR 2 (The UN Refugee Agency). **What is a Refugee?** A Person Forced to Flee Their Country Because of Violence or Persecution. Available at: <https://www.unrefugees.org/refugee-facts/what-is-a-refugee/>. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.

VEDOVATO, L.E. Direito dos refugiados e realidade: a necessária diminuição das distancias entre o declarado e o alcançado. In: RAMOS, A.C.; RODRIGUES, G. & ALMEIDA, G.A. (Orgs.) **60 anos de ACNUR**. Perspectivas de future. São Paulo: Editora CL-A Cultural Ltda., 2011. pp. 289-312. Available at: https://www.acnur.org/portugues/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/60-anos-de-ACNUR_Perspectivas-de-futuro_ACNUR-USP-UNISANTOS-2011.pdf. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.

6. APPENDIXES

6.1. Appendix 1: Interview with Carolina Radusewski - The Questionnaire

Parte 1: Qualificação da entrevistada:

- 1- Nome
- 2- Idade
- 3- Profissão
- 4- Experiência acadêmica no tema de refugiados
- 5- Como você se relaciona, pessoalmente, com este tema?

Parte 2: Questionário:

- 1- Na sua opinião, quais são as principais especificidades do marco legal brasileiro destinado para refugiados que o tornam uma referência para os outros países, além de servir como fator de atração de refugiados? Por quê?
- 2- Como você considera os efeitos na vida dos refugiados potencializados pela falta de conhecimento sobre refugiados da população brasileira e o preconceito vinculado ao fato de que muitos se apegam a uma única e limitante narrativa sobre estes grupos?
- 3- Qual seria, baseando-se na sua pesquisa e em seus entrevistados, o principal problema de adaptação encontrado pelos refugiados vindos da Síria, especificamente? Você foi capaz de identificar certos padrões em suas jornadas para se assentar no Rio de Janeiro?
- 4- Como você compararia as dificuldades encaradas por refugiados no Rio de Janeiro com a de outros grupos vulneráveis cariocas, como pessoas de classes mais pobres?
- 5- Você traçaria um paralelo geral entre a segregação espacial criada por campos de refugiados e a segregação espacial carioca dividida através do cenário de desigualdade social (visto nas favelas, por exemplo)? Explique.
- 6- Como você enxerga um isolamento espacial desses grupos vulneráveis no Rio de Janeiro, especificamente?
- 7- Como você enxerga a capacidade de extensão da formalidade legal até a prática das políticas de integração previstas nas leis para refugiados? Você

enxerga um vácuo entre o que é previsto na avançada lei brasileira e nos desafios encontrados no dia a dia de refugiados no Rio?

8- Quais seriam os limites dessa integração? Quais seriam possíveis medidas legais para intervir nesta problemática?

9- Você acredita que os refugiados sírios no Rio de Janeiro passam por um processo de 'invisibilização'? Em que sentido?

10- Este processo de 'invisibilizar' pessoas de um grupo vulnerável pode ser refletido nas dificuldades para se adaptar e se integrar socialmente no Rio de Janeiro?

11- Como você correlacionaria as políticas de integração com a 'invisibilização' de refugiados?

12- O fato de não haver campos de refugiados no Rio de Janeiro como expressão de uma segregação explícita pode ser considerado progressista por um lado (no marco legal brasileiro), mas pode mascarar esta importante questão do cenário carioca, tornando os refugiados invisíveis à população da cidade. Como você analisaria esta dualidade?

13- Na sua experiência estudando esta temática, como você acredita que a invisibilidade pode ser prejudicial à vida dos refugiados sírios no Rio de Janeiro? Qual seria a melhor e mais eficiente forma de combatê-la?

6.2. Appendix 2: TCLE

TERMO DE AUTORIZAÇÃO PARA USO DE DADOS DE PESQUISA

Eu, **Carolina Dias Radusewski**, portadora do documento de identidade número 21.376.489-7, emitido pelo Detran-RJ, em 30/7/2010, autorizo **Catarina Bandeira Diaz**, portadora do documento de identidade número 33.864.212-7, emitido pela Diretoria de Identificação Civil (DETRAN), em 30/07/2018, a utilizar para fins acadêmicos os dados da pesquisa de campo do estudo intitulado “**Refugiados sírios no Rio de Janeiro: Experiências concretas de adaptação e resiliência**”, sempre citando a autora e seus colaboradores. Esclareço que a referida pesquisa foi desenvolvida por mim para o curso de Economia e Gestão da Sustentabilidade do Instituto de Economia da Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro (UFRJ), sob a orientação da doutora **Denise Pini Rosalem da Fonseca**, constando de documentos legais, revisão bibliográfica e três entrevistas com colaboradores, devidamente autorizadas através de Termos de Consentimentos Livres e Esclarecidos (TCLEs) para fins de uso acadêmico. Compreendo que **Catarina Bandeira Diaz** utilizará o material documental a que este **TERMO DE AUTORIZAÇÃO DE USO DE DADOS DE PESQUISA** se refere EXCLUSIVAMENTE para o desenvolvimento do seu *Senior Capstone Project* intitulado ***Syrian Refugees in Rio de Janeiro: Does the Brazilian Law Lead to Invisibilization?***, como sua monografia de graduação no Ensino Médio na Escola Eleva Botafogo, Rio de Janeiro, em 2019 sob orientação da doutora **Denise Pini Rosalem da Fonseca**.

Rio de Janeiro, 04 de setembro de 2019.

Carolina Dias Radusewski
carolradu@gmail.com

Catarina Diaz Bandeira
catarina.diaz@alunoeleva.com.br

Denise Pini Rosalem da Fonseca
RG. 053.88.604-0 IFP/RJ
denise.fonseca@escolaeleva.com.br

6.3. Appendix 3: Taking Action – The Final Product

Our final product is a syllabus designed for a one-semester course directed to Brazilian High School Students, entitled “Refugees in Brazil: What Do We Know About It?”.

This syllabus aims to be a vector of action to help the integration process of refugees in Brazil, as a diffuser mechanism of knowledge against discrimination of this vulnerable population.

Title	<i>Refugees in Brazil: What Do We Know About It?</i> Elective – Spring 2020
Instructor	Catarina Bandeira Diaz catarina.diaz@alunoeleva.com.br catarinabandeiradiaz@gmail.com
Schedule	Tuesdays, 11:15 – 12:55 (90 min) 14 Sections
Abstract	This course aims to provide Brazilian High School students with a considerable depth of knowledge on the situation of Refugees in Brazil. The syllabus is designed to tackle the following subjects: 1) Demographics; 2) Attractive/Repulsive Factors; 3) UNHCR outreach; 4) Brazilian Legal Frame; 5) Advocacy; 6) Media as an Agent, and 7) The role of NGOs.
Goals	<p>The central goal is to challenge the Eurocentric view on which the Refugees issue is taught in schools and portrayed by the Media in Brazil. Its ultimate motivation is targeting the generalized lack of information about refugees in Brazil.</p> <p>The complementary goals are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">✓ To contribute to engage on social and political studies/actions related to refugees in Brazilian schools;✓ To approach the national scientific production on the topic in the field of Humanities, and✓ To enhance the visibility of the refugees in Brazil as a mean of advocacy and social intervention.
Program	

Part I	<p><i>What Do We Know About It?</i></p> <p style="text-align: right;">6 sections</p> <p>Sections will include a lecture or an exhibition of a movie on the theme under discussion, followed by a class activity (individual or in groups).</p>
Section 1	<p><i>Are There Refugees in Brazil?</i></p> <p>Objective: Introduction of the course by approaching the question of refugees' invisibility in Brazilian territory.</p> <p>Activity: Online questionnaire to be answered individually (Google forms).</p> <p>Content: Video: JORNAL DA BAND, Brasil é esperança de recomeço para refugiados. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fjEofL47zK0 Accessed on: 11/23/19.</p> <p>Complementary Text: ACNUR, Refúgio no Brasil: Uma Análise Estatística. Available at: https://www.acnur.org/fileadmin/Documentos/portugues/Estadisticas/Refugio_no_Brasil_2010_2014.pdf. Accessed on: 11/23/19.</p>
Section 2	<p><i>Not only an Asian and European Issue</i></p> <p>Objective: To challenge the Eurocentric view on which the refugees are portrayed in Brazil.</p> <p>Activity: General discussion of the answers of the questionnaire and reading a text (In pairs).</p> <p>Content: Text: QUIJANO, Coloniality of Power and Eurocentrism in Latin America. Available at: https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0268580900015002005 Accessed on: 11/23/19.</p>
Section 3	<p><i>Brazilian Demographics of Refugee Immigration</i></p> <p>Objective: To know graphs provided by CONARE on refugees living in Brasil.</p> <p>Activity: Reading and interpreting CONARE data on refugees in Brazil (In groups of four).</p> <p>Content: Graphs: CONARE, Refúgio em Números (quatro edições). Available at: https://www.justica.gov.br/seus-direitos/refugio/refugio-em-numeros Accessed on: 11/23/19.</p>
Section 4	<p><i>UNHCR: Booklet for Asylum Seekers in Brazil</i></p> <p>Objective: To learn about the work of UNHCR, its outreach and limitations.</p> <p>Activity: Reading and discussing a primary document (In pairs).</p> <p>Content: Text: ACNUR, Cartilha para solicitantes de refúgio no Brasil. Available at: https://www.acnur.org/portugues/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/Cartilha-para-Solicitantes-de-Ref%C3%BAgio-no-Brasil-ACNUR-2015.pdf Accessed on:</p>

	11/23/19.
Section 5	<p><i>Attractive and Repulsive Factors</i></p> <p>Objective: To learn and discuss barriers faced by refugees worldwide.</p> <p>Activity: Research on the Internet about the reasons for different nationalities (Syrians, Latin Americans and Africans) to choose Brazil to live as a refugee (In groups)</p> <p>Content: Video: GCSE GEOGRAPHY, Migration – Push and Pull Factors. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GG4zYsV0ME0 Accessed on: 11/23/19.</p>
Section 6	<p><i>Creative Presentations</i></p> <p>Objective: To perform the Mid-Term Assessment using the format of group presentations of the results of the research developed on Section 6.</p>
Part II	<p><i>(Under)Standing and Standing Up</i></p> <p style="text-align: right;">8 Sections</p> <p>Sections will have a student-centered workshop format (individual or in pair). Students will be divided thematically in four teams. Each team will decide: (1) which is the approach (legal, NGOs, Media, demographics, etc) that they want to contribute to, and (2) which kind of advocacy material they will present at the final section. Instructors will supervise the work of the teams.</p>
Section 7	<p><i>Brazilian Refugees Law and the Gap</i></p> <p>Objective: To learn and to discuss Brazilian Legal Frame for the Refugees.</p> <p>Activity: Reading and debating (In pairs)</p> <p>Content: Text: JUBILUT, Refugee Law and Protection in Brazil: a Model in South America? Available at: http://www.cosmopolis.iri.usp.br/sites/default/files/trabalhos-academicos-pdfs/Journal%20of%20Refugee%20Studies-2006-Jubilut-22-44.pdf. Accessed on: 11/21/19.</p>
Section 8	<p><i>NGOs Filling the Gap</i></p> <p>Objective: To know the role of Cáritas in Brazil concerning refugees.</p> <p>Activity: Active participation (with previously prepared questions) on a lecture.</p> <p>Content: Guest lecture from a representative of Cáritas in Rio de Janeiro.</p>
Section 9	<p><i>Refugees and The Job Market</i></p> <p>Objective: To learn about the limitations imposed to the</p>

	<p>refugees concerning title recognitions and professional permits and the informal job market.</p> <p>Activity: In class Internet research about the topic (In pair).</p> <p>Content: Video 1: Cartilha para refugiados previne exploração no trabalho. Available at: https://www.redebrasilatual.com.br/cidadania/2016/05/cartilha-com-orientacoes-para-refugiados-previne-trabalho-ilegal-8387/ Accessed on: 11/21/19.</p> <p>Video 2: Conheça o Abraço Cultural (Video Institucional). Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tf6piDhiGHQ Accessed on: 11/21/19.</p>
Section 10	<p><i>Media Presentation of Refugees Crisis</i></p> <p>Objective: To envision some of the stereotyped presentations of the refugee crisis.</p> <p>Activity: Debate different issues concerning prejudice and misconceptions concerning the refugees (In groups of four).</p> <p>Content: Video: GLOBO, Órfãos da Terra: Fauze vê Hussen no campo de refugiados. Available at: https://globoplay.globo.com/v/7568644/ Accessed on: 11/21/19.</p>
Section 11	<p><i>Refugees and Cultural Clash</i></p> <p>Objective: To address cultural clash issues in the context of refuge in Brazil.</p> <p>Activity: Theatrical sketch, which reproduces day-to-day situations of cultural misunderstanding (In groups of four).</p> <p>Content: Video: DOMINGO ESPRTACULAR, Refugiados tentam manter tradições culinárias para a ceia de Natal no Brasil. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=y3-gG1VJOmk Accessed on: 11/21/19.</p> <p>Text: BBC, Migrant Crisis: Changing Attitudes of a German City. Available at: https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-36148418. Accessed on: 11/21/19.</p>
Section 12	<p><i>Real Experiences of Refugees in Brazil</i></p> <p>Objective: To address real life barriers to adaptation of refugees in a new reality.</p> <p>Activity: Writing a letter back home describing your real-life barriers as if you were a refugee in Syria (Individual).</p> <p>Content: Video 1: As Principais Dificuldades dos Refugiados. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MrAUNa4xblM Accessed on: 11/21/19.</p> <p>Video 2: ALI, From seeking asylum to seeking purpose. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Dqbg65emFDU Accessed on: 11/23/19.</p>

Section 13	<p><i>Building Advocacy Material</i></p> <p>Objective: To develop an individual advocacy material (or in pairs) regards the refugees in Brazil.</p> <p>Activity: Individual projects.</p> <p>Content: Free choice of each student with one-on-one support of the instructor.</p>
Section 14	<p><i>Advocacy - Final presentation</i></p> <p>Objective: To perform the Final Term Assessment by individual (or in pairs) presentations of advocacy material produced during the course.</p>
Assessment Criteria	<p>Commitment and participation;</p> <p>Research skills and outputs;</p> <p>Written/artistic/tech production;</p> <p>Verbal proficiency;</p> <p>Creativity and innovation skills;</p> <p>Accuracy;</p> <p>Subject literacy.</p>
Bibliography	<p>HERZOG, B. Invisibilization and Silencing as an Ethical and Sociological Challenge. Social Epistemology. A Journal of Knowledge, Culture and Policy, V. 32:1, 2018. pp. 13-23. Available at: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/02691728.2017.1383529. Accessed on: 11/19/2019.</p> <p>JUBILUT, L.L. Refugee Law and Protection in Brazil: a Model in South America? Journal of Refugee Studies, Vol. 19, No. 1. Published by Oxford University Press, 2006, February. pp. 22-44. Available at: http://www.cosmopolis.iri.usp.br/sites/default/files/trabalhos-academicos-pdfs/Journal%20of%20Refugee%20Studies-2006-Jubilut-22-44.pdf. Accessed on: 11/13/2019.</p> <p>Lei 6.815 de 19 de agosto de 1980. Presidência da República, Casa Civil, Subchefia de Assuntos Jurídicos. Available at: http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/LEIS/L6815.htm. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.</p> <p>Lei No. 9.474 de 22 de julho de 1997. Presidência da República, Casa Civil, Subchefia de Assuntos Jurídicos. Available at: http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/leis/l9474.htm. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.</p> <p>PRADO, L.T. Hospitalidade e proteção internacional ao refugiado: do discurso à prática entre os países latinos da</p>

	<p>América do Sul e a União Europeia. Monografia de graduação, Setor de Ciências Jurídicas da Universidade Federal do Paraná. Curitiba, 2014. 74pp.</p> <p>SOARES, E. Refugees Law and Policy: Brazil. Law Library, The Library of Congress Online, Last revised on 06/21/2016. Available at: https://www.loc.gov/law/help/refugee-law/brazil.php. Accessed on: 11/13/2019.</p> <p>UNHCR 1 (The UN Refugee Agency). Dados sobre refúgio no Brasil. Available at: https://www.acnur.org/portugues/dados-sobre-refugio/dados-sobre-refugio-no-brasil/. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.</p> <p>UNHCR 2 (The UN Refugee Agency). What is a Refugee? A Person Forced to Flee Their Country Because of Violence or Persecution. Available at: https://www.unrefugees.org/refugee-facts/what-is-a-refugee/. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.</p> <p>VEDOVATO, L.E. Direito dos refugiados e realidade: a necessária diminuição das distancias entre o declarado e o alcançado. In: RAMOS, A.C.; RODRIGUES, G. & ALMEIDA, G.A. (Orgs.) 60 anos de ACNUR. Perspectivas de future. São Paulo: Editora CL-A Cultural Ltda., 2011. pp. 289-312. Available at: https://www.acnur.org/portugues/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/60-anos-de-ACNUR_Perspectivas-de-futuro_ACNUR-USP-UNISANTOS-2011.pdf. Accessed on: 11/14/2019.</p>
--	---