Expression Types of 19th-Century Symphonic Music:

The cases of the *Glorifying Hymnic* and the *Majestic Chorale**

Frank Hentschel (Köln)

Introduction, part I: Loudness

In 1888, Max Bruch's aunt Augusta Leo, who was living in Berlin at the time, wrote the following to Max and Clara Bruch:

By the way, the philharmonic hall has been renovated, it is very beautiful, with a large organ, and large stage situated on the appropriate wall. It also sounds good—only, once again, the size of the room is not really appropriate for the *fortissimo*—it doesn't really “pack a punch” [...].¹

Loudness mattered. Whether the loud passages were sufficiently punchy in a concert hall was a central criterion for Bruch's aunt. She was certainly not alone in her preference as other contemporary accounts show, even early ones such as Johann Reichardt who complained about a planned performance of some of his choral work:

You know that I only work with large masses in my choral works and that these pieces are not effective and it's almost impossible to grasp the idea of the work with too few singers—it's like trying to impress upon someone the grandeur of the colonnade in St. Peter's Square in Rome at night using a small hand-held lantern.²

However, this was not a simple matter of personal preference; the quantity of loud music we encounter in the long 19th century clearly lends credence to the view that loudness was an essential feature of the music. Hector Berlioz's *Symphonie fantastique*, his Requiem, or Giuseppe Verdi's Requiem, and Richard Wagner's operas, Anton Bruckner's and Gustav Mahler's Symphonies, Franz Liszt's Symphonic Poems, Antonin Dvořák's Symphony *From the New World* or his Cello Concerto, mass scenes in Grand Operas by Giacomo Meyerbeer are just a few examples that illustrate the central role of loudness. Moreover, Stefan Weinzierl has

* Earlier versions of this article was presented at conferences in Göttingen and Crete as well as at the Universities of Göttingen, Bayreuth, Graz, and Utrecht. I owe thanks to Andreas Domann, Linus Eusterbrock, Emmanuelle de Freitas, and Wiebke Rademacher for commenting on various drafts.

¹ MBA, Künstlerbriefe Band 7 (Allg. Correspondenz 1888. II. Juli–Decbr), 363–368, here 367. Many thanks to Jonas Löffler for drawing my attention to this document.

² Reichardt, *Vertraute Briefe*, 164; for further evidence see Hentschel, “Expressive Qualität,” 162sq. and 174.

recently shown that Ludwig van Beethoven's Symphonies sounded even louder in the concert halls of the day than they do today.³

Illustration 1–2: Composers of loud music: Hector Berlioz (BNF, bibliothèque-musée de l'Opéra, Est. / Portrait) and Richard Wagner (*L'Eclipse* 2 / 65, 18. April 1869, taken from <http://digi.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/diglit/eclipse1869/0087/image>)

To be sure, neither was all music of the 19th century loud (it was also a century of the Lied, of chamber music, and Salon music), nor is loudness an exclusive element of the 19th century—but it is a significant element, especially if we consider its history: in music of the 17th and early 18th centuries, loud music was restricted to either courtly and sacred representations or to operatic moments of terror,⁴ whereas in the 19th century it became such a widespread feature that it seems impossible to give a straightforward answer to the question why loudness was so important for that century's music. Establishing a typology of loud music would help to discriminate between different kinds of loud music without getting lost in the vastness of the material. Thus, a first goal of the present study is to break ground for such a typology focusing on two related types that I will call the *Glorifying Hymnic* and the *Majestic Chorale* in the symphonic repertoire.

Building on this, the second goal is to understand the expressive quality of these types, i.e. to ask what they meant for a contemporary audience, what connotations they had, what associations they triggered and what moods, affects, or emotions they represented (expressed

³ Weinzierl, *Beethovens Konzerträume*, 183–86.

⁴ See Hentschel, “Expressive Qualität,” 166–70.

or induced⁵) and explored. Read in this way, music might be a rich source for understanding the mental state of the social group that gave rise to and consumed this music because it may be assumed that socially and politically significant incidents, developments, and endeavors like revolutions, the middle class's increase of power, or nationalism left their traces in the emotional makeup of the people involved.

Introduction, part II: A method for a historical music psychology

A mid-century commentator on Liszt's symphonic poems wrote that the objects of the composer "are and will always be the affects, feelings, and passions of the heart."⁶ Following this author, understanding 19th-century music would imply understanding the emotions aroused by the music in a contemporary audience. In order to investigate these emotions, we need a historical music psychology. Therefore, I am using the cases of the *Glorifying Hymnic* and the *Majestic Chorale* to introduce a method that may pave the way for such a historical music psychology. It focuses on expressivity and emotion, an aspect that is central to the understanding of music, especially in the 19th century.⁷

Although my preoccupation with a typology of musical excerpts grew out of the effort to delineate different kinds of loud music, as described in the first part of the introduction, such a typology can do a much more important job: it may help solve a difficult methodical problem, namely the scarcity of sources that tell us how the listener of the 19th century experienced the music and what affects, feelings, emotions, and associations the works aroused. To be sure, there are documents from individuals about the reception of specific compositions. But how can we get to more general insights into the music and how it was experienced in the 19th century beyond the individual? Unlike music psychologists, historians lack test persons and cannot establish a laboratory-like situation. Music psychology is able to study the reactions of test persons to selected music examples in strict adherence to the many methodological rules of empirical research. Such experiments may show whether a certain kind of music has a certain kind of effect on a certain kind of listener group as well as where individuals might deviate. But history just happened as it happened and left evidence as it did. Thus, the historian has to deal with what he or she gets. Therefore, historically interpreting the expressive quality of music is

⁵ I share Vladimir J. Konečni's view, that music usually does not induce emotions but rather expresses them (Konečni, "Does Music Induce Emotion?"). For my line of argument, this differentiation is, however, not relevant.

⁶ Anonymous, Briefe über Liszt's symphonische Dichtungen, in: *Fliegende Blätter für Musik*, vol. II, No. 7 (1857), 385–416, here 388.

⁷ Cf. Floros, *Hören und Verstehen*, 42.

a particularly difficult task. There is a wealth of music but little adequate evidence about who experienced the music in what way. “Adequate”, as I take it, would imply that there is (1) a sufficient number of sources that (2) refer to precisely traceable excerpts from musical pieces, (3) do so independently of each other, and (4) contain pieces of evidence that significantly intersect in terms of the descriptions of the listening experience and thus support each other.

Unfortunately, the source material does not provide this kind of evidence at least not in an obvious way. However, if we find many excerpts from musical pieces that are akin to each other, then it might be possible to overcome the source problem. If we accept that it is very likely that similar musical excerpts had similar effects on a similar audience, then we can use source material that is originally referring to just a couple of excerpts from specific compositions to understand the expressive qualities of an entire group of similar excerpts from many more compositions. In order to establish a testable way to define what musical excerpts belong to such a group, a systematic typology is needed. Thus, not only does typology help to delineate types of loud music, it ultimately helps to understand what the music meant and how it was experienced.

How does the method proposed in this study work? Types of loud music passages will be identified by applying rigorously defined sets of musical features. Thus, cluster analysis of musical features on the basis of scores will be used to detect what I call *facture types*.⁸ Subsequently, evidence for the expressive qualities of these *facture types* is collected, such as reviews, egodocuments, contemporary biographies, quotations, programs of program music, and related musical passages in vocal music. If there are sufficient documents by different authors and rooted in different contexts that refer to several distinct excerpts belonging to the same *facture type* and if these documents significantly intersect in how they describe the expressive qualities of these excerpts, they will be used to determine the expressive qualities of the *facture type in toto*. I then speak of an *expression type*.

On the basis of well-known compositions, a hypothesis about a possible *facture type* was established already giving an idea of the musical features that constitute this type. By analyzing the already known excerpts and by looking for ever more similar excerpts that were then also analyzed, the idea of the type was sharpened. The list of features became more and more precise; on this basis, excerpts had to be excluded, new ones included. At some point the features suggested a division of what was originally assumed to be one type into two types: the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic* as explained below. The evidence used to

⁸ In English, the term ‘facture’ is commonly associated with the execution of a painting. Here, I am borrowing the German sense of the term ‘*Faktur*’, which is associated with the construction of a musical composition.

determine the expressive qualities of the facture types also helps to check the definition of a facture type and to correct the historian's subjectivity since inconsistent evidence would probably point to an inappropriate typology. Certainly, with a database and automatized analysis tools such an approach could be carried out even more rigorously; however, until such a database exists and automatized analysis tools have been improved significantly, the labor-intensive manual approach is the only way to conduct such an investigation.⁹

An approach like the one described combines methodological designs from historical and systematic musicology and seizes on suggestions from several current trends in different fields. While music psychology started long ago to investigate the expressiveness of music, focusing on the relation between music and emotion in a broad sense,¹⁰ this topic did not receive the attention it deserved in historical musicology. However, during the last couple of years, history of emotion research has developed significantly, and in this context more attention was directed towards music and emotion from a historical point of view.¹¹ Of recent papers from the field of systematic musicology that employ quantitative methods to understand the relationship between music and emotions historically, two have a direct link to the present study: Glenn E. Schellenberg and Christian von Scheve investigated the change of character from happiness to sadness in American popular music in the second half of the 20th century.¹² Katelyn Horn and David Huron demonstrated a similar development in European "art" music between 1750 and 1900 using cluster analysis based on few musical features.¹³ However, their characterization of the expressive quality of the music is based on general assumptions about some fundamental musical features rather than on historical evidence. Still, it is a very innovative and inspiring study.

Other important influences for the present approach come from Constantin Floros' approach to musical meaning¹⁴ as well as from the musical topic theory—associated with authors like Leonard B. Meyer, Kofi Agawu, Robert S. Hatten and Raymond Monelle¹⁵—that investigates "musical styles and genres taken out of their proper context and used in another one"¹⁶ giving clues to their meaning and expressive qualities.

The present study attempts to develop a case in point for what might be called a

⁹ Together with a colleague in computer science, we are working on such a database; see Barzen et al., "The Vision for MUSE4Music."

¹⁰ See Juslin and Sloboda, *Music and Emotion*, for an overview.

¹¹ A major study that came from that trend is Melanie Wald-Fuhrmann's substantial work on melancholy around 1800 (Wald-Fuhrmann, *Ein Mittel wider sich selbst*); more recently, also see Ickstadt, *Aspekte der Melancholie*.

¹² Schellenberg and Scheve, "Emotional Cues in American Popular Music."

¹³ Horn and Huron, "On the Changing Use."

¹⁴ See, for example, Floros, *Hören und Verstehen*.

¹⁵ See for an overview Mirka, *The Oxford Handbook*.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, 2.

historical music psychology (Historische Musikpsychologie)¹⁷ that combines methods inspired by empirical psychology with classic historical hermeneutics. However, it refrains from projecting recent findings in cognitive musicology or music psychology onto listeners of the 19th century for two reasons: First, it is the very idea here to concentrate on historical documents and thus acknowledging the possibility of cultural relativity of the musical effects. Second, the kind of information taken from test persons, on the one hand, and from historical documents, on the other, are of a very different kind. It is not yet clear how that difference could be bridged. However, at a later stage, these disciplines might benefit from a comparison of the results.

I. Defining the musical features of the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic*

As mentioned earlier, the differentiation between the *Majestic Chorale type* and the *Glorifying Hymnic* became apparent at an advanced stage of research. This is due to the high amount of shared features and the existence of many mixed excerpts that blur the distinction. In the following overview of the features, those that are shared by all excerpts will be discussed first; in a second step, the features that are crucial for the distinction will be examined.

a) Features shared by all excerpts

For the present study, all symphonic pieces that were composed between 1790 and 1914 and that I could find as audio source either at Youtube.com or at Spotify.com have been investigated, adding up to roughly 2100 works of about 350 composers (born between 1770 and 1879). The corpus needed to be as large as possible to ensure a—at least for the time being—representative result as well as increasing the chance of finding independent evidence. The term ‘symphonic’ is being used here in a very broad sense embracing all music for large orchestra excluding vocal music, i.e. symphonies, concert overtures, symphonic poems, concertos, even ballets, and the like. This makes sense as the expression types occur across these genres. 62 compositions containing 66 excerpts have been investigated in detail (see appendix 1 for the 62 pieces); at least about 80 more excerpts were considered but in the end had to be dismissed either because they deviated in too many features, although still bearing a

¹⁷ This term reflects the combination of goals and methods of music psychology with goals and methods of historical musicology; no reference to “cultural-historical psychology” as a specific branch of psychological theory is intended (see van der Veer, Ferrari, and Anton Yasnitsky, *The Cambridge Handbook*).

clear resemblance to the cluster, or simply because the score was not available. Vocal music has not been considered with the exception of symphonic compositions that include—in the tradition of Beethoven’s Symphony No. 9—a choir in the last movement. Focusing on instrumental music makes the reconstruction of expressive qualities more difficult; nevertheless, in terms of method it has the advantage that the historical witnesses are not biased in their description of the impact of the music whereas a text that is set to music always tends to control the way the music is being perceived.

The goal of the analyses of the excerpts was to figure out all features that are shared by the excerpts in question and that are crucial for their related character. Many features are basic to 19th-century music in general like adhering to tonality or a measured rhythm and therefore cannot be distinctive for the specific types. At the same time, the list of significant features has to be sufficient to discriminate a type from other excerpts of music belonging to other types or no type at all. However, there is no objective measure for this sufficiency. Also, not all excerpts share exactly the same features and may differ in other features not considered significant here; the shape of the type is flexible or fuzzy—this is, of course, inherent in the idea of a type. The typology serves a heuristic purpose:¹⁸ it is not necessary to make any essentialist claim about the types; if the similarity of music excerpts allows us to get more information from the evidence, the typology serves its purpose.

There are a couple of features that are shared by all excerpts which I claim are related, notwithstanding the fact that some of them will later be classified as tokens of the *Majestic Chorale*, some as tokens of the *Glorifying Hymnic*. These features constitute the kinship of the excerpts considered (they are underlined in the feature table, appendix 2). The first is, as was presupposed, their **loudness**: most of them have the explicit instruction to play at least *fortissimo*, alternations with lower-volume sections notwithstanding (feature 1 in the table).

Three features are not listed in the table since they apply more or less to all excerpts and are at the same time not very precisely measurable. The first of these features is a characteristic of the harmony: The excerpts are principally **consonant**. Their harmony sometimes uses dissonances like minor sevenths or ninths or tritones that are well integrated in harmonic functions and are normally resolved in a conventional manner. Major sevenths or other dissonant elements occur much less frequently. The more advanced the harmony becomes during the 19th century, the more likely is it to occasionally find examples with more dissonances. However, in relation to the context they remain unobtrusive like in Pyotr Ilyich

¹⁸ For a methodological discussion of typologies, which is still valuable today, see Weber, “Die ‘Objektivität’”, 190–214.

Tchaikovsky's Symphony No. 3, Bruckner's Symphony No. 5 or Hugo Alfvén's Symphony No. 2 to name some salient examples.

The second feature shared by all selected excerpts is **homophony**. Taking the term not too strictly, this feature implies that the excerpts either consist of a melody which is entirely homophonically harmonized or that a leading melody is accompanied by other elements that support the melody rather than contrasting it or establishing a second melody in its own right. Sometimes allusions to polyphony that use clichés of traditional polyphony like changing or passing notes may occur, but they do not disturb the impression of a clearly homophonically conceived excerpt. (The only noteworthy exception is Alexander Scriabin's Symphony No. 1 where the melody is, although clearly discernible, rather polyphonically set in the choir.) At first it seemed that allusions to polyphony occur more in the *Majestic Chorale* than in the *Glorifying Hymnic*, as would be intuitive, but the evidence does not support this.

Also, all excerpts share the characteristic of **not being developmental**, not showing motivic processes or sequences. Rather, they focus on presenting an intact and usually wide spreading melody. They are as such non-dramatic (of course, in the context of the entire work such passages can play a dramatic role).

The other features are all listed in the table: The harmony of all excerpts is centered on a **major key** and mainly uses major chords, i.e. at least in two thirds of the measures, not counting episodes (cf. feature 12). The only exceptions in the entire sample is Alfvén's Symphony No. 2 in d minor, Josef Suk's *Praga* in G major, Miguel Marqués's Symphony No. 2 in E-flat major and Bedřich Smetana's *Vltava* in E major where more than a third of the chords in each excerpt are minor chords (feature 2 in appendix 2).

Moreover, all excerpts considered show a **moderate tempo** (feature 3). This feature depends partly on the context of each piece, and the means by which it is established may be diverse: the excerpt might be dominated by whole notes,¹⁹ or it might have an explicit tempo marking or a characterization that implies a moderate tempo, for instance *Maestoso*²⁰ or *Grandioso*,²¹ *Pesante*,²² *Molto largamente*, *maestoso e molto marcato*,²³ or just *Molto*

¹⁹ Mendelssohn's *Reformation Symphony*, Berlioz's overture to *Benvenuto Cellini*, Rubinstein's *Océan Symphony*, Bruckner's Symphony No. 5, Fibich's *Komenský*, Alfvén's Symphony No. 2, Mahler's Symphony No. 5.

²⁰ Mendelssohn's *Scottish Symphony*, Wagner's *Tannhäuser*, Liszt's *Battle of the Huns*, Rheinberger's *Wallenstein Symphony*, Grieg's Piano Concerto, Tchaikovsky's *Swan Lake* and Symphony No. 5, Brahms's *Academic Festival Overture*, Saint-Saëns, Symphony No. 3, Cliffe's Symphony No. 1, Glazunov's *The Kremlin*, Arensky's *Dream on the Volga*, L. Nielsen's Symphony No. 3.

²¹ Litolf's Concerto symphonique No. 3, Bristow's Symphony No. 2.

²² Litolf's Concerto symphonique No. 3, Mahler's Symphony No. 5.

²³ Suk's *Praga*.

largamente,²⁴ Più lento e maestoso,²⁵ Moderato,²⁶ Meno mosso,²⁷ or Meno Allegro,²⁸ Più sostenuto,²⁹ Andante,³⁰ or Larghetto.³¹ Mahler requests the orchestra to play “immer breiter” for the section in which the *Glorifying Hymnic* occurs in his Symphony No. 1. In other cases the moderate tempo is not marked explicitly but is mostly obvious from the context (usually through a drastic change of note values). Where the tempo is neither marked nor clear from the context, there is, of course, no alternative to subjective interpretation; some less clear examples are indicated in the feature table (appendix 2).³²

Finally, the excerpts share a **vocal character** (taking popular songs rather than opera arias as a template). Subjectively, many excerpts instantly sound familiar although no model is known. Since it is almost impossible to define ‘vocal character’ of instrumental music, it seems useful to split this feature into a couple of objective features that probably play a central role in the idea of a ‘vocal character’: (1) There is a clearly discernible main melody that is essentially built on unisons, seconds and thirds. Together they provide at least 75 % of the interval total. (2) The second is the most important interval. There is no maximum amount of seconds and there are at least 40 % seconds in every melody. Thirds and unisons come next. Although there is no minimum for either thirds or unisons, the combined percentage of thirds, unisons, and seconds always add up to at least 75 % of the total intervals. (3) The melodies contain up to ca. 35 % thirds and (4) ca. 30 % unisons. (5) Fourths and fifths are clearly less frequent. taken together, there are only up to ca. 20 % of these intervals. (6) Sixths and sevenths account for no more than 5 % of the interval total. These six criteria have been checked. Where only five criteria are met this has been marked by using brackets (feature 4³³).

Additionally, the melody contains no or very little syncopations (feature 5). This feature

²⁴ Sibelius, Symphony No. 2.

²⁵ Flotow, overture to *Alessandro Stradella*.

²⁶ Tchaikovsky’s Symphony No. 5 and *Swan Lake*, Glazunov’s *Triumphal March*, Mielck’s Symphony.

²⁷ Rubinstein’s *Océan Symphony*, Tchaikovsky’s Symphony No. 3, Karłowicz’ Symphony No. 1.

²⁸ Kuhlau’s overture to *Elverhøj*.

²⁹ Glazunov’s *A la mémoire de Gogol*.

³⁰ Weber’s *Jubilee Overture*, Vieuxtemps’ *Greeting to America*, Wagner’s *Tannhäuser*, Cliffe’s Symphony No. 1, Tchaikovsky’s *The Tempest*.

³¹ Flotow, overture to *Martha*.

³² Not every aspect of every excerpt can be discussed; the table shows how I categorised every parameter and where I saw ambiguities, thus directing the critical reader towards problematic elements.

³³ See appendix 3 for the interval content of each excerpt. A random sample of 30 folk songs from collections of the 19th and early 20th centuries has been used to check whether the interval content resembles the interval content of folk songs. The first ten songs from Rolland, *Chansons populaires*, and Erk, *Deutscher Liederhort*, as well as the four songs from Vaughan Williams, *English Folk Songs*, and the first six songs from Merrick, *Folk-Songs*, have been investigated. In fact, the interval content is very similar. Only some characteristics are even more clearly displayed in the folk songs: unisons, seconds, and thirds make up 85 % of the interval total; and there are only up to 15 % fourths and fifths. Moreover, there is a maximum of 35 % unisons. It goes without saying that for a deeper study of melody characteristics the inherent harmony, the relation between rhythm, interval distribution, and other factors would have to be investigated.

has not been measured; as a rule it occurs only occasionally; if that is the case it has been marked in the table (appendix 2). Chromaticism in the melody only rarely occurs, and if it is the case, it is mostly due to a momentary intermediary dominant or to a short deviation into another tonal region, especially in longer excerpts. The only remarkable exceptions are Dukas' *Goetz Overture*, Grieg's Piano Concerto and Sibelius' Symphony No. 2 (this feature has not been included in the table since it is even more difficult to measure chromaticism than syncopation). Also, as a rule the excerpts are formally clearly structured (also not depicted in appendix 2 since there are too many different formal models; however, cf. feature 6 discussed below). The vocal character is supported by the fact that some excerpts use quotations of actual songs (which will be discussed later).

Thus, all excerpts under consideration share the following features: loudness (feature 1), consonant harmony, homophonic texture, abstention from musical development, major key (feature 2), moderate tempo (feature 3), and vocal character (features 4-6). To be sure, there are a couple of threshold cases. However, if only one feature is missing or if an excerpt matches two features only ambiguously, they still have been included in the list but are indicated as threshold cases in the table.

b) Features differentiating between *Choral type* and the *Glorifying Hymnic*

The separation of the excerpts into two different (very much related) types is justified due to the fact that there is a bundle of three striking features (6-8) that in most cases either occur together or are absent altogether (given in italics in appendix 2) and that show a tendency to correspond with the distribution of the additional features 9-16.³⁴ The first feature is related to the formal structure of the melody and consists of two sub-features that are somewhat complicated: The melody either contains motivic **repetitions** or it does not, and its form is either constructed by **juxtaposing** clearly demarcated sections or it is not. The clearest distinction between the two melody forms is given if the melody has either no repetitions at all and juxtaposes its sections in the way described or it contains repetitions and does not simply juxtapose its sections (feature 6). I use the term juxtaposition if the sections are separated by

³⁴ To be sure, theoretically any bundle of three features could be used to divide the corpus into two groups. The division proposed here is supported by the fact that it corresponds with four additional features and also by the fact that the analysis of the reception sources will show that some components typical for the effect of the *Glorifying Hymnic* are not found or occur much less frequently in sources relating to tokens of the *Majestic Chorale*. The decision to assume two separate expression types followed the same hermeneutic logic as does establishing an expression type in general.

episodes (see feature 12), long general pauses, or significantly long held final notes or fermatas as the case may be. The form is not considered a juxtaposition form if the sections seamlessly follow each other or if there is just a short rest or if a rest is filled with what I will call a transition formula (see feature 11). Repetition may occur within or across melody sections and it may be literal or varying, also an entire section can be repeated, as is the case in the ABA form. This feature sounds complicated but the material shows that “no repetition but juxtaposition” on the one hand and “repetition but no juxtaposition” on the other occur much more often than mixed variants (Ex. 1 illustrates the first, Ex. 4 the second case), and the feature correlates with two more features (7–8) that separate the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic* from each other and that will be described next.

These features are simpler. One of them concerns a rhythmical property: while some pieces present the melody using mainly or even exclusively a **single note value** (often whole notes or half notes), other melodies deploy a variety of note values (feature 7). A melody is considered to mainly consist of a single note value if at least 75 % of the notes have this value. Cases where 90 % of the melody consists of two note values which occur in clearly isolated groups rather than passages that use a mix of the two note values as well as cases where 70 to 74 % of the notes share the same note value are also included (marked with a “yes” in brackets).³⁵ The class of melodies using just a single note value overlaps strikingly with the class featuring juxtaposition forms.

The other feature concerns the harmony: the excerpts differ in their **harmonic density** (feature 8). This density was defined and measured by the percentage of harmonic changes per melody tone (according to functional harmony, discarding changes that imply no change of the function):

- High: 80–100 % of the melody tones coincide with a harmonic change.
- Medium +: 66–79 % of the melody tones coincide with a harmonic change.
- Medium –: 51–65 % of the melody tones coincide with a harmonic change.
- Low: Up to 50% of the melody tones coincide with a harmonic change.

Some additional rules had to be applied in order to properly reflect the harmonic density: (1) Where the same harmonic change of two functions recurs several times (*Pendelharmonik*), like in the succession I-V-I-V..., only every second change has been counted; (2) variants of the

³⁵ The often longer held final notes, as well as a diverging opening note of the melody or a melody section with a strong caesura have not been counted; also, longer held notes as part of a cadence have been dismissed. The same applies for transition formulas that are clearly not part of the melody itself.

same harmonic function like V-V⁷ are not considered as harmonic changes; (3) harmonic changes over a functionally unambiguous pedal point are counted only by 50%.

There is a clear correlation between “no repetition but juxtaposition” forms, uniform rhythm and high harmonic density on the one hand and “repetition but no juxtaposition” forms, non-uniform rhythm, and low harmonic density on the other, which is the key to the separation of the *Glorifying Hymnic* and the *Majestic Chorale*. The features differentiating between the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic* are summarized in the following table:

<i>Majestic Chorale</i>	<i>The Glorifying Hymnic</i>
<p><i>Shared musical features of both types:</i></p> <p>consonant harmony homophonic texture abstention from musical development loudness (feature 1) major key (feature 2) moderate tempo (feature 3) vocal character (features 4-6)</p>	
<p><i>Majestic Chorale: specific features</i></p> <p>no motivic Repetition (feature 6) juxtaposition (feature 6) rhythmic uniformity (feature 7) higher harmonic density (feature 8)</p>	<p><i>The Glorifying Hymnic: specific features</i></p> <p>motivic repetition (feature 6) no juxtaposition (feature 6) no rhythmic uniformity (feature 7) lower harmonic density (feature 8)</p>

The following examples illustrate these features in the context of individual compositions:

Example 1: The *Majestic Chorale* (Mendelssohn, *Reformation Symphony*, piano reduction by Friedrich Hermann)

Example 2: The *Majestic Chorale* (Tchaikovsky, *The Tempest*, piano reduction by Max Lippold)

The musical score for Example 3 is a piano reduction of Beethoven's *Glorifying Hymnic* from *Eroica*. It is in E-flat major, 3/4 time. The score consists of three systems. The first system shows the right hand with a series of chords and the left hand with a simple bass line. The second system continues the piece with similar harmonic structure. The third system shows the right hand with a series of chords and the left hand with a simple bass line. Dynamics include *p*, *ff*, and *f*.

Example 3: The *Glorifying Hymnic* (Beethoven, *Eroica*, piano reduction by Otto Singer)

The image displays four staves of musical notation for the *Glorifying Hymnic* by Wagner, as a piano reduction by Johannes Doebber. The music is written in 3/4 time and the key of D major (two sharps). The bass line is characterized by a constant triplet accompaniment, often marked with a '3' and a bracket. The treble staff features a complex melodic line with numerous triplets and ornaments. Dynamics include *ff* (fortissimo) and accents (^). The notation is dense and intricate, typical of Wagner's style.

Examples 4: the *Glorifying Hymnic* (Wagner, *Tannhäuser*, piano reduction by Johannes Doebber)

As mentioned earlier, eight additional features (9–16) support this separation into two—still very related—facture types which tend to exhibit a distinct distribution of these additional features, i.e. they may occur in both types but occur significantly more often in one of the two types: in some excerpts the main melody is highlighted by **ornamentations** that put the melodies so to speak into the limelight (feature 9). They almost seem to highlight the melody thereby virtually celebrating it and emphasizing the importance of that moment for the entire composition. This feature did not escape notice of commentators. The editors of *Le Menstrel* wrote: “les instruments à cordes exécutent un contrepoint en triples croches qui donne à ce

thème une allure solennelle et grandiose” [23].³⁶ Herrmann Gehrman drew attention to the same feature of the same work comparing Carl Maria von Weber’s *Jubel-Overture* with a similar excerpt from his cantata *Kampf und Sieg*, namely the Battle Music No. 2, and explains that in both pieces the melody is being “jauchzend umspielt” [42]. With respect to the pilgrims’ chorus in Wagner’s *Tannhäuser*, including its instrumental version in the overture, an anonymous author highlights the “tremendous accompaniment of violin figures” [78]. Liszt also drew attention to this characteristic mentioning the “refrain en guise de contre point figuré, qui suspend et enguirlande sa mélodie” [72]. Finally, commenting on Johannes Brahms’s *Academic Festival Overture*, Heinrich Reimann makes a direct comparison with Weber’s *Jubel-Overture* explaining that towards the end “als allgemeiner Jubel- und Festgesang (in der Weise des ‘God Save the King’ in Webers Jubelouvertüre) das ‘Gaudeamus’ einsetzt, von auf- und abwirbelnden Passagen der Violinen, dann der tiefen Saiteninstrumente begleitet” [151].³⁷ All these ornamentations give the melody, which itself has a rather moderate tempo, some motion. While all examples of the *Glorifying Hymnic* have this feature, only about half of the *Majestic Chorale* do.³⁸

The **melody shapes** of the excerpts can approximately be divided into three categories: the melodies (or its sections, if there are clear caesuras) either (a) trace the form of an arch going up and down again (or the other way round), (b) display a wave motion, or (c) they are one-directional, moving entirely upwards or downwards (feature 10). An interesting aspect arises from the distribution of these shapes: with a few negligible exceptions all excerpts of the *Glorifying Hymnic* possess a melody with a wave motion while the *Majestic Chorale* exhibits all melody shapes. Thus, a wave motion of the melody is not exclusive for the *Glorifying Hymnic* but typical. I assume that the impression of the melodies of the *Glorifying Hymnic* as being folk-song-like correlates with this feature.

Moreover, there are many excerpts that use what I call **transition formulas** that lead into a repetition of a melody section (like a passage preparing a refrain) (feature 11). These passages could not stand on its own; they are very short and do not display their own motivic material. Rather, they often use stereotyped phrases like chromatic or scalar motions or triad

³⁶ All sources that have been used for determination of the expressive qualities have been numbered and are quoted by reference to this number. The sources can be found in appendix 4. Sources that do not specifically or unambiguously refer to the excerpt are set in round brackets. Additional sources are quoted as usual.

³⁷ It is possible to distinguish between different sorts of such ornamentations, but it is not necessary to describe them here; see n. 1 of the feature table in appendix 2.

³⁸ It has to be mentioned, though, that at an earlier stage of the research there were a few excerpts, then considered examples of the *Hymnic*, with no melody ornamentation. However, since by far most of the excerpts show ornamentation, it seemed appropriate to make ornamentation a crucial feature of the *Hymnic*. Thus, the other few examples were omitted.

arpeggios that flow in a goal-oriented manner directly into the beginning of the melody repetition—a procedure that especially makes sense in forms that use repetition where the listener expects the recurrence of known material. By far not all examples of the *Glorifying Hymnic* (9 of 50) have this feature, but all excerpts that do are in this category. There is just one seeming exception, Marqués' Symphony No. 2, but here the transition formula is a result of the fact that this passage is constructed from a hymnic section followed by a chorale section. A typical example of a transition formula can be found in Brahms's *Haydn Variations*:

Example 5: Brahms, *Haydn Variations*

On the other hand, some excerpts have **episodes** separating some or all melody sections from each other. As opposed to the transition formulas, these episodes have their own characteristic material, develop their own thematic shape, and could in that sense stand on their own (feature 12). They are also rather long. They do not lead into the next melody section of the chorale in a goal-oriented way but simply alternate with them. Usually they do not occur in the *Glorifying Hymnic* but quite often in the *Majestic Chorale*. See, for a typical example Liszt's *Battle of the Huns*:

Example 6: Liszt, *Battle of the Huns*

The following features support the differentiating of the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic* less clearly. One of these features concerns the **complexity of harmony**. For the harmonic analysis of the symphonic excerpts, the harmony has been ranked using seven degrees: simple, simple +, medium –, medium, medium +, complex – and complex (feature 13 – the criteria are listed in the table on the next page).

Perhaps the examples of the *Majestic Chorale* tend to have a more complex harmony—although this tendency is far from conclusive. If we accept this assertion, we might speculate that it interrelates with the simple rhythmic structure and the high harmonic density of these excerpts. Some of these melodies only make sense with their harmony (especially striking in Brahms Symphony No. 1). Put differently, in the *Majestic Chorale* the melody is sometimes only the result of an idea that is essentially harmonic. Thus, melody is like rhythm subordinated to harmony.

Moreover, in most excerpts **brass** is predominant (feature 14). While the *Majestic Chorale* is rather consistent in this respect, the *Glorifying Hymnic* has some examples where **strings** are predominant (feature 15)—prominently, for instance, in Tchaikovsky's Symphony No. 5; and there are some more examples in the *Glorifying Hymnic* where brass and strings play an equal role. Finally, **cymbals** and / or **snare drums** are rarely used in the *Majestic Chorale* but occur quite often in the *Glorifying Hymnic* (feature 16).

Criterion	Evaluation			Notes
	1 Point	2 Points	3 Points	
Number of different functions ³⁹	1 to 5	6 to 9	≥ 10	
Distance of the music from a tonal center	Main tonal functions and 1 st degree mediant relationships (major: iii, vi / minor: III, VI), secondary dominants and secondary chords of the subdominant	Variants of the main tonal functions, and 2 nd or 3 rd degree mediant relationships (major: III, VI, bIII, bVI / minor: iii, vi, #iii, #vi), secondary dominants of subsidiary functions and other secondary functions as dominants of the tonic	4 th degree median relationships (major: biii, bvi / minor: #III, #VI), other secondary functions as dominants to degrees other than the tonic, (or sonorities that are functionally ambiguous).	
The goal-orientated nature of the passage	The tonal goal of the sequence is always clear.	The tonal goal of the sequence is always clear: however, temporary modulations, ambiguities, or ellipses may occur.	The tonal goal of the sequence is partially ambiguous; sonorities are placed in a loose sequence without any clearly recognizable functional relationship.	
Additional points for shorter passages		16–30 mm.	≤ 15 mm.	These addition points will only be awarded if the sum of the points for the first 3 categories ≥ 7.
Points deducted for longer passages	15 mm.–20mm.	≥ 30 mm.		These points will only be deducted if the sum of the points for the first 3 categories ≥ 5.

Degree of complexity

low	low +	medium –	medium	medium +	high –	high
1–3 points	4 points	5 points	6 points	7 points	8 points	9–12 points

³⁹ Major and minor variants of tonal functions are counted separately (thus, tonic and minor tonic are considered to be two distinct functions).

Thus, the separation of the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic* is supported by the tendency towards the distribution of the following features:

<i>Majestic Chorale</i>	<i>The Glorifying Hymnic</i>
Melody shapes a,b,c (feature 10) Episodes (feature 12) Higher harmonic complexity (feature 13) Dominated by brass (feature 14) No cymbals or drums (feature 16)	Melody ornamentations (feature 9) Melody shape b (feature 10) Transition formulas (feature 11) Lower harmonic complexity (feature 13) Often cymbals or snare drums (feature 16)

Certainly, the criteria differentiating the *Glorifying Hymnic* and the *Majestic Chorale* are fuzzy. However, since I argue that the two groups are closely related, this fuzziness should not be surprising. Usually, if an excerpt deviates in only one of the three main discriminating categories (features 6-8), the two other features are considered decisive. Still, there are ambiguous cases. For example, Camille Saint-Saëns's Symphony No. 3 (*Organ*) has to be placed right in the middle in all three categories. A very unique case of a mixed type can be found at the end of the first movement in Ludolf Nielsen's Symphony No. 3 which may be interpreted as a polyphonic combination of *Majestic Chorale* (brass) and the *Glorifying Hymnic* (woodwinds, strings). This combination of both types even renders some of the features ambivalent; for example, while harmonic density for the *Glorifying Hymnic* is low, it is medium + for the *Majestic Chorale* during the very same bars since the note values of the chorale are much longer. Schematic definitions, therefore, do not avoid all ambiguity—there is still some fuzziness. In light of this, the feature table (appendix 2) shows my assessment of the excerpts so that they can be tracked and re-examined.

Thus, using three main features (6-8) as well as some additional or supporting features (9-16) we are able to divide the excerpts into two types I have termed *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic*.

II. The Contemporary Experience of the Expression Types

So far, many technical features have been extracted, but in themselves they do not lead to any idea of what the feature clusters mean. They describe feature types, not expression types. The core idea of the following procedure is to use the feature types to extend the scope of the

evidence. I assume that within a consistent cultural context (and under the methodological considerations discussed above and to follow), it is legitimate to argue that evidence which refers to an individual excerpt may also be related to other excerpts that belong to the same facture type. In line with the widely accepted concept ‘long nineteenth century’, I presuppose a sufficient basic cultural consistency in that time taking World War I as an end point. This consistency is also reflected by the musical grammar that was—despite its changes and developments—homogeneous until the emergence of atonality and Anton Webern’s denial of large orchestras and large-scale forms in his compositions and, slightly later, the dissemination of Jazz. Though 19th-century musical language is still alive in many ways, it is advisable not to presuppose identical reactions to 19th-century music in contemporary and modern listeners after atonality and Jazz have become part of the audiences’ experiences. It is, therefore, much safer to consider exclusively sources that originated before ca. 1914 as contemporary evidence.

It goes without saying that there must have been differences in the impact music had depending on the individual nature of specific works and listeners, the formal structure of the composition (or the location of the excerpt within, e.g., a sonata form), more specific historical and geographical contexts, the specific performance, the individual situation, etc.⁴⁰ While this is certainly true, the focus here is directed towards the stable aspects that were shared by many individuals and in many situations. Alternative approaches are by no means being excluded on principle, but the present study concentrates on the shared effects because they allow us to make more general assertions about the effect of 19th-century music on contemporary audiences and build an important background for more individual interpretations. Of course, there are many gradations between the general and the specific. However, a requirement for the method proposed here will always be some kind of general validity of the evidence as specified in the following discussion of the evidence.

Evidence comes from contemporary monographs and reviews of editions or performances, from the work itself (for instance, if there is a quotation or some note in the score), from an associated plot, if it is program music, from the performance context, or from egodocuments. The *Retrospective Index to Music Periodicals* (RIPM) with *Online Archive* and *eLibrary* (now called *Preservation Series*) was used to find reviews.

The sources referring to musical excerpts classified as the *Majestic Chorale* or the *Glorifying Hymnic* has been searched for corresponding testimonies about the effect of the music:

⁴⁰ For a more general discussion on the interrelation of emotions and context, see Scheer, “Are emotions a kind of practice?”

- for different witnesses describing the same piece of music in a similar way,
- for single witnesses describing different pieces of music in a similar way,
- for different witnesses describing different pieces of music in a similar way.

Since one cannot always expect to find identical terms and descriptors in the characterizations of the music or its effect, the expressions will be assigned to semantic fields. While studies from semantic field theory can be helpful,⁴¹ the construction of such fields is still difficult since there are no semantic field descriptions from the 19th century and the sources were written in different languages. The terms will not be translated to ensure that the categorization into fields is explicit. Dictionaries from the 19th century such as Joseph Emerson Worcester's *Dictionary of the English Language* or the *Deutsches Wörterbuch* of the Grimm brothers have in cases of doubt been used to determine the relation of terms.

Some methodical decisions and issues have to be addressed before the analysis will be explained: the significance of the evidence depends on the number of compositions it is referring to, as well as the number of independent sources in which the evidence has been found. In what follows, a semantic field will be considered significant if the terms in the field relate to at least three different excerpts; ideally, they are drawn from at least three independent sources. The evidence also needs to be checked for salient geographical issues—the evidence might be significant but restricted to a specific time or place—and for salient sub-clusters of the features described—maybe the effect described does not refer to the type as defined but to a more specific one, for example it may only refer to all hymnic passages but only if they do not use cymbals or snare drums. Finally, no differentiation will be made between evidence from the perspective of the composers and evidence from the perspective of the recipients since the sources do not suggest this; rather, evidence from the composers' side and evidence from the recipients' side support each other.

a) The expressive qualities of the *Majestic Chorale*

The following paragraphs will be devoted to the evidence concerning the expressive quality of the *Majestic Chorale*. This name already points towards a semantic sphere that is certainly of great importance for this type. However, although the term *chorale* (just as the term *hymnic*) reflects some historical descriptors and characterizations to be discussed now, it is important to understand that this denomination is not meant to necessarily reflect historical terminology.

⁴¹ Especially relevant for the present study is Johnson-Laird and Keith Oatly, "The language of emotions."

Nevertheless, the idea of the chorale is clearly suggested in contemporary evidence: many composers either quoted chorales or called the excerpts themselves chorale and the like. Felix Mendelssohn quotes Luther's chorale "Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott" in his *Reformation Symphony*; also the composition was planned for the tercentenary celebrations of the Augsburg confession announced by Friedrich Wilhelm III, King of Prussia.⁴² Liszt used "Crux fidelis" in the *Battle of the Huns* [112].⁴³ Zdeněk Fibich included a chorale from Komenský's time in his *Festival Overture* that was composed for the tercentenary celebrations of Komenský,⁴⁴ and Suk incorporated the Hussite song "Ye who are God's warriors" in his symphonic poem *Praga*.⁴⁵ Bruckner used the term "Choral" in his score, Alfvén "Canto fermo". Contemporary audiences understood such references not only where they were quotations but also where the excerpts displayed related musical features. In the cases of Bruckner and Alfvén [142,164], it cannot be excluded that the commentators knew the indications in the score. However, I found ten sources originating from Amsterdam, Leipzig, Paris, New York, Boston, Wien, and Berlin referring to the excerpt from Rubinstein's *Océan Symphony* as a chorale [89,90,91,94,95,98-102]. So strong was the association of Rubinstein's excerpt with a chorale that one author took it for Luther's "Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott" [94]. Also, one source commenting upon Liszt's *Battle of the Huns* describes the association with singing without mentioning that the chorale was a quotation [110].

Interestingly, in referring to Rubinstein's *Océan Symphony*, three documents mention musical characteristics that we have earlier recognized as distinguishing between the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic*: One author emphasizes the "ingenious progressions" and the "surprising richness" of the chorale, probably implying its harmonic density [94]. Two further sources seem to hint at both the harmonic density and the rhythmic uniformity referring to a "Chorale in full chords" [95] and "grands accords en form de choral" [99]. The rhythmic feature was also mentioned by sources related to Mendelssohn's symphony [54,48]. Moreover, one author articulates his association of the chorale with singing by referring to the excerpt from Rubinstein's symphony as "von den Blech-Instrumenten gleichsam gesungene[r] Choral" [89].

The fact that the *Majestic Chorale* has been recognized as a chorale by its contemporaries leads to a closely linked semantic field, namely **religiosity**. It might be surprising that the religious element has not been made explicit more often: I found evidence

⁴² Silber, "Mendelssohn", 110–1.

⁴³ Cf. also Angerer, "Liszt's 'Hunnenschlacht'", 119 and 121.

⁴⁴ See Robinson, "Zdenek Fibich," unpaginated; Staller, "Die Comeniusfeier". For national connotations of the work, see also Richter, *Zdenko Fibich*, 12.

⁴⁵ Katz, "A Turk and A Moravian", 148.

relating to only three different excerpts (from Mendelssohn, Rubinstein, and Liszt) but we might assume that to many authors it did not seem necessary to mention the religious element explicitly after having evoked the idea of a chorale. Be that as it may, in some cases the chorale is simply characterized as religious [95] or it is in a more detailed manner characterized as “a symbol of the certain ultimate triumph and universal supremacy of the Church of Christ, in its simplest, purest, and holiest form” [47], resembling the plot Franz Liszt has been set to music in the *Battle of the Huns* [106,108,109], or it is characterized as “a hymn in recognition of the Almighty who holds the sea in the hollow of his hands” [94]. In other cases, the religious aspect is treated more elaborately. In a review from 1865, not only does the author hear the chorale as a prayer, he even hears the music transcending the effable, thereby possibly demonstrating his affection: “A ce moment, un large cantique de joie, d’adoration, plane sur la mer rassénérée, cantique qui monte de plus en plus dans les inaccessibles régions de la prière” [91]. The idea of prayer (“Gebet”) also occurs ten years later in a German review [96]. The most elaborated description of an instrumental chorale comes from August Wilhelm Ambros referring to Rubinstein’s *Océan Symphony* [98]. Ambros imagines a holy mass and associates it with a quotation from the bible:

... the roar of the waves is the organ tone, the altar tapers shine in the eternal stars, masses of mist ascend as incense, and in procession [*recte* ‘as curtain’] before the altar move the clouds! There all turns of itself to a solemn choral, such as Rubinstein employs with thrilling [*ergreifend*] power for the last movement of his Symphony. As it resounds in mighty trombone chords, while the stringed instruments storm against it and again sink into the deep, one is reminded of the sublime sentence in the Old Testament: ‘Then the Lord said to the sea: Thus far shalt thou go and no farther, here are thy bounds, etc.’

Even where empathy was lacking, the religious sphere expressed by the music could be understood. An author from catholic Italy saw Mendelssohn’s celebration of the Lutheran chorale with scepticism but clearly understood its religious connotations: “il fanatismo religioso prende quindi il sopravvento sul sentimento artistico ed ai soave temi melodici mendelssohniani vengono sostituiti i caratteristici canti sacri della Riforma, quegli austeri, biblici *Corali* uniformi per ritmo et intonazione” [54].

Sometimes the sources refer generally to an entire work or movement. In these cases, the evidence can usually not be used. However, if there are sufficiently more concrete pieces of evidence that are congruent with the general one it might be legitimate to count the latter as supporting evidence. A New York reviewer felt “a fine spiritual uplift in the last movement” of Rubinstein’s *Océan Symphony* [104], which might have been evoked by the chorale especially.

And Richard Barth associated “göttliche Freude” with the finale section of Brahms’s Symphony No. 1 [139]. One cannot be sure but perhaps it is not too farfetched to assume that it was the chorale that suggested the idea of the divine.

Finally, it is worth mentioning Bruckner’s religious intentions that have been pointed out by recent authors.⁴⁶

The two next semantic fields are related to the idea of the Sublime. One of them unfolds around the concept of **grandness** highlighting a quantitative moment, the other one around **power and might**. The evidence for each of these fields is related to four works. However, since these two fields are so closely connected and even overlapping in the category of the majestic, which implies grandness and power at the same time, it makes sense to consider both fields as sub-fields of a larger category making up a very strongly supported expressive element. Most frequent is the word “grand” and its relatives across three languages. For example, a London review of the *Reformation* Symphony wrote: “The climax is put off with grand effect, and at length when it is reached, the leading phrase of ‘Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott’ being given out in lengthened notes by the entire orchestra, *fortissimo*, we feel that a noble effort has been nobly and thoroughly achieved” [48]. In a Paris review of the *Océan Symphony*, we read: “Le final, très-mouvementé se termine majestueusement par un motif de choral d’une grande puissance d’effet” [100]. Other sources share the impression of grandness [47,54,99,107,112]. The terms “force” [47], “magnificent” [94], “majesté reposante” [112], and “power” as well as the phrase “mighty trombones” [98] or “mächtige Fanfaren” [106] round out this field. An author reviewing Tchaikovsky’s *The Tempest* hears behind the chorale “the mighty and forbidding figure of the magician Prospero” [122]. A French commentator of Bruckner’s Symphony No. 5 wrote: “C’est absolument grandiose quand la masse métallique [one is almost tempted to translate ‘heavy metal’] attaque le choral tandis que les gros instruments de l’orchestre chevauchent et que tous les thèmes s’éparpillent aux voix supérieures” [142].⁴⁷

Again, some remote evidence supports this semantic field. One testimony describes the fugue of the *Reformation Symphony*’s finale as grand but also implies the chorale as its climax: “Grandly, and with ever-increasing interest, it is worked up, till at length the entire orchestra joins in delivering the opening bars of the Lutheran tune” [(50)]. Another one highlights the “majesté sereine et la profondeur infinie” of the last movement of Rubinstein’s symphony

⁴⁶ Müller, *Anton Bruckners Fünfte Symphonie*, especially 162, Raabe, “Die Erscheinung des Heiligen.”

⁴⁷ It might be an issue for debate whether the author refers exactly to our excerpt since it is difficult to relate every detail of his description to the passage. On the other hand, I couldn’t find other excerpts that fit better; one candidate would be the one beginning in m. 374 foreshadowing the later *Majestic Chorale*. Anyway, I think it is safe to count this as fully valid evidence making this semantic field with references to three different works by eight different sources also a strongly attested quality of that expression type.

[(92)]. Even more general is the characterization of an entire work as displaying “grandeur” and “majesté” or being “majestic” respectively as in reviews referring to Rubinstein’s and Brahms’s symphonies respectively [(93,135,140)]. The word “erhaben” (sublime) occurs only once with respect to the finale of Brahms’s Symphony No.1 [(137)].

The *Majestic Chorale* also expressed **triumph and victory**. There is widespread evidence from London, Boston, Leipzig, Prague (Anežka Schulzová), and elsewhere between 1867 and 1900 referring to four different excerpts, thus presenting strong support for this element of the expressive quality of the *Majestic Chorale*. In some cases the music was interpreted as program music where the chorale reflects the triumphant victory of “reformed faith,” [50,52,53] the “reformatiorische[] Ideen Komenský’s,” [163] and the “Church of Christ” or the “Christian idea” and the like [47,105,106,108,109,110,111,112]. In these cases, the musical quotations or program provoked such readings. However, triumph was also sensed where no concrete events were suggested by musical quotations or other elements as was the case with Brahms’s Symphony No. 1. Discussing its final section, a London reviewer wrote: “The *coda*, where the time is increased to ‘*più allegro*,’ is glorious, and brings to a triumphant end a great, though unequal, work” [134]. Furthermore, there are a few sources referring to triumph and victory when discussing the finale of Brahms’s Symphony without specifically relating to the chorale [137,138,139]. Yet, because of the evidence quoted above that associates the chorale with triumph and victory, it is likely that the chorale at least was an important element leading to that impression.

Moreover, the excerpts belonging to the *Majestic Chorale* seem to express **joy and happiness**. The excerpt from Rubinstein’s *Océan Symphony* was described as “cantique de joie,” [91, cf. 101] a London review of Mendelssohn’s *Reformation Symphony* adds to the triumph the descriptor “jubilant,” [52] and an Italian listener of Liszt’s *Battle of the Huns* emphasizes “il frenetico giubilo dei vincitori” [105]. This evidence points to a semantic field of happiness and joy associated with the *Majestic Chorale*. This association is supported by Richard Barths reading of Brahms’s Symphony No. 1 where “Entzücken” and “göttliche Freude” are part of the feelings aroused by the finale of this work [139]. Also, the idea of a “hymne de reconnaissance de passagers échappés aux tempêtes” with respect to Rubinstein’s *Océan Symphony* seems to imply the happiness of the saved [101].

A final semantic field is close to the threshold of three sources referring to three different works: some documents call the excerpt from Mendelssohn’s *Reformation Symphony* “**noble**” [47,48,53]. The idea of the majestic, discussed above, seems to belong to this semantic field just as it belongs to the aforementioned one. Hence the fields of the sublime and the noble are

directly linked through the majestic thereby supporting each other. This is underlined by the fact that elements of the sublime and of the noble occur side by side [47,48]. Of course, this is the point where a decision of what terms belong to the same semantic field, is of some importance since this decision may be crucial for reaching the threshold of three testimonies. Once again, remote evidence completes the semantic field. Characterizations of entire symphonies by Mendelssohn, Rubinstein and Brahms include the terms “noble,” [(49,103,136,141)] “dignity,” [(51)] and “edle Haltung” [(97)].

Thus, in descriptions of the *Majestic Chorale* the following word fields recur consistently: chorale, religiosity, grandness, power and might, triumph and victory, joy and happiness, as well as the noble. Figure 1 details the semantic fields characterizing the *Majestic Chorale*. The descriptions of the music have been categorized in “aesthetic and moral characterizations”, “musical associations”, “other semantic associations” and “emotions, affects, feelings”. These categories make clear that the idea of musical expression embraces many different cognitive and affective ingredients or processes. The categories used do not imply any theory about musical expression, they simply serve comprehensibility. Especially the fact that the semantic field of triumph and victory has been assigned to “emotions, affects, feelings” rather than to “other semantic associations” may strike the reader on first sight. However, while the terms referring to religion refer to a cultural practice which is pretty clearly defined (especially reflected in Ambros’ allusion to the holy mass and the bible) being oriented towards the divine, triumph and victory are neither unambiguous cultural practices nor are they always reacting to any clear event, except those testimonies referring to the victory of Reformation or Christianity respectively. But the fact alone that triumph and victory could also be used without reference to such a concrete event seems to imply that the terms have rather been used in order to describe the feeling communicated by the music. Of course, the boundary is again fuzzy since religion also cannot be divorced from specific emotions that are perhaps implied by the semantic field quoted above. A similar observation can be made about the semantic field of the “sublime.”

Also, we cannot, for the most part, judge whether the music was inducing the emotions or feelings or whether the recipients were at a minimum moved by the music. Sometimes they explicitly stated or implied this, for example when a Boston reviewer wrote about Mendelssohn’s chorale: “Then came the tremendous, overwhelmingly glorious chords of Luther’s choral,” [53] or when Ambros talks about the “thrilling power” of Rubinstein’s chorale [98]. On the other hand, at least one testimony makes clear that the author understood the expressive quality but did not feel it: “Dem Schlusssatze hat der Componist einen Choral

einverleibt, der uns jedoch in die ganze Anlage dieses Satzes nicht so ganz hinein zu passen schien, jedenfalls nicht den Eindruck hervorbrachte, den er hervorbringen sollte” [102]. Understanding the expression of music does not always involve comprehending it through empathy or even feeling the expressed emotions.

The expressive qualities of the *Majestic Chorale* are, of course, deeply interwoven and illuminate each other. It is obvious that recognizing a musical excerpt as a chorale evokes religious associations. Thus, the feeling of happiness and joy is linked to the religious: it is a religious joy. At the same time, it is a joy caused through triumph and victory which itself is related to religion either explicitly or implicitly. Many more such hypothetical connections

Fig. 1: *Chorale type*: expressive qualities

between the descriptors of the music can be assumed. However, such interpretations easily become speculative. But what we can definitively say about the *Majestic Chorale* is that it alluded to sacred music, expressed religious feelings, happiness and joy, triumph and victory, and that it was perceived as grand, powerful, majestic, and perhaps as noble. This delineation does not, of course, exclude individual cases in which the *Majestic Chorale* was part of more complex expressive and semantic agendas. In Brahms's Symphony No. 1, for example, it might be part of a nationalist program as argued by Matthew Gelbart,⁴⁸ and in Mahler's Symphony No. 5, there seems to be a hidden irony since the finale opens with a quotation from the song *Lob des hohen Verstandes*⁴⁹ where the cuckoo is praised by the donkey for singing a chorale (devaluing the much more complex nightingale's song).

These results still have to be taken with caution since the evidence is focused on a few works. For many works no relevant sources could be found, for instance for Tchaikovsky's third symphony, Fibich's *Komenský*, or Mielck's Symphony. Also, any further interpretation is impeded by the rarity of the *Majestic Chorale*: figure 2 shows a timeline of the *Majestic Chorale* illustrating the fact that beginning with Mendelssohn there was a rather continuous use of the *Majestic Chorale* but only at wide intervals. Even the trace of a cluster in the mid-1870s obviously does not allow any conclusions. (However, we will come back to this from the point of view of the *Glorifying Hymnic*.) Thus, for the moment any relation to the historical context beyond the importance of religion, Christian faith and documented concrete occasions, such as Reformation anniversaries, have to be avoided. Nevertheless, beyond the delineation of the expressive qualities of the *Majestic Chorale* itself, its definition helps to much better demarcate the *Glorifying Hymnic*, which allows a far more differentiated analysis of its expressive qualities.

⁴⁸ Gelbart, "Nation, Folk, and Music History." Lütteken's highly speculative interpretation of Bruckner's and Brahms's chorales overlooks Rubinstein's chorale from his *Océan Symphony* which was along with Mendelssohn's the most widely distributed symphonic chorale of the 19th century, certainly known to Brahms and Bruckner. It also neglects the chorales from Liszt's *Battle of the Huns* and Tchaikovsky's *The Tempest* and especially his Symphony No. 3 (Lütteken, "Die Apotheose des Chorals"). These works will make his (German-centred) historico-philosophical reading rather difficult. Moreover, the apparently clear distinction between program music and absolute music cannot be maintained.

⁴⁹ Floros, *Gustav Mahler*, p. 152.

Fig. 2: *Chorale* type: timeline

b) The expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic*

The fact that the description of the *Glorifying Hymnic* is much richer does not necessarily imply that its reception was more multi-layered. Rather, the likelihood to find corresponding testimonies is simply higher if the quantity of the material is larger, and there are many more excerpts belonging to the *Glorifying Hymnic*. Thus, the more widely distributed an expression type was, the more likely it is that the material will allow us to reconstruct the expressive qualities of the music more completely. At the same time, of course, we may assume that those types that were more widely distributed were the more important ones.

As has already been emphasized in the introduction to the *Majestic Chorale*, the names chosen for the expression types do not necessarily reflect historical terminology. There are witnesses who call the *Majestic Chorale* “**hymn**,” [47,94,101,(137)] and there are witnesses who call the *Glorifying Hymnic* “**chorale**” [(16),71b,113,127,129b,156]. In the 19th century there existed two main concepts of ‘hymn,’ one being related to sacred poems and music of religious praise and having a tradition reaching back to Ambrose, and another one being related to songs of community and loyalty, especially national anthems—a phenomenon that became very important during the 19th century.⁵⁰ While in the English language the term ‘anthem’ dominated for the second meaning, in other languages like French, German and Italian ‘hymne,’ ‘Hymne’ and ‘inno’ prevailed. Contemporary dictionaries reflect the double meaning of the term. In Charles Soullier’s *Dictionnaire de Musique Illustré*, for example, we read:

HYMNE, *s. m.* comme chant patriotique ou national, et *s. f.* comme chant de l’église.—La Marseillaise fut un hymne français chanté en l’honneur de la liberté par le patriotes de 1792, et le Te Deum est une hymne chrétienne chantée à la louange du Seigneur en action de grâces. Le premier fut composé par Rouget de l’Isle; la seconde eut pour auteur saint Ambroise, archevêque de Milan.⁵¹

The distinction between the masculine noun form for national anthems or hymns and the feminine noun form for religious chants or songs is neither always recognizable in French texts nor do authors of the 19th century seem to accept this distinction strictly. For example, in Édouard Schuré’s characterization of the pilgrims’ choir in *Tannhäuser*, “hymne” is masculine but described as “religieux”:

Mais voici l’aube; l’hymne religieux revient avec elle. A mesure qu’il se rapproche, que le jour chasse la nuit, ce

⁵⁰ Glaner, “Nationalhymnen.”

⁵¹ Soullier, *Nouveau Dictionnaire*, 151–2.

murmure des airs, qui semblait, le gémissement, d'âmes, damnées, se change en un doux ondolement, et lorsque enfin le soleil se lève, lorsque le cantique éclate dans son auguste magnificence, cet ondolement devient le ruissellement d'une joie sublime. Le triomphe de l'Esprit est le salut pour tous. La montagne maudite est délivrée, son peuple purifié se joint à l'hymne rédempteur [84a].

Interestingly, most French sources found that describe excerpts of the *Glorifying Hymnic* use the masculine substantive, or the gender cannot be determined [84b,115a,116,130a,156]; the only exception is the hymn in Flotow's overture to *Antonio Stradella* [69]. The French version of Riemann's music dictionary does not make the grammatical distinction at all but after sketching the history of the religious meaning of the term emphasizes its more recent use, explaining:

On donne fréquemment de nos jours le titre d'h. à des œuvres vocales de grande envergure, pour une masse chorale avec accompagnement d'instr. de cuivre, par exemple, toujours destinée à produire un grand effet et dont le contenu est tantôt profane, tantôt religieux.⁵²

Thus, while the tradition of church hymns includes music of very different character—often rather quiet, devotional songs—the national anthem tends to have a popular character and an affinity to large choirs and voluminous accompaniment. This tradition singled out one kind of sacred hymn and used it for political goals. This last tradition is the background for the choice of the name 'the (*Glorifying*) *Hymnic*' for this expression type. The alternative term 'the anthemic' was abandoned because this term is even less common and the term 'the hymnic' reflects more the common tradition of several European languages, but it is an arbitrary choice and is not trying to suggest a historical term. The descriptor 'glorifying' was added in order to differentiate it from low-volume variants of the *Majestic Chorale*. The following interpretation does not attempt to investigate the idea of the hymn but rather seeks to understand the way a certain facture type was being received by its contemporary audience in terms of its expressive quality.

Contemporary witnesses associated the excerpts of the *Glorifying Hymnic* with **singing**, even if we exclude the works that quote songs or refer to actual singing, such as the overture to *Tannhäuser*. The sources use the terms "hymn," [(6),58,62,69,130a,155,156] "chorale" [(16),113,127,129b,130b,156,158,168,170], "song" [162], "Gesang" [(7),14,65,68], "cantique," and "chant" [129b]; they are referring to Beethoven's *Eroica*, Mendelssohn's *Scottish Symphony*, Rheinberger's *Wallenstein*, Saint-Saëns's Piano Concerto No. 4 and his

⁵² Riemann / Humbert 1913, 484.

Violin Concerto No. 3. (In the case of Beethoven's *Eroica*, the term in question is not unambiguously referring to the excerpt.) The same terms have been used for describing excerpts using quotations of actual songs. The melody of "God save the King" or "Heil dir im Siegerkranz" in Weber's *Jubel-Overture* is simply referred to as the "Sachsenhymne" [39]; the excerpt of Brahms's *Academic Festival Overture*, i.e. the climax with "Gaudeamus igitur" is called a "Festgesang" [151] or is described as an "Instrumentenchor" [149]. The hymnic excerpt in Wagner's overture to *Tannhäuser* is not a quotation but refers to a text that is known from the opera as a whole. Therefore, the terms "hymn" [74a], "hymne" [84a/b], "cantique" [84a,87], and "song" [78] are not really surprising. But it is revealing that it is exactly the same word field that occurs in the sources dealing with instrumental music.

German sources also contain two related associations further qualifying the singing as a folksong or as mass choir. Adolf Bernhard Marx calls the subject of the final movement of the *Eroica*, though with question mark, a "Volkslied," [5] and when discussing the excerpt of Beethoven's Symphony No. 9 where the *Ode to Joy* resembles the *Glorifying Hymnic* he says that "zum Sturmflug aller Saiten und den rhythmischen Rufen der Bläser der Volkschor wieder den ersten Vers in der einfachen Weise anstimmt und im bacchischen Jubelton durchführt" [46]. Mass effect and popular or folkloric character are intertwined in this commentary, just as in an anonymous commentary about the conclusion of Mendelssohn's *Scottish Symphony*:

der wie ein grosser Volkschor in gewaltiger Masse ein eigenes, begeistertes Gefühl auszusprechen scheint, auf dessen Macht und Kraft die ganze Zukunft und Hoffnung eines Volkes beruht. Die Wirkung dieses Schlusses ist ungemein grossartig und regt unwillkürlich auf, wie wenige Musikstücke es vermögen [57].

Mendelssohn himself had a strong male choir in mind when composing the famous excerpt as he emphasized in a letter to Ferdinand David discussing instrumentation issues: "Ich hoffe, es [...] klingt jetzt ordentlich deutlich und stark wie ein Männerchor (so möchte ich's nämlich [...])" [56]. Other sources support the association of the *Glorifying Hymnic* with large choirs. Liszt observes in the Boston translation of his essay on Wagner's *Tannhäuser* that the religious theme of the pilgrims' song in the overture "unfolds the wings of a triumphal hymn to their fullest breadth" [74a]. Also very interesting is a document related to a composition which is not part of the corpus since it is vocal music but which contains the setting of a song that very much shares the features of the *Glorifying Hymnic*: Peter Benoit uses the song "Het Wilhelmus," then the unofficial anthem of the Netherlands, in the climax of the second part as well as in the finale of his oratorio *De Schelde* (1867). The hymnic character of the song and the grand orchestration, including organ in the finale, are directly related: "Comme le *Wilhelmus-Lied* a de caractère

d'un hymne, les sons du gigantesque instrument ajoutent à la grandeur de son allure" [115a]. However, at this point the feature merges with the Sublime, which will be discussed later.

No characteristic is as strongly documented as the one reflected in a semantic field that comprises **solemnity, pomp, glory, grandeur, and splendor**. Most frequent from this field are the terms "solennel," "solennité," "solemn," "solennise" [23,72,82,86,125,156]. These words have been used to describe Wagner's pilgrims' choir, the excerpts from Saint-Saëns's Violin Concerto 3 and Smetana's *Vltava*. The most closely related German words are "Fest," "festlich," and "feierlich," employed in descriptions of Beethoven's *Eroica* [(2)], Weber's *Jubel-Overture* [(34,40,42,43),151], Mendelssohn's *Scottish Symphony* [58,68], Wagner's *Tannhäuser* [83], Brahms's *Haydn Variations* [119,121] as well as his *Academic Festival Overture* [145,151]. "Weihe," "onction," and "célébrer" are also closely related [(40),81,84c]. The next most frequent are the terms "Glanz" [20,113,119,120,138,153a,170] and "Pracht," [10,20,(21,32),57,58] which are hard to distinguish. Similar, maybe with a religious connotation, is the term "leuchten," found in Richard Specht's descriptions of the *Glorifying Hymnic* in Mahlers Symphonies Nos. 1 and 5 [159,168]. The terms "pomp," [(19),64,147] "grandeur," [81,88,115a/b] and "glory," [(9),64,125,159,165] including its equivalents from other languages, as well as the descriptor "splendid" [11] round out this semantic field. The solemn and pompous impression of the *Glorifying Hymnic* is thus attested on the basis of thirteen different works and 32 or, if we count the fuzzy evidence, 38 sources. It might make sense to differentiate this semantic field in one unfolding around "solemnity" and another unfolding around "pomp" and "grandeur," the distinguishing characteristic being the opulence which is implied by terms like "pomp" and "grandeur."

Only slightly less strongly documented than the semantic field unfolding around solemnity and splendor is the semantic field that may again be labeled the Sublime. The central concepts of this semantic field are **grandness** and **power**. Through the idea of grandeur, the Sublime is directly linked to the semantic field analyzed above—just as most semantic fields are interconnected with each other. The term "sublime" or "erhaben" occurs explicitly with respect to Beethoven's *Eroica* [(4)], Weber's *Jubel-Overture* [(26,34)], Mendelssohn's *Scottish Symphony* [59], and Wagner's *Tannhäuser* [74a,84a] but it is not at all the most frequent term. Again, the field can be divided into two subfields embracing power and might on the one hand, the magnificent and grand on the other. Both subfields are roughly equally important. The terms "power" [74b,88], "vigueur" [(38)], "mächtig," "Macht" and "mighty" [(31),57,70,75,76], "heroic" [11], "marvellous energy" [160], "Kraft" [55,57,66,71a,73,(118),120], "gewaltig" [57], "stark" and "Stärke" [(20),59,158], "wuchtige Breite" [8], "puissant" [13,84b],

“durchzittern,” “frémir” or “schmettern,” [(26),129b,170], “force” [125], and even “omnipotent” [131] constitute the first subfield. They are drawn from commentaries on Beethoven’s *Eroica*, Weber’s *Jubel-Overture*, Berlioz’s overture to *Benvenuto Cellini*, Mendelssohn’s *Scottish Symphony*, Wagner’s *Tannhäuser*, Brahms’s *Haydn Variations*, Benoît’s overture to *Charlotte Corday*, Saint-Saëns’s Violin Concerto No. 3, Smetana’s *Vltava*, Mahler’s Symphony No. 1 and, less clearly, on Grieg’s Piano Concerto. The other subfield consists of the words “magnificent” or “magnificence” [62,84a,156], “magnifique” [84b,79], “grand” [36,127,130a,131], “grandiose” [23,37,115a/b], “grandi” or “grandezza” [(4)], “großartig” [57], “Größe” [(26),57,59,(118)], “Masse” [57], “gigantesque” [115a], “imposant” [42,144], and maybe “riesenhaft” [26], “titanic” [166], and “kolossal” [(3)]. Both subfields are augmented by concepts of the majestic in three languages [13,(37),59,60,63,88,124,123,125,126,(128),153a]. The religious metaphor of the “oberste Feldherr der himmlischen Heerscharen” used by Max Kalbeck for the description of Brahms’s *Haydn Variations* also alludes to the idea of majesty:

[...] dieser Baß [...] bringt endlich nach großartigen Steigerungen thematischer, instrumentaler und dynamischer Art das „Chorale St. Antoni“ im Triumphe zurück, als hätte es der oberste Feldherr der himmlischen Heerscharen mitten in das feindliche Getümmel der anstürmenden Höllensöhne hineingeworfen gehabt, damit es von seinem Heiligen herausgeholt werde [121].

In addition, the *Glorifying Hymnic* expresses **joy**. Beethoven’s *Ode to Joy* and Weber’s as well as Joachim Raff’s *Jubel-Overture* hint at this expressive sphere already in their titles. The respective excerpts have been characterized with the terms “Jubel” [(21,26),29,(33),46] and “happy” or “happiness” [36,143]. The term “Jubel” also occurs in reference to Beethoven’s *Pastoral Symphony* [15,(17)], Mendelssohn’s *Scottish Symphony* [59], Brahms’s *Academic Festival Overture* [144,148,149,151] and, with some uncertainty, Beethoven’s *Eroica* [(1)]. In reference to the *Scottish Symphony*, we also find “beseligend” [59] and “glücklich” [66]—terms that have, albeit with less degree of certainty, also been used to describe the effect of the *Jubel-Overture* [(18,26)]. “Frohsinn,” “Fröhlichkeit,” “Freude,” “joie,” and “joy” can be drawn from sources referring to Beethoven’s *Pastoral Symphony* [15,(16)], Wagner’s *Tannhäuser* [73,78,84a], Brahms’s *Academic Festival Overture*—Kalbeck calls it an “Ozean der Freude” [153a]—as well as perhaps the *Jubel-Overture* [(22,40,42)]. Also, the even stronger terms “exaltation” and “exultation” can be documented, namely in sources describing *Tannhäuser* [74c], the *Academic Festival Overture* [146], and probably the *Eroica* [(1)]. In Saint-Saëns Piano Concerto No. 4, Émile Baumann hears nothing less than “le Principe de toute joie,” and

he adds “allégresse” and even associates the music with “une vie béatifié” [129b].

The semantic field of joy offers an opportunity to address a methodological issue that is central for my reading of the sources: The terms that are being extracted to constitute the semantic field are torn out of their contexts because I am aiming to derive a core meaning where all sources intersect. Since the quantity of the sources used is essential for the methodological design of this study, it is impossible to discuss every document individually. However, attaching the entire source material in appendix 4 makes a critical examination of my reading possible. The present semantic field actually provides especially vivid examples of this problem. They illustrate two simplifications that come along with this method: neglecting specifying word combinations and neglecting specifying situations. Édouard Schuré’s description of the pilgrim’s chorus in Wagner’s *Tannhäuser* as articulating “une joie sublime” [(84a)] and Adolf Bernhard Marx’ characterization of the excerpt from *Ode to Joy* as sung in a “bacchische Jubelton” [46] clearly mark the two most remote extremes of joy. Yet both terms refer to some sort of joy, even to some sort of especially intense joy. Moreover, the overlap of the two descriptions is supported, firstly, by the fact that the musical settings share significant features and, secondly, by mediating sources that combine such extremes as in a description of Mendelssohn’s *Scottish Symphony* where a religious moment is addressed and nevertheless the term “Jubel” is used along with the more inward-looking “beseligend” [59].

In a similar way, situations are being neglected. Again, the semantic field of joy offers colorful examples. One source reports that Mendelssohn was happy when finishing his *Scottish Symphony* implying that he was pouring this emotion into the finale of his symphony [66]. Another document mentions the “happy introduction” of the national anthem in Weber’s overture [36], leaving open what this descriptor is exactly referring to. Other sources, that were, of course, only counted as remote evidence, give very general characterizations of Weber’s overture in saying that it sounds as if it were repeating all the time: “Wie glücklich sind wir, einen so guten König zu haben, wie lieben wir ihn!” [(18)], or in mentioning that “stürmischer Jubel ertönte,” cheering applause was resonating after the performance [(26)]. On the one hand, the same reasons explained above legitimate this method; on the other hand, in this case the more general perspective on the sources may even lead to a deeper understanding. For it is very well possible that those very different situations and ways of speaking about a piece of music reveal profound connections that may be easily obscured by too much differentiating interpretation. The “Jubel” of the audience may very well prolong the jubilation of the music itself, and Mendelssohn might well have understood how to put his happiness into music, or the reviewer appropriately projected his interpretation or feeling of the music’s expressive quality

“happiness” onto the composer. Thus, the more general reading of the sources may be very productive in better understanding the ways cultural codes (or other mechanisms) control the understanding of musical expressiveness.

The expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic* have not yet been completely analyzed. The excerpts were also experienced as expressing **triumph and victory**. The sources are straightforward using exclusively these two words, including their translations. This association is perhaps obvious in the cases of Wagner’s *Tannhäuser* [71a/b,73,74a,77,84a/b,86,87,88], Strauss’ *Don Juan* [160], and Benoît’s overture to *Charlotte Corday* [133]. However, also Beethoven’s *Eroica* [(1,9),13,14], Mendelssohn’s *Scottish Symphony* [59,61,65,68], Brahms’s *Haydn Variations* [120,121], Saint-Saëns’s Piano Concerto No. 4 [(129b)], Cliffe’s Symphony No. 1 [162], Mahler’s Symphonies No. 1 [159] and No. 5 [168,169] as well as, not quite as unambiguously, Weber’s *Jubel-Overture* [(22)] have been described using these terms. Mahler characterizes the section of the score in which the *Glorifying Hymnic* of the First Symphony occurs with the term “triumphal”.

In the case of the *Majestic Chorale* as well as in the case of the *Glorifying Hymnic*, the association with triumph and victory probably has to do with its dramaturgical position since in most pieces these types occur at the end or close to the end of longer orchestral works that mostly elaborate a dramatic process culminating in the *Majestic Chorale* or the *Glorifying Hymnic* (feature 17). It is likely, therefore, that the dramaturgical place of the excerpt has a considerable influence on the effect of the music. However, the sources do not explicitly support this assumption.

The religious characterizations of the *Majestic Chorale* did not come as a surprise. However, the *Glorifying Hymnic* also evoked **religious feelings** or associations in a contemporary audience. Of course, most sources are related to Wagner’s *Tannhäuser* where the religious content is made implicit by the libretto [72,75,76,77,80,81,84a/b/c,87,88]. Here, we encounter a wealth of religious terms that describe the pilgrims’ chorus but we may assume that this terminological complexity is a result of knowing the libretto rather than of describing the music itself. I will, therefore, consider only those terms that also occur elsewhere.

In relation to Brahms’s *Haydn Variations* whose theme bears the title “Chorale St. Antoni” we might suppose that Max Kalbeck’s earlier quoted religious reading [121] was partly inspired by this title. However, no such indications exist for Beethoven’s *Eroica*, Mendelssohn’s *Scottish Symphony*, Saint-Saëns’s Piano Concerto No. 4, or Tchaikovsky’s Symphony No. 5. Nevertheless, all these works have been described using religious metaphors and allusions. Wilhelm Joseph von Wasielewski understood the Andante variation in the last

movement of the *Eroica* as a “gen Himmel gerichtete Danksagung” [10]. To be sure, the hymnic excerpt is only a segment of the Andante section; therefore, the specificity of the evidence is not certain. In Paul Bekkers description, there is a similar ambivalence since he explicitly introduces the religious element with respect to the quiet first part of the variation; but, still, the entire vision can be called religious or at least transcendent (“hinweg über alle Regungen irdischer Art”):

Ein ins Unendliche der Erscheinungen sich steigerndes Leben breitet sich aus, bis, hinweg über alle Regungen irdischer Art, der Geist seinen letzten großen Aufstieg nimmt: gebetsartig beginnend und dann zu einem Triumphgesang anschwellend, der das ganze Weltall zu durchströmen scheint [14].

An anonymous commentator on Mendelssohn’s *Scottish Symphony* from Vienna imagined a religious moment starting with the point when the music comes to rest before the *Allegro maestoso assai* starts. Linking the sublime and the religious moments, he imagines the rest as awe of the divine and depicts it as the portal of a temple which symbolizes the grand moment suggesting some kind of revelation which then manifests itself:

[...] und so tritt ein Moment der Ruhe und heiligen Stille ein, wie vor den Pforten eines Tempels, in welchem wir das Ziel unserer kühnsten Wünsche erreichen sollen, und den wir aus heiliger Scheu noch nicht zu betreten wagen; ein Moment einer Größeres verheißenden Sammlung, der auch endlich im Allegro maestoso assai, 6/8 A-dur mit einem eben so erhaben sich aufschwingenden Thema, von Violon, Horn, Fagott und Clarinett eingeführt, als ebenso innigen und lieblichen Thema, in immer größerer Verstärkung zur beseligenden Vollendung führt, zum Momente, wo der Siegesjubel alle Erinnerungen und gehabte stürmische und schmerzensebange Kämpfe überschallt, und man rufen möchte: ‚Heil dir vollendet majestätischer Siegerin!‘ [59]

Similarly, Émile Baumann interpreted Saint-Saëns’s Piano Concerto No. 4 as portraying the salvation history of humanity:

Involontairement, le concerto en ut mineur représente les deux périodes successives des destinées humaines: d’abord les antiques fatalités; puis la délivrance, la révélation de la béatitude; et, dans l’acceptation passagère des pesantes limites terrestres, une activité régénérée, des espoirs sans bornes [129a].

The description of the excerpt as “triomphe,” “apothéose liturgique,” and as “prelude [...] à l’aurore de la résurrection” [129b] leaves no doubt that the excerpt represents that revelation for Baumann. Likewise, Rosa Newmarch quotes M. Berezovsky saying that the beginning of the last movement of Tchaikovsky’s Symphony No. 5 is “penetrated with religious feeling” and that the “*Finale* itself (*Allegro vivace*) grows gradually clearer as it proceeds, as though the

heart had cast off a load of suffering and God's world shone out bright once more" [161]. Since in the beginning of the movement Tchaikovsky introduces the theme that will be the subject of the hymnic excerpt, it is very likely that the quoted phrase specifically refers to this moment.

In listening to the chorale in Mahler's Symphony No. 5, Paul Stefan felt the salvation of the paradise [158]. Finally, a London commentator recognized that the chorus in Scriabin's Symphony No. 1 glorifies "art substituted for religion" [165] identifying the work as an example of *Kunstreligion*.

In contrast to the expressive qualities analyzed so far, the religious components have a relation to a subset of the features: apparently, the religious sphere does not tolerate cymbals and drums (feature 17). No source has been found that associated a hymnic passage employing these instruments with religious content or feeling. Presumably, these instruments suggested the profane or were even laden with military connotations: their use contradicted ideas like awe of the divine and devotion. In cases where these instruments are employed, we may assume that the expressive qualities were restricted to the other elements (in figure 3, this has been indicated by using another shade of grey for this element).

The same distinction is true for the next expressive quality **quiet and peace**, which is not so richly documented but which is nevertheless significant, especially considering the fact that it also corresponds with the subset described. In sources dealing with four different works, Mendelssohn's *Scottish Symphony*, Wagner's *Tannhäuser*, Brahms's *Haydn Variations*, and Saint-Saëns's Piano Concerto No. 4, more obvious descriptions of triumph and apotheosis co-occur with descriptions referencing quiet and peace. The sources characterize this combination as a balance in an astonishingly similar way. Especially Franz Liszt's description of the effect of Wagner's pilgrims' chorus (not primarily alluding to the overture, though) and Heinrich Reimann's description of the conclusion of Brahms's *Haydn Variations* resemble each other in that they characterize the music as simultaneously expressing exaltation and repose. In the English translation of Liszt's description, we read: "In this repose, however, there vibrates a certain exaltation and enthusiasm and you can distinguish in it an enduring ecstasy, a secret uncontainable delight" [(74c); French original: 72; cf. 77]. Similarly, Reimann wrote about the Brahms piece: "Allmählich finden sich Anklänge an das Thema ein, immer bestimmter werdend, bis es endlich mit siegender Kraft einsetzt. So gelangt das Ganze zu einem äußerlich glänzend bewegten, innerlich aber tief beruhigenden Schluss" [120]. And Émile Baumann explains that in Saint-Saëns's Piano Concerto the piano proclaims the "message de paix [...] avec le frémissement de trompettes sacrées" [129b]. These depictions point to an amazingly similar effect the music had on these listeners. Additionally, although its musical features point

Fig. 3: *The Glorifying Hymnic*: expressive qualities

more towards the *Majestic Chorale*, it is interesting enough to see, that one source on Liszt's *Battle of the Huns* mentions a "majesté reposante" [112] thus alluding to the same mixture of external excitement and internal repose. (Liszt uses cymbals during the episodes, not during the chorale itself.) In the above quoted Viennese description of the excerpt from the *Scottish Symphony*, tranquility and jubilation are observed as expressive qualities that occur in succession [59] but, still, it is a striking similarity in the description of a rather complex emotional state. Two more sources invoke the word field of peace for Wagner's and Mendelssohn's works [80,(67)].

The mentioned subset of musical features, namely the exclusion of cymbals and drums, already suggests the proximity of this semantic field to the religious sphere, and this is clearly confirmed by the fact that the sources combine these two aspects themselves in wordings like "religious tranquillity" [77] or "heilige Stille" [59] and in placing "Friede" and "Andacht" in the same context [80]. The only exception is Reimann's description of Brahms's piece where no religious aspect is mentioned [120]. Yet, the evidence explained seems to be sufficient for assuming that even here the term "beruhigend" has a religious appeal, especially if we remember that Kalbeck used very explicit religious metaphors for depicting the excerpt.

One of the difficulties of reconstructing the expressive qualities is to define plausible semantic fields. Some of them simply consist of only two or three words like victory and triumph; such fields are consistent, and easily delineated and distinguished. Other fields such as the religious contain a rich variety of related terms, but they are still rather unambiguously demarcated. This is not the case with the next semantic field I will deal with: several sources point towards a strong emotional impact of the music resembling chills or some kind of **rapture**. However, the terms used are very diverse. The word that occurs most often is "excitement" or "Aufregung" [57,63,88], used in descriptions of the *Scottish Symphony* as well as *Tannhäuser*. Another term found is "enthusiasm" in its English and French forms [45,79] in reference to Weber's *Jubel-Overture* and Wagner's *Tannhäuser*. Very explicit is Franz Liszt's wording in his Wagner interpretation where he writes about "une extase contenue, un secret ravissement" [72], "an enduring ecstasy, a secret uncontainable delight" [74c], as well as Paul Bekkers characterization of the excerpt from the *Eroica* as performing an "ekstatische[n] Aufschwung" [14]. Notably, the emphasis is on the irresistibility of these emotions: the music "regt unwillkürlich auf," [57] it has an "effet véritablement irrésistible," [79] or the audience is "carried away" [36]. These quotations refer to the compositions already mentioned above. Other terms that most likely belong into this category are: "begeistert" [(27),57], "hinreißend" [153b], "ergreifend" [(26),73], "gefesselt" [144], "erschüttert" [80], "feverish" [88], "wie von einem

Zauber umspinnen” [85], and “exaltation” [(72,74c)], this last characterization points to the close link between joy and the rapture-like effect. The term “explosion” occurs in two sources commenting upon Benoît’s overture to *Charlotte Corday* [130b,132]. Some remaining terms either only occur in ambiguous sources as “entzückt,” [(21)] or their relationship to this semantic field is uncertain as “fire,” “Feuer” or “feurig” [18,21,(27,33,62)], and “brausend” [149]. Therefore, they have been omitted in figure 3. Also omitted in this figure were the terms found in sources relating to Benoît’s *De Schelde*, since it is an oratorio, but they support very nicely the impression of a rapture-like effect: the music “a excité des transports d’enthousiasme” [114,116], its effect is “irrésistible,” and the audience has been “entraîné” resulting in an “explosion” [115b]. Another author, writing in 1898, says that with respect to earlier performances that there was a “forte commotion qui électrisait les masses” [117].

Excerpts of the *Glorifying Hymnic* also express **pride**. Admittedly, there are only four main sources suggesting this reading. However, they refer to four different works, stem from four different countries and span a period of over 44 years. G. A. Macfarren from London suggests in 1869 that Mendelssohn was “stolz” when finishing his *Scottish Symphony* [66]. Writing 1881 in Breslau, Carl Polko sensed a “stolzen Jubel” in the *Academic Festival Overture*, probably implying Brahms’s pride in receiving the honorary doctorate which was the occasion for this composition.⁵³ Émile Baumann called the hymn of Saint-Saëns’s Piano Concerto 4 a “hymne d’un orgueilleux triomphe” [156], and the Austrian Richard Specht called the theme of the hymnic excerpt from Mahler’s first symphony a “stolzes Glorienthema” [159]. Again, support comes from the reception of Benoît’s *De Schelde* from a Belgian author describing the way the final hymn was sung by the choir “fièrement enlevé” [116].

As with pride, the evidence for **nobility and dignity** is weak. I found five sources referring to four works, namely Beethoven’s *Eroica*, Mendelssohn’s *Scottish* symphony, Wagner’s *Tannhäuser*, and Smetana’s *Vltava*. The usual word used is “noble” [11,12,62,88,123], one source also uses “dignified” [12]. In this case, the evidence stems exclusively from Anglophone sources.

Finally, the *Glorifying Hymnic* is strikingly often associated with the celebration of a social or **political community**, either via praising a ruler or via praising the nation. In fact, nearly all cases where the *Glorifying Hymnic* is based on musical quotation, this quotation is a song with national connotations. Frequently, this has been mentioned by reviewers of Weber’s *Jubel-Overture*, which quoted the tune of “God Save the King!” which was well known all over Europe and North America and which was being used as royal or national hymn in many places

⁵³ For the background, see Riethmüller, “Wagner, Brahms.”

with adapted texts like “Heil dir im Siegerkranz,” the “Sachsenhymne,” or “America” [24,29,35,36,39,41,44,45]. Weber’s composition was used for the emperor’s birthday celebrations [40,41] and was understood as a celebration of the German nation [31,34,42]. Paganini and Vieuxtemps used royal and national anthems respectively when touring abroad, exploiting the hosts’ loyalty and national feelings for their own benefit. As a court composer at the Danish court in Copenhagen, Kuhlau used the Danish royal anthem. Henry Litolff explicitly quoted the national anthem of the Netherlands in his *Concerto symphonique No. 3* which is also known as the *Concert national hollandais*.

In other works, the nationalist content is not that direct but still obvious. Smetana’s *Vltava* is part of the cycle *Má Vlast, My Homeland*, setting a nationalist frame for the piece. In the case of Stanford’s *Irish Symphony* it is the quotations of traditional Irish songs that gave the piece a “patriotic touch” [157]. And with respect to Brahms’s *Academic Festival Overture* Max Kalbeck elucidates the nationalist connotation of the “*Gaudeamus igitur*:”

So stürmisch und hinreißend würde das „*Gaudeamus*“ bei Brahms nicht erschallen, wenn es nicht die aus dem Politischen ins Musikalische übertragenen Verwirrungen und Entwicklungen der Overture zur Voraussetzung hätte. ‚Freiheit, Ehre und Vaterland!‘, die Parole der deutschen Burschenschaft, ist auch die Devise der „Akademischen Festouvertüre“ [153b; cf. 152].

In fact, the history of the “*Gaudeamus*” in 19th-century Germany was intertwined with the nationalist developments,⁵⁴ an aspect that should not come as a surprise considering the fact how important the student fraternities were for the German national movement.

Beethoven’s *Ode to Joy* is neither based on a quotation nor is the text about the nation or a ruler, but it is, of course, a praise of community with an emphasis on equality:

Deine Zauber binden wieder
Was die Mode streng geteilt;
Alle Menschen werden Brüder,
Wo dein sanfter Flügel weilt.

Thus, the great majority of music quoting songs or linked to a text is associated with the celebration of community. The musical model of the *Glorifying Hymnic* was strongly predestined, though not exclusively used for nationalist subjects. In contrast to all other elements of the *Glorifying Hymnic*’s expressive qualities—even including the religious—no

⁵⁴ See, for example, Fallersleben, *Gaudeamus igitur*. This brochure certainly did not accidentally appear in the year after the foundation of the “kleindeutsches Reich” under that title.

source mentions aspects of the nation or the community if there is no explicit reference to it—with the one exception of the anonymous commentator of Mendelssohn's *Scottish Symphony* who heard a “grosser Volkschor in gewaltiger Masse” [57], as quoted above. So, the music does not express the idea of the nation or nationalism but it expresses more general feelings and associations as grandness, solemnity, or joy, which are easily linked with nationalism and patriotism but do not explicitly arouse associations to these concepts.

Thus, the *Glorifying Hymnic* is associated with the idea of singing in large groups, solemnity and splendor, grandness and power, joy, triumph and victory, religious feelings, quiet and peace, rapture, pride, nobility and dignity, as well as with some form of community. When Jules Massenet used this expression type in his opera *Esclarmonde* and the related instrumental suite, he was well aware of these connotations. For, the lines of the Prologue (partly repeated in the finale) set to this type contain most of the expressive qualities observed: the sublime, the divine, the shuddering power (*impératrice*, *frémir*, *destin*), grandness (*monde*, *univers*), and splendor are mentioned explicitly, and implicitly it also contains loyalty and community as well as singing in large groups (*la foule*):

LA FOULE

Sublime Impératrice!
 O divine Esclarmonde,
 Ton trône resplendit plus brillant que le jour!
 Le destin à tes pieds met Byzance et le monde.
 Tout l'univers t'acclame en frémissant d'amour!
 O divine Esclarmonde!
 L'univers frémit d'amour!

Again, the diagram of the expressive qualities in figure 3 of the *Glorifying Hymnic* has a heuristic function: it is not supposed to depict a consistent theory of musical expression. For example, the religious elements are assigned to “semantic associations” but certainly contain emotional qualities like hope (“*espoir*”) or “religious feelings.” Also, many elements are intertwined and related with each other. The sublime may relate to the religious sphere, triumph and victory may relate to nation or religion, solemnity may relate to joy, hymns may relate to the nation or to the sacred sphere, and so on. The religious associations are directly connected with the emotional state of tranquility. These two semantic fields also share the characteristic that they exclude cymbals and drums so that the *Glorifying Hymnic* employing these instruments might also be called the *Secular Glorifying Hymnic*.

*

A comparison of the expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic* with those of the *Majestic Chorale* shows that there are many overlaps, as might have been expected because of the similarity of the two expression types. They contain basically the same elements of the sublime, they share the associations with singing and with religion, and both express triumph or victory, as well as joy. The strength with which the expressive qualities are documented cannot be compared since the overall quantity of the sources is too different in the two cases. For a comparison of the relative strengths of the elements, which would theoretically be possible, the danger of over-interpretation is too great since the quantities are not sufficiently meaningful. However, it is possible to emphasize the differences of the two expression types: the *Glorifying Hymnic* stirs rapture-like emotions, is accompanied by patriotic elements, and concretizes the religious feelings partially with the aspect of tranquility. To this we can add, though on weaker grounds, the idea of pride—none of these expressive qualities could be demonstrated for the *Majestic Chorale*.

The fluid boundary between the two expression types becomes even clearer if we consider some evidence that is below-threshold but becomes significant in the light of the two expression types taken together. Against the backdrop of the *Glorifying Hymnic* it is interesting that one source attests the chorale in Rubinstein's *Océan Symphony* "thrilling power," [98] and a less clearly directed commentary on Brahms's *Symphony No. 1* describes the finale using terms like "Entzücken" and "berauschend" [139]. Thus, the semantic field of rapture-like experiences might be discernible. One or two sources also employ the terms "solemn" and "Glanz" for the same two compositions, as well as Brahms's *Haydn Variations* [98,119,(138)]. And finally, a nationalist context was documented in sources about Fibich's *Komenský* [163]⁵⁵ and has been suggested with respect to Brahms *Symphony No. 1*.⁵⁶ Thus, in spite of the differences between the two expression types, their fluid boundary allows even more overlaps in expressive qualities than are immediately obvious.

⁵⁵ See n. 44.

⁵⁶ Gelbart, "Nation, Folk, and Music History."

III. Historical Interpretation

a) General tendencies

Expressive qualities of a piece of music unfold within an individual work composed by an individual composer; they are part of a unique dramaturgical process interacting with all musical events in which they are embedded. Moreover, the works were composed in different cultural, geographical, and chronological contexts, and they all constitute their meanings only in the ears of their listeners, who themselves come from different social and cultural contexts and experience the music in different performance situations. These facts cannot and shall not be denied. Yet, the sources display some intriguing overlaps in the affective reception of the musical excerpts belonging to an expression type. This illustrates that there were *longue durées* of expressive qualities and of the means to evoke them in the long 19th century and in those social milieus that were listening to (or at least of those authorized to write about) European or Western art music. It goes without saying that the descriptions of the music being discussed here differ in many respects. However, the focus of this study is on the shared aspects that allow us to make some kind of general assertions about the expressive effect of the music under consideration on its contemporary audience.

We encounter the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic* quite often in 19th-century symphonic music. Of course, no statistical assertions can be made without reliable benchmarks as pointed out above. We would need something like a catalogue of expression types as well as information about their statistical distribution, which would put us in position to assess the frequency of the expression types that are being explored here. Nevertheless, even without such context knowledge some traces can be uncovered. The fact that there are 48 works with passages that can unambiguously be assigned to the *Glorifying Hymnic*—not counting many doubtful borderline cases, as well as many related excerpts that do not meet the strict definition of the *Glorifying Hymnic* as outlined above—legitimizes the assertion that this expression type had quite some significance for contemporary composers and listeners, even though we cannot assess the significance against other expression types. Bearing this caveat in mind, it seems to be promising to interpret the expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic* against the backdrop of 19th-century musical, social, and political history. Symphonic music, especially the symphony, was considered to be a genre that addressed a large community and was performed in large concert halls and music festivals serving such communities.⁵⁷ Thus, it

⁵⁷ Bonds, “The Symphony”, 147; Steinbeck, *Die Symphonie*, 32–3; Keym, “Vom ‘revolutionären Te Deum’”, 362.

may be assumed that symphonic music was exploring expressive qualities that were important to these communities. And if expression types recur rather frequently, it is likely that they reflect in some way a facet of the mental state of the social groups involved.

The most obvious clue for an understanding of the importance of the expressive qualities associated with the *Glorifying Hymnic* is the fact that in the vast majority of the cases where the hymnic excerpt can be related to a specific content this has to do with the celebration of community, mostly the nation. The European 19th century was a century of nation building, it was a century of the rising of the bourgeoisie and the middle classes, and it was a century of wars and revolutions many of which were themselves related to nationalism and, of course, the rise of the middle classes. Nation, war, and class are all concepts implying and presupposing communities, at least imagined communities to borrow Benedict Anderson's term.⁵⁸ Triumph, victory, joy, enthusiasm, celebration, and pride are all associations or emotions easily related to events, successes, wishes, hopes, and dreams connected to such communities, especially nation building processes. But maybe also grandness and power can be associated with the idea of the nation, especially where this idea had a religious aura (prototypical for the sublime), and also where the power of a large community was being imagined.

At first sight, it might be confusing to make no difference between affirmative or critical praises of community, or between praising a monarchy or a republic, a supposedly good or a bad system, and so forth. However, it is important to understand that the music only expresses the feelings that might accompany some historical, social or political circumstances and events. The music does not express those events themselves, and the feelings or associations expressed through the music do not carry any more concrete meaning.

Nation building was only one element of socio-political change in the 19th century. Another very important trend was the growing of power of the middle classes that, in many countries, went along with revolutions that either caused changes of society or at least demonstrated a high consciousness of the need of social change. A part of these processes was the democratization process. And again, it is easy to associate these processes at least with triumph, victory, joy, enthusiasm, and pride.

In addition to nation and community, religiosity provides a second clue that helps to relate the expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic* to the historical context. Despite the growing influence of the concept of secularization, religion was a central factor of understanding the meaning of life in the 19th century.⁵⁹ Therefore, the presence of religious

⁵⁸ Anderson, *Imagined Communities*.

⁵⁹ See, for instance, Osterhammel, *Die Verwandlung*, 1239.

feelings in the music should not come as a surprise. Moreover, the linkage of nationalism and religiosity in the expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic* seems to reflect the association of nationalism and religion in the 19th century.⁶⁰ This association has at least four facets:

- Religion and nation are both important factors of the construction of identity and community.
- In their nationalist convictions and deeds, communities often acted on the authority of God. Many texts of national or king's hymns explicitly invoke God like the "Marseillaise," the "Star Spangled Banner," or "God Save the King!" In Germany, the Luther chorale "Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott" became something like an unofficial national hymn.⁶¹
- Nationalism and religion share several psychological functions, e.g. coping with contingency, lending and safeguarding norms, or structuring life through ritualization.⁶²
- The ways nationalism was being staged in the public sphere in national celebrations, singing festivals, monument dedications, etc. resembled religious rituals and was often combined with them.⁶³

A third clue for the historical interpretation of the *Glorifying Hymnic* is its association with singing and especially mass singing. I described above how excerpts of the *Glorifying Hymnic* have been compared with singing. More specifically, many excerpts were associated with actual singing. Often Weber's *Jubel-Overture* made the audience rise and sing as documents from Berlin, Straßburg, Dresden, and Potsdam (dated 1854, 1877, 1878 and 1887 respectively) attest [25,35,39,41]. Also, the overture was combined with songs as in Boston 1860 [28] and in Neisse 1863 where it was played at a singing festival of the "Schlesische Sängerbund." Solo and mass songs followed the overture in the program [30]. In a performance of Brahms's *Academic Festival Overture* in New York in 1912, a chorus took part [154]. In fact, Brahms himself was astonished that this did not happen more often [150]. Ryan Minor reports of more examples where composers expected the public to sing along: Wagner's *Imperial March*, Reinthaler's *Bismarck Hymn*, and Kistler's *Bismarck Cantata*,⁶⁴ and Sven Oliver Müller mentions the practice of singing national hymns in the opera house.⁶⁵ Such traditions remind us of Mendelssohn's letter quoted above where he explained that he had a men's choir in mind when composing the final section of his *Scottish Symphony* [56]. An early reviewer sensed this when

⁶⁰ Cf. Hobsbawm, *Nations and Nationalism*, 67–73.

⁶¹ For lots of evidence see Boersch, "Das ,köstlichste vaterländische Gut'."

⁶² Wehler, *Nationalismus*, 32–3.

⁶³ Ibid.

⁶⁴ Minor, *Choral Fantasies*, 131, 134, 139.

⁶⁵ Müller, *Das Publikum*, 324.

comparing this section with a “grosser Volkschor in gewaltiger Masse” [57] as cited above.

It seems obvious that the *Glorifying Hymnic* is an instrumental reproduction of large choir singing. Mass singing had become more and more important during the 19th century. Celia Applegate draws attention to the widespread and during the 19th century constantly growing culture of singing in large groups and writes:

In looking at the ever more multitudinous mixed-voice choruses that began to proliferate from the last decades of eighteenth century on, one is tempted to link the mobilization of crowds of a less musical sort in the era of the French Revolution. People making lots of noise together seemed consonant with the mood of the times, and once an organizer had gathered together 200 for a performance, then 300, then 500, little seemed to resist the notion of a chorus of 10,000 and orchestra of 1,000 such as gathered in Boston for the National Peace Jubilee and Musical Festival of 1869.⁶⁶

At the same time, however, Applegate rightly cautions against simplifying explanations since there was “a great variety of reasons for coming together to sing.”⁶⁷ Yet, these different reasons do not contradict the existence of many shared effects and feelings. Also, several aspects of singing in large groups were commonly shared. This kind of singing was a cultural practice that was widespread all over Europe and North America in the 19th century. Central for this practice were the *Sängervereine* in German speaking countries and the *orphéons* in France, but similar phenomena existed everywhere. Another important tradition that also featured large choruses was the tradition of grand oratorios, especially in England and Germany. Unfortunately, however, the research literature is still somewhat limited. It focuses on Germany, maybe France and England. Other countries are much less explored. Also, large-scale analyses of the repertoires are lacking, especially of the texts. Still, it seems possible to extract some characteristics of those traditions that might help to understand some core aspects of the phenomenon.

Beginning in the 18th century, especially in England with Handel’s anthems and later the Handel commemoration of 1784 but also at the end of the 18th century with the music of the French Revolution, a tendency to ever larger choruses is documented in many countries during the 19th century. Often choirs gathered to build choirs of hundreds or even thousands of singers; sometimes special performance venues had to be built as was the case for the Deutsche Sängerfest in Nuremberg in 1861 (illustration 3).

⁶⁶ Applegate, “The Building of Community,” 5.

⁶⁷ Ibid., 6.

Illustration 3: Singing festival (“Sängerfest”) Nürnberg 1861, Anonymus, *Gedenkbuch*, 43, taken from archive.org

Occasions were often some sort of celebration, jubilee, or a world exhibition⁶⁸ but sometimes also wars or revolutions.⁶⁹ John Knowles Paine’s *Hymn of the West*, a work for choir and orchestra that very much resembles the *Glorifying Hymnic*, was sung by 450 singers at the Louisiana Purchase Exposition for which it had been composed.⁷⁰ Of course, the individual cultural contexts and traditions of the specific performances differed greatly from country to country. However, the tendency towards large singing groups was a shared feature. The same is true regarding the national significance of these practices: the historical, social, and political differences of the countries concerned notwithstanding, singing in large groups was very often associated with the confirmation of a community’s identity, mostly the nation’s.⁷¹ Large choirs

⁶⁸ For England, see: Bense, “Händels Anthems,” 320–24; Henze-Döhring, “Händels Coronation Anthems,” 110–13; Serwer, “Handel Commemoration,” 231; Leese, *British Influence*, 14, 18, 29, 31; Garrat, “Britain and Ireland,” 336–8, 347; Mohn, “Musikfeste in Großbritannien,” 98. For France: Gerbod, “L’institution orphéonique,” 233, 236; Gumpłowicz, “Le dossier ‘orphéon,’” 56; Morel Borotra, “Lieux et pratiques,” 173, 175; Bouton, “Les sociétés musicales,” 143; Loeser, “Musikgeschichte und Vergleich,” 167, 169; Rowden, “Choral music,” 207–8; for Germany: Porter, “The New Public,” 217–8, 221, 223; Wagner, “Die Gutenbergfeiern,” 232–3, 235, 237–9, 241, 244; Breitsameter, “Der Bürger als Dilettant,” 45; Düding, “Nationale Oppositionsfeste,” 172, 184; Klenke, “Bürgerlicher Männergesang,” 459; Fiedler-Barth, “Les montagnards,” 219; Hahn, “Die ‘Sängerrepublik,’” 193; Brusniak, “Nationalbewegung,” 38; Brusniak and Klenke, “Sängerfeste,” passim; Brusniak “Nationalreligiosität,” 89, 93, 97; Gutknecht, “Einige Bemerkungen,” 172, 173, 178; Koldau, “Träger nationaler Gesinnung,” 65, 78; Gruhn, “Bürgerliches Musikfest,” 133, 136, 137, 143; Garrat, *Musik*, 84; Küsgens, *Horizonte*, 57, 106, 169; Brusniak, “Musik- und Gesangsfeste,” 81; Butz, “Musikfeste,” 55; Heller, “Die Mecklenburgischen Musikfeste,” 152, 161, 163; Klenke, “Deutsche Sängerfeste,” 11, 28; Rotter-Broman, “Die Schleswig-Holsteinischen Musikfeste,” 132; Niemöller, “Das Sängerfest,” 20–1, 29; for Spain: Nagore Ferrer, “La música coral,” 443, 444; Sancho García, “Orfeonismo,” 110; and for the USA: Orr, “The United States,” 478, 480–2, 487.

⁶⁹ McWhirter, *Battle Hymns*, reports several cases of spontaneous public singing during the American Civil War (pp. 35, 44, 45, 46, 55).

⁷⁰ Schmidt, *The life and works*, 189 and 447.

⁷¹ For England, see: Bense, “Händels Anthems,” 318; Leese, *British Influence*, 23, 29, 30, 34; Garrat, “Britain and Ireland,” 362; Mohn, “Musikfeste in Großbritannien,” 99; for Finland: Lappalainen, “Gesang- und Musikfeste,” 241–43; for France: Amaouche-Antoine, “Les sociétés,” 450; Gumpłowicz, “Le dossier ‘orphéon,’” 70; Escoffier, “L’orphéon du Velay,” 234, 255; Morel Borotra, “Lieux et pratiques,” 173; Escoffier, “L’orphéon,” 80; Betz,

enacted community, the nation, or a social group's power. Closely linked to the idea of the "imagined community" were ideas like emancipation, equality, and social unity, for which evidence can be found in several countries.⁷² Also, religion was quite often a driving force for singing in large groups.⁷³ At least for the German speaking countries the close connection between nationalism and religion, *Nationalreligiosität*, mentioned above, has been described with respect to the songs, texts, practices, and staging of the *Sängerfeste*.⁷⁴ The power of such performances and its emotional impact has been observed by historians.⁷⁵

It is striking how these aspects of singing in large groups intersect with the expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic*. Grandness, nationalism or patriotism, community, religiosity, and rapture-like affection recur in the context of mass singing. Especially since the *Glorifying Hymnic* has been associated with singing by contemporary witnesses, it seems plausible to assume some sort of interrelation between the *Glorifying Hymnic* in symphonic

„Frisch gesungen...“, 11; Rowden, „Choral music,“ 205; for Germany: Fellerer, „Das deutsche Chorlied,“ 794; Porter, „The New Public,“ 212; Wagner, „Die Gutenbergfeiern,“ 240, 244; Breitsameter, „Der Bürger als Dilettant,“ 42, 45; Busch, „Gesangsfeste,“ passim; Düding, „Nationale Oppositionsfeste,“ passim; Illner, „*Das Gold der Kehlen*,“ 35, 39; Klenke, „Ein ‚Schwur für’s deutsche Vaterland‘,“ 70, 73, 75, 81, 94, 101, 107; Brusniak, „Männerchorwesen,“ 134; Fiedler-Barth, „Les montagnards,“ 219, 220; Klenke, „Nationalkriegerisches Gemeinschaftsideal,“ passim; Klenke, „Das nationalheroische Charisma,“ passim; Hahn, „Die ‚Sängerrepublik‘,“ 203–10; Brusniak, „Nationalbewegung,“ passim; Brusniak and Klenke, „Sängerfeste,“ passim; Gutknecht, „Einige Bemerkungen,“ 174; Koldau, „Träger nationaler Gesinnung,“ 65; Boresch, „Das ‚köstlichste vaterländische Gut‘,“ passim; Garrat, *Music*, 118, 123, 199, 200; Eichner, *History*, 187–93; Küsgens, *Horizonte*, 106; „Musik- und Gesangsfeste,“ 75; Klenke, „Deutsche Sängerfeste,“ 10–5, 26–7; Loos, „Deutsche Männergesangsvereine,“ 231; Niemöller, „Das Sängerfest,“ 27, 29; for Hungary: Bertagnoli, „Hungary,“ 404; for Poland: Milewski, „Poland,“ 384; for Scandinavia and Finland: Herresthal, „The Nordic World,“ 369, 371, 375; for Serbia: Marković, „Serbian (musical) national identity,“ passim; for Slovakia: Lengová, „Die Slowakische Chorbewegung,“ 233, 236; for Spain: Nagore Ferrer, „Orígenes,“ 128; Duarte, „Republicanism,“ 95; Nagore Ferrer, „La música coral,“ 428, 429, 440, 446; Garrido, „Música coral,“ 168; Nagore Ferrer, „Un aspecto,“ 224; Sancho García, „Orfeonismo,“ 107; Clark, „The Philipines,“ 466, 467; for Sweden: Bohlin, „Deutsche Einflüsse,“ 49, 50; and for the USA: McWhirter, *Battle Hymns*, 37.

⁷² For Belgium, see: Charon, „Une chorale,“ 233, 234; for France: Escoffier, „L’orphéon du Velay,“ 250; Bouton, „Les sociétés musicales,“ 146; Escoffier, „L’orphéon,“ Rowden, „Choral music,“ 208; for Germany: Fellerer, „Das deutsche Chorlied,“ 790; Düding, „Nationale Oppositionsfeste,“ passim; Klenke, „Ein ‚Schwur für’s deutsche Vaterland‘,“ 104; Klenke, „Das nationalheroische Charisma,“ 169; Hahn, „Die ‚Sängerrepublik‘,“ 199, 200; Brusniak, „Nationalbewegung,“ 40, 45; Gruhn, „Bürgerliches Musikfest,“ 139; Garrat, *Music*, 36, 39; Eichner, *History*, 183–4; Minor, „Choral Music,“ 117; Klenke, „Deutsche Sängerfeste,“ 9, 10, 13, 17; for Serbia: Marković, „The specific nature,“ 6; for Spain: Nagore Ferrer, „Orígenes,“ 127; Duarte, „Republicanism,“ 94; and for the USA: McWhirter, *Battle Hymns*, 4; Orr, „The United States,“ 475, 476, 484.

⁷³ For France, see: Rowden, „Choral music,“ 205; for Germany: Fellerer, „Das deutsche Chorlied,“ 795; Wagner, „Die Gutenbergfeiern,“ 244; Düding, „Nationale Oppositionsfeste,“ 180; Fiedler-Barth, „Les montagnards,“ 219, 220; Boresch, „Das ‚köstlichste vaterländische Gut‘,“ 153, 156; Küsgens, *Horizonte*, 147, 159; and for Spain: Nagore Ferrer, „Orígenes,“ 128; Nagore Ferrer, „La música coral,“ 429, 450.

⁷⁴ Klenke, „Bürgerlicher Männergesang,“ 464, 466, 471, 478; Klenke, „Ein ‚Schwur für’s deutsche Vaterland‘,“ 70, 73, 75, 81; Klenke, „Nationalkriegerisches Gemeinschaftsideal,“ passim; Klenke, „Das nationalheroische Charisma,“ 141, 161, 163f., 179; Brusniak, „Nationalbewegung,“ 45; Brusniak and Klenke, „Sängerfeste,“ 50; Brusniak „Nationalreligiosität,“ passim; Fischer, *Religion*, 211; Küsgens, *Horizonte*, 145; Minor, *Choral Fantasies*, 144–155.

⁷⁵ Gumpłowicz, „Le dossier ‘orphéon’,“ 56, 64; Düding, „Nationale Oppositionsfeste,“ 169, 180; Klenke, „Bürgerlicher Männergesang,“ 466; Duarte, „Republicanism,“ 95; Brusniak, „Männerchorwesen,“ 134, 137; Klenke, „Das nationalheroische Charisma,“ 145, 148, 172; Brusniak, „Nationalbewegung,“ 40; Brusniak „Nationalreligiosität,“ 40; Gruhn, „Bürgerliches Musikfest,“ 142; Applegate, „The Building of Community,“ 5; Eichner, *History*, 191, 193; McWhirter, *Battle Hymns*, 4; Klenke, „Deutsche Sängerfeste,“ 28.

music and the cultural practice of singing in large groups.

The *Glorifying Hymnic* can be read as a reflection of some aspects of the mental state of parts of 19th century society. I shall restrain from speculating about the exact strata of the society addressed. It is those parts of society that were involved in the respective musical life; certainly, bourgeois strata played a central role but, of course, also aristocratic strata were involved. I am not arguing for any kind of simple causality; rather, I assume that there might have been an affinity between social and political events, processes, or changes and the emotions they might have effected, on the one hand, and the expressive qualities of the music, on the other: the music was exploring emotions, associations, characteristics that were also present and important in other fields of their culture. Thus, it is easy, for example, to relate triumph, victory, pride, happiness and enthusiasm, glory, and celebration with nation building and its connected hopes, motivations, and successes. However, that does not mean that where music explores these expressive qualities it is somehow exploring nationalism or community, and so on. Rather, religiosity, nation building, the gaining power of the middle classes, and the revolutions were stirring emotions and feelings that thus became important for the mental state of certain strata of 19th-century societies. The music was simply exploring emotions, creating associations and evoking ideas (like the sublime) that would resonate with the mental state of those strata of the society. No direct causality is necessary, and no political or social charging of the music has to be presupposed.

b) Chronologically more specific aspects

There do not seem to be any significant geographic clusters of the *Glorifying Hymnic*. The geographic dissemination of the *Glorifying Hymnic* probably simply reflects the traditions of symphonic music of the 19th century. The first examples are German compositions. In the late twenties and then during the forties the *Glorifying Hymnic* expanded to Danish composers, like the German born Friedrich Kuhlau and Carl Helsted. French and Italian excerpts entered the scene via traditions of operatic overtures, especially the Grand Opera (Berlioz, Donizetti). In the early fifties the first American composer used the pattern of the *Glorifying Hymnic*. Later it became a pan-European phenomenon with a main emphasis on Central and West Europe as well as in Russia—mirroring the main symphonic traditions. Because of the weak source material for the first part of the century, only the excerpts from the forties onwards would invite historiographic speculation.

It is tempting to relate the chronological distribution of the *Glorifying Hymnic* to

historical events of those times. Of course, many more expression types and their possible relations to historical events will have to be investigated as to allow more certainty in historiographic conclusions. Still, it makes sense to offer some suggestions of what events, thoughts, or hopes might have influenced the spreading of the *Glorifying Hymnic*.

Nation building and the restructuring of society were pan-European phenomena and even the whole of Western civilization and beyond—all differences and special characteristics of individual countries or states notwithstanding. Also, perhaps starting with the Napoleonic Wars, the destinies of Western cultures were more and more intertwined in a gradually globalized world. The events of 1830 or 1848 happening in many European countries illustrate how politics transcended the borders of single countries. Beginning with the July Revolution in France, similar events happened in Italy, Germany, Poland, The Netherlands, even the United Kingdom;⁷⁶ the media also promoted this European spreading of political reform efforts.⁷⁷ Later, the revolutions of 1848/49 spread to Switzerland, France, Italian and German territories, the Habsburg monarchy and the Balkan countries, indirectly also over the Netherlands, Belgium, and Scandinavia.⁷⁸ Philhellenism⁷⁹ and the European empathy with the Polish revolt⁸⁰ in 1830 demonstrate common feelings across different European countries. It is, therefore, not unlikely that the mental state of the peoples also resembled each other in many respects—again, differences notwithstanding.

Involved in all these events were some kind of strengthening of liberal or democratic endeavors and the striving for many kinds of liberty (national, political, social). Of course, such endeavors did not come out of nowhere; rather, they had been prepared. They presuppose and imply a change of the mindset. For Germany, there is the term “Vormärz” referring to the years before the March revolution in order to describe the political engagement of intellectuals, the increase of national, liberal or democratic tendencies, and the “social question” (“soziale Frage”).⁸¹

In the light of such events we may ask whether the occurrences of the *Glorifying Hymnic* somehow reflect the mental state of the people involved. The thoughts about this can only be preliminary and speculative; they should be considered as suggestions that may stimulate future research. My hope is that the identification of more expression types and their interpretations will shed light on each other and their possible relation to historical events. It goes without

⁷⁶ Osterhammel, *Die Verwandlung*, 774.

⁷⁷ Schmidt-Funke, “Die 1830er Revolution;” vgl. Osterhammel, *Die Verwandlung*, 778.

⁷⁸ Osterhammel, *Die Verwandlung*, 778; Rapport, 1848, xi.

⁷⁹ Konstantinou, “Griechenlandbegeisterung.”

⁸⁰ Brudzyńska-Němec, “Polenbegeisterung.”

⁸¹ Rapport, 1848, x–xi.

saying that the presence of many emotions and expressive qualities does not need any explanation from the historical context, even though they might sound different depending on the historical context: love, grief, happiness, and many other feelings belong to the human condition. However, if the distribution of some expression types has peaks at certain times, one may look for historical explanations.

Figure 4 depicts the chronological distribution of the *Glorifying Hymnic*. One of the foremost dangers of searching for relations between historical events and expression types is cherry picking: selecting those events that seem to make sense with respect to the expressive qualities implied and leaving out those that do not fit. Also, sometimes it might be argued that hopes for and visions of expected future events were arousing the feelings; sometimes it might be argued that events that had, in fact, happened did so. This too might seem arbitrary. Yet, by now we do have an idea of what the music was expressing and we know quite a lot about the goals and hopes of the respective social strata. Thus, we need to look for relations that are plausible in the sense that the assumption of chance and coincidence is less likely than the assumption of a relationship.⁸²

The first aspect we can observe on the timeline is that the *Glorifying Hymnic* starts to become popular between 1803,⁸³ beginning with Beethoven's *Eroica*, and 1842, marked by Mendelssohn's *Scottish Symphony* (although begun in 1829) as well as Helsted's *Symphony No. 1*. The first peak, started in 1842 and lasted until 1847 or 1852, might reflect the events of 1848/49. The interruption of hymnic compositions between 1847 or 1852 and the second half of the sixties possibly points to the disappointment or calming down of the events and the related emotions.

The next peak spans 25 years: it starts in 1864 with Raff's *Jubel-Ouverture* and lasts until 1891 with Arensky's *Dream on the Volga* (this peak might also be mirrored by the peak of the *Majestic Chorale* in the 70s). During that period many events happened that might be related to the expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic*. With respect to liberalization and democratization processes, the end of the Civil War in the United States in 1865, as well as the implementation of parliamentarianism in The Netherlands between 1866 and 1868 have to be mentioned. In many countries, the people were striving for a right to vote. In Spain, this right was granted in 1868, in Germany in 1870. The Fifteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution of 1870 supported Afro-American suffrage; in the United Kingdom, there were electoral reforms in 1867 and 1884. (Of course, the right to vote was everywhere restricted to

⁸² For the role of probability in historical reasoning, see Tucker, *Our Knowledge*, especially chapter 3.

⁸³ It goes without saying that a timeline of the performances of the works would also be extremely interesting but establishing such a timeline would, of course, require an extra study.

Fig. 4: *The Glorifying Hymnic*: timeline

men—but the composers were also men.)

In terms of nation building the end of the German-Danish War in 1864 as well as the German-French War in 1871 were of great importance. 1871 also saw the founding of the German empire and completion of the unification of Italy with the inclusion of Venice and Rome, which had not been a part of the partial unification of 1861. In 1878, Bulgaria, Montenegro, Romania, and Serbia became independent.

Related to nationalism came the expansion of national power by way of imperialism. In 1867, Canada became a British dominion, the US purchased Alaska, and the Austro-Hungarian double monarchy was established. The Fiji Islands became a British crown colony in 1874, and one year later Gabon became French colony. The United Kingdom annexed Transvaal in 1877. In 1878, Austria occupied Bosnia and Herzegovina. Belgium founded the state Congo in 1881, and Bismarck began to support German colonialization in 1884. In 1885, Angola became Portuguese colony and France established the protectorates Annam and Tonking. In the next year, Nigeria became British colony. In 1890, Helgoland became German, the protectorate Witu British. Southern Rhodesia became British colony in 1891, Kenya in 1895. Thus, there was an increase of power and magnitude—aspects that were satirized by the famous political cartoon *The Rhodes Colossus* (illustration 4).

Such events, of which I have only given some examples, might very well have aroused feelings of pride, triumph, victory, power, grandness, and joy.

Illustration 4: *The Rhodes Colossus*, satirizing Cecil John Rhodes and Imperialism
(*Punch, or the London Charivari*, December 10, 1892, taken from archive.org)

IV. Looking Ahead

Some concluding observations may give an idea of how research might proceed from the results of the present study. One starting point might be to look for possible expression types (or, to be more precise, in a first step just for facture types) that are closely related to the two discussed here. It is likely that there are expression types that become discernible by just changing very few features. In that sense, I expect an overlap with two further possible expression types that might be called the *March* and *Fanfare* types. During research some excerpts have been excluded on the basis of the strong presence of staccato rhythm and / or dotted rhythm, very often in combination with loud cymbals and / or snare drums marking at least every first beat of each measure. These features seem to change the character of the melody from folk-song-like to march-like. I predict clear intersections with the expressive qualities of the *Glorifying Hymnic* but also military or martial connotations that might be more specific to this supposed

March type. The end of Smetana's *Triumph Symphony* (1854) is a very good example that also demonstrates the proximity to the *Glorifying Hymnic* since it uses Haydn's "Kaiserhymne" that was set as a hymnic passage in Paganini's *Maestosa Suonata*. Another example would be the quotation of "Was ist des Deutschen Vaterland?" in Raff's *Symphony No. 1* (1861), which uses no percussion as Smetana did but heavily emphasizes dotted and staccato rhythm. The *Glorifying Hymnic* in Tchaikovsky's *Overture on the Danish National Hymn* seems to overlap with the possible *March* type illustrating the fuzziness of their dividing line.

Similarly close to the *Glorifying Hymnic* might be the *Fanfare* type. The difference to the *Glorifying Hymnic* seems to lie in the melodic motion and its interval content. Instead of wave forms the *Fanfare* type is dominated by upward or downward motion constructed from short motives or phrases. Their interval content seems usually to be dominated by triadic formations and it allows larger leaps. The *Fanfare* type probably intersects with the *March* type in that it might include staccato and dotted rhythms. Examples can be found towards the end of Liszt's *Les Préludes* (1854) and César Franck's *Rédemption* (1871).

Another way of getting to closely related expression types is to abolish the high volume criterion: there are chorale-like excerpts in low volume that resemble in many ways the *Majestic Chorale* as conceived here but are quiet and are therefore likely to communicate different expressive qualities. Sometimes the *Majestic Chorale* is foreshadowed by a low-volume chorale as in Fibich's *Komenský* early in the piece. Sometimes it only shows up in a quiet manner as in Reinhold Glière's *Symphony No. 3* (1911). These low-volume chorales are very often "Harmoniemusik"; as opposed to the *Majestic Chorale*, the melody line is apparently not restricted to a single note value. Similarly there are low-volume variants of the *Hymnic*; in Beethoven's *Eroica*, the *Glorifying Hymnic* is introduced by a low-volume variant. A similar passage can be found in Marqués's *Symphony No. 1* (1869).

In addition, some excerpts seemed to be too fast to be included in the corpus. However, it would be necessary to investigate whether they constitute another type and whether their expressive qualities are significantly distinguished from the *Glorifying Hymnic*. Examples are to be found in Michael William Balfe's overture to *The Bohemian Girl* (1843) and in Tchaikovsky's *Nutcracker* (1892). Other excerpts, although apparently very few, are akin to the *Glorifying Hymnic* but have no melody ornamentation as an excerpt in the finale of Raff's *Symphony No. 9* or in Strauss's *Wilhelm von Oranien* (1892).

Another way of expanding the research proceeding from the results of the present study would be to search for historical precursors paving the way for investigating the formation and development of the expression types. J. C. Bach's Piano Concerto op. 1, No. 6 in D major from

1763, which uses “God Save the King!” and Joseph Haydn’s Symphony 26 (*Lamentation*) from 1768 have passages that are akin to the *Glorifying Hymnic*, and Haydn’s work is also similar to the *Majestic Chorale*. It might be instructive to systematically search the 18th century for similar passages.

Partly due to my language skills, partly due to the RIPM periodical selection and partly due to the development of public musical journalism there is a certain Central, Western and Southern, maybe even Northern European bias in the sources that invites complimentary research focusing on Eastern European source material, especially because the religious tradition of the Christian Orthodox Church might have influenced the connotations of the expression types since religious elements play an important role in their expressive qualities. In fact, the exploration of the compositional features of the expression types revealed significantly many mixed or ambiguous cases in Russian music that possibly point to a specifically Russian tradition. In addition to Glazunov’s *A la memoire de Gogol*, which is listed in the table, Mily Balakirev’s *Russia* (1864), Tchaikovsky’s Overture to *The Voyevoda* (1868), his Symphony No. 2 (1872), and *Overture 1812* (1882), Mussorgsky’s *Pictures of an Exhibition* (“The Bogatyr Gates”)—even though Ravel’s well-known instrumentation was produced later than 1914—Glazunov’s *Triumphal March* (1892), his Symphony No. 6, second movement, Variation VII (1896) are excerpts that needed to be investigated in that context.

Finally, the excerpts that clearly belong to the expression type also provide a key for understanding excerpts that deviate from these types while still referring to it in some way. Compositions may allude to the types without realizing it, such allusions could be used to create an effect of disappointment in the listener, or a composer might aim at a caricature or other distortions of an expression type. Such transformations of the expression types will probably much better be interpretable against the backdrop of the respective expression type.

Two examples are worth mentioning. In the final movement of Berlioz’s *Symphony fantastique*, the *Dies irae* melody is played out loudly. It resembles the mixed type of the *Majestic Chorale* and the *Glorifying Hymnic*. However, it shows significant deviations. First, the resemblance only begins with the second part of the melody (bars 422–434). The first part of the melody is polyphonically set against contrapuntal figures in the strings contradicting a basic feature of both expression types. Second, the excerpt is in a minor key and more than a third of its bars uses minor harmony. Third, the melody is played in unison with only the bass instruments indicating the, often incomplete, harmony. One might, not surprisingly, read this as a sinister triumph of the otherworld.

Another example is Tomás Bretón’s Symphony No. 1 (1872) at the end of the second

movement (from bar 163). While the first two bars of the excerpt point to the *Glorifying Hymnic*, the fourth bar brings a harmonic surprise in that after a repetition of the first bar (in the third bar) the harmony is changed from F major to F minor causing a chromatic shift in the melody. This becomes motivic, so to speak, since the excerpt is more determined by harmonic progressions while the melody fails to develop a vocal or even folk-song-like quality. Moreover, the ornamentation in the violins and violas often seems to move to the foreground with much chromaticism. Through these means, the passage gains, as I assume, a much more dramatic and restless character than would be typical for the *Glorifying Hymnic*. This is reflected by the length of the passage stretching over 38 bars in an Andante tempo. The outbreak of the *Glorifying Hymnic* seems to be suppressed by dramatic events.

*

The present study can only be the beginning of an investigation of the expression types of 19th-century symphonic music and historical music psychology as envisaged here. A long-term objective of similar investigations would be to establish something like the expressive vocabulary of that music or a catalogue of expression types and their meanings. This would allow, to some extent, to read the expressive meaning of the music in a historically supported way and also to relate the expression types or their expressive qualities to historical events. It is to be expected that the more expression types have been reconstructed the better they will be understood since they will probably comment each other.

To be sure, such an expressive vocabulary of 19th-century music could only record excerpts that can be related to some type but this would be quite an important step for two reasons: first, there are probably many expression types unfolding a broad spectrum of expressive qualities (examples might be the *Shocking*, the *Joyous*, the *Uncanny*, the *Melancholic*, the *Aggressive*, the *Resolute* etc.); second, the expression types might shed light on excerpts that do not belong to any type but have a certain similarity to a type or that can be interpreted as a mixture of specific types and so on. The reconstruction will be like a jigsaw puzzle, but the present study hopefully demonstrates the potential of this method for a historical music psychology.

Works Cited

- Amaouche-Antoine, Marie-Dominique. "Les sociétés musicales dans les villages de l'Aude durant la deuxième moitié du XIXe siècle." *Annales du Midi* (1981): 443–50.
- Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, revised and extended ed., London: Verso, 1991.
- Anonymous. *Gedenkbuch des in der Stadt Nürnberg 1861 begangenen Großen Deutschen Sängerfestes*. Nuremberg: I. Zeiser, 1861.
- Angerer, Manfred. "Liszts 'Hunnenschlacht' und die Aporien der symphonischen Dichtung." *Studien zur Musikwissenschaft* 38 (1987): 117–34.
- Applegate, Celia. "The Building of Community through Choral Singing." In *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*, edited by Donna M. di Grazia, 3–20. New York: Routledge, 2013.
- Barzen, Johanna, Uwe Breitenbücher, Linus Eusterbrock, Michael Falkenthal, Frank Hentschel and Frank Leymann. "The vision for MUSE4Music Applying the MUSE method in musicology." *Computer Science: Research and Development* 32 (2017), DOI 10.1007/s00450-016-0336-1, <http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s00450-016-0336-1>
- Bense, Lieselotte. "Händels Anthems für die Krönung Georgs II. und seiner Gemahlin Königin Caroline in der Westminster-Abtei am 11. Oktober 1727." *Händel-Jahrbuch* 49 (2003): 307–26.
- Bertagnolli, Paul A. "Hungary." In Grazia, *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*: 402–9.
- Betz, Marianne. "„Frisch gesungen...“: Zur Geschichte des Männerchorwesens im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert." In *Beiträge zu Kunst und Kultur* 4 (2011): 11–17.
- Bohlin, Folke. "Deutsche Einflüsse auf das Chorsingen in Schweden im 19. Jahrhundert." In *Musica Baltica: Interregionale musikkulturelle Beziehungen im Ostseeraum*, edited by Ekkehard Ochs, Nico Schüler and Lutz Winkler, 46–51. Sankt Augustin: Academia, 1996.
- Bonds, Mark Evan. "The Symphony as Pindaric Ode." In *Haydn and His World*, edited by Elaine Sisman, 131–51. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1997.
- Boresch, Hans-Werner. "Das „köstlichste vaterländische Gut“: Der protestantische Choral als deutsches Nationalsymbol im 19. Jahrhundert." *Symbolon*. Neue Folge 16 (2007): 161–98.
- Bouton, Jean-Daniel. "Les sociétés musicales et le mouvement orphéonique en Moselle de 1854 à 1871." In *À quatre temps: La musique en Moselle des origines à nos jours*, edited by Marion Duvigneau, 143–51. Saint-Julien-lès-Metz: Conseil général de la Moselle. Archives départementales de La Moselle, 2002.
- Breitsameter, Sabine. "Der Bürger als Dilettant: Ideengrundlagen der Chorbewegung zu Beginn des 19. Jahrhunderts." In *Singen im Chor ist mehr: Peter Schwarz und die Berliner Cappella*, edited by Walter Ederer and Joachim Przytarski, 38–46. Berlin: Berliner Capella, 1985.
- Brudzyńska-Němec, Gabriela. "Polenbegeisterung in Deutschland nach 1830." In *Europäische Geschichte Online (EGO)*, edited by the Institut für Europäische Geschichte (IEG). Mainz, 2010-12-03. URL: <http://www.ieg-ego.eu/brudzynskanemecg-2010-de> URN: urn:nbn:de:0159-20100921148 [2017-11-01].
- Brusniak, Friedhelm. "Männerchorwesen und Konfession von 1800 bis in den Vormärz." In *Heil deutschem Wort und Sang! Nationalidentität und Gesangskultur in der deutschen Geschichte*, edited by Friedhelm Brusniak and Dietmar Klenke, 123–40. Augsburg: Wissner, 1995.
- Brusiniak, Friedhelm. "Nationalbewegung und Sängerstolz. Das erste deutsche Sängerfest in Würzburg 1845." In *Musikpflege und Musikwissenschaft in Würzburg um 1800*.

- Symposiumsbericht Würzburg 1997*, edited by Ulrich Konrad, 37–48. Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1998.
- Brusniak, Friedhelm. "Nationalreligiosität in der Sängerbewegung des 19. Jahrhunderts. Das 5. Liederfest des Thüringer Sängerbundes in Eisenach 1847." In *Musikgeschichte zwischen Ost- und Westeuropa. Kirchenmusik – geistliche Musik – religiöse Musik*, edited by Helmut Loos and Klaus-Peter Koch, 83–98. Sinzig: studio, 2002.
- Brusniak, Friedhelm. "Musik- und Gesangsfeste – Klassifizierungsversuche und Kritik im 19. Jahrhundert." In Loeser and Werbeck, *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum*: 71–88.
- Brusniak, Friedhelm and Dietmar Klenke. "Sängerfeste und die Musikpolitik der deutschen Nationalbewegung." *Die Musikforschung* 52 (1999): 29–54.
- Busch, Hermann J. "„Gesangsfeste‘ zwischen 1845 und 1871 im Spiegel der Zeitschrift ‚Euterpe‘." In „*Ich will aber gerade vom Leben singen...*“ *Über populäre Musik vom ausgehenden 19. Jahrhundert bis zum Ende der Weimarer Republik*, edited by Sabine Schutte, 60–85. Reinbek: Rowohlt, 1987.
- Butz, Alexander. "Musikfeste und die Entwicklung chorisch-orchestraler Musik im 19. Jahrhundert." In Loeser and Werbeck, *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum*: 53–69.
- Charon, Arnaud. "Une chorale à Bruxelles: La Société Royale l'Orphéon." *Tijdschrift voor stadsgeschiedenis / Cahiers bruxellois: Revue d'histoire urbaine* 45 (2013): 229–50.
- Clark, Walter A. "The Philippines, Latin America, And Spain." In Grazia, *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*: 449–71.
- Duarte, Ángel. "Republicanism y canto coral en el Reus de finales del siglo XIX." *Bulletin d'histoire contemporaine de l'Espagne* 20 (1994): 94–109.
- Düding, Dieter. "Nationale Oppositionsfeste der Turner, Sänger und Schützen im 19. Jahrhundert." In *Öffentliche Festkultur. Politische Feste in Deutschland von der Aufklärung bis zum Ersten Weltkrieg*, edited by Dieter Düding, Peter Friedemann and Paul Münch, 166–90. Reinbek: Rowohlt, 1988.
- Eichner, Barbara. *History in Mighty Sounds: Musical Constructions of German National Identity 1848-1914*. Woodbridge: 2012
- Erk, Ludwig. *Deutscher Liederhort*. Berlin: Enslin, 1856.
- Escoffier, Georges. "L'orphéon du Velay: Une œuvre 'civilisatrice' – 1855–1879." In *La musique dans le Midi de la France. II: XIXe siècle*, edited by François Lesure, 225–67. Paris: Klincksieck, 1997.
- Escoffier, Georges. "L'orphéon. La mise en musique de l'utopie au cœur de la révolution industrielle." In *Musique et société*, edited by Laurent Bayle, 69–81. Paris: Cité de La Musique, 2004.
- Fallersleben, Hoffmann von. *Gaudeamus igitur. Eine Studie nebst einem Sendschreiben und Carmen an Denselben von Gustav Schwetschke*, Halle: G. Schwetschke'scher Verlag, 1872.
- Fellerer, Karl Gustav. "Das deutsche Chorlied im 19. Jahrhundert." In *Gattungen der Musik in Einzeldarstellungen: Gedenkschrift Leo Schrade*, edited by Wulf Arlt, Ernst Lichtenhahn and Hans Oesch, 785–812. Bern: Francke, 1973.
- Fiedler-Barth, Walter. "'Les montagnards, halte-là! Les montagnards sont là!' Kleiner Beitrag zur frühen Sängerbewegung in Franken." *Mainfränkisches Jahrbuch für Geschichte und Kunst* 47 (1995): 217–24.
- Fischer, Michael. *Religion, Nation, Krieg. Der Lutherchoral 'Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott' zwischen Befreiungskriegen und Erstem Weltkrieg*. Münster and New York: Waxmann, 2014.
- Floros, Constantin. *Gustav Mahler*, vol. 3: *Die Symphonien*, Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1985.
- Floros, Constantin. *Hören und Verstehen. Die Sprache der Musik und ihre Deutung*, Mainz: Schott Musik, 2008.

- Garrat, James. *Music, Culture and Social Reform in the Age of Wagner*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- Garrat, James. "Britain and Ireland." In Grazia, *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*: 335–67.
- Garrido, Tomás. "Música coral en castellano en el tránsito del siglo XVIII al XIX: Del Españolito a Barbieri." *Nassarre: Revista aragonesa de musicología* 17 (2001): 155–80.
- Gelbart, Matthew. "Nation, Folk, and Music History in the Finale of Brahms's First Symphony." *Nineteenth Century Studies* 23 (2009): 57–85.
- Gerbod, Paul. "L'institution orphéonique en France du XIX au XX siècle." *Ethnologie française*, nouvelle serie 10 (1980): 27–44.
- Glaner, Birgit. "Nationalhymnen, II.1." *MGG Online*, edited by Laurenz Lütteken, Kassel, Stuttgart, New York: Bärenreiter, 2016sq., <https://mgg-online.com/article?id=mgg15806&v=1.0&rs=id-3d58bfbb-0105-9d73-ef14-056410f7eef2>. [November 20th 2017].
- Grazia, Donna di, ed. *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*. New York: Routledge, 2013.
- Gruhn, Tilman. "Bürgerliches Musikfest oder oppositionelle Kundgebung? Das deutsch-flämische Sängerfest 1846 in Köln." *Geschichte in Köln* 54 (2007): 127–51.
- Gumplowicz, Philippe. "Le dossier 'orphéon': Musique et sociabilités." In *Révoltes logiques, Esthétiques du peuple*. Paris: La Découverte, 1985: 55–76.
- Gutknecht, Dieter. "Einige Bemerkungen zur Rolle des Chores bei den Niederrheinischen Musikfesten im 19. Jahrhundert." In *Zborovska glasba i pevsko društva ter njihov pomen v razvoju nacionalnih glasbenih kultur / Choral music and choral societies, and their role in the development of the national musical cultures*, edited by Primož Kuret, 171–79. Ljubljana: Festival Ljubljana, 2004.
- Hahn, Hans-Werner. "Die 'Sängerrepublik' unter der Wartburg. Das Liederfest des Thüringer Sängerbundes in Eisenach im August 1847 als Beitrag zur kulturellen Nationsbildung." In *Bürgerkultur im 19. Jahrhundert. Lothar Gall zum 60 Geburtstag*, edited by Dieter Hein und Andreas Schulz, 191–211. Munich: C.H. Beck, 1996.
- Heller, Karl. "Die Mecklenburgischen Musikfeste." In Loeser and Werbeck, *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum*, 151–70.
- Hentschel, Frank. "Expressive Qualität und historische Semantik bei Beethoven." *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 70 (2013): 161–90.
- Henze-Döhring, Sabine. "Händels Coronation Anthems." *Händel-Jahrbuch* 49 (2003): 105–13.
- Herresthal, Harald. "The Nordic World. Scandinavia and Finland." In Grazia, *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*: 368–78.
- Hobsbawm, Eric. *Nations and Nationalism Since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality*. 2nd ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Horn, Katelyn and David Huron. "On the Changing Use of the Major and Minor Modes 1750–1900." *MTO, a Journal of the Society for Music Theory* 21 (2015), http://www.mtosmt.org/issues/mto.15.21.1/mto.15.21.1.horn_huron.pdf.
- Ickstadt, Andreas. *Aspekte der Melancholie bei Johannes Brahms*, Würzburg: Königshausen und Neumann, 2015.
- Illner, Eberhard, ed. „Das Gold der Kehlen.“ *150 Jahre Kölner Männer-Gesang-Verein, Katalog zur Ausstellung*. Cologne: Historisches Archiv, 1992.
- Johnson-Laird, P. N. and Keith Oatly. "The language of emotions: An analysis of a semantic field." *Cognition & Emotion* 3 (1989): 81–123.
- Juslin, Patrik and John Sloboda (eds.). *Music and Emotion: Theory, Research, Applications*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.

- Katz, Derek. "A Turk and A Moravian in Prague. Janáček's Brouček and the Perils of Musical Patriotism." In *Janaček and His World*, edited by Michael Beckerman, 145–64. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- Keym, Stefan. "Vom Patriotismus zum Pantheismus: Die ‚per aspera ad astra‘-Dramaturgie in der polnischen Symphonik um 1900 am Beispiel von Noskowski, Paderewski und Karłowicz." In *Musikgeschichte in Mittel- und Osteuropa. Mitteilungen der internationalen Arbeitsgemeinschaft an der Universität Leipzig 12*, 237–267. Leipzig: Gudrun Schröder, 2008.
- Keym, Stefan. "Vom 'revolutionären Te Deum' zur 'Marseiller Hymne der Reformation.' Politische und religiöse Liedzitate in der Instrumentalmusik des 19. Jahrhunderts," *Die Musikforschung* 65 (2012): 338–67.
- Kim, Jin-Ah and Bert Hagels (ed.). *Symphonie-Rezeption in deutschsprachigen Periodika von 1798-1850 : eine Quellensammlung in drei Bänden*. Berlin: Ries und Erler, 2017.
- Klenke, Dietmar. "Bürgerlicher Männergesang und Politik in Deutschland, Teil 1." In *Geschichte in Wissenschaft und Unterricht* 40 (1989): 458–85.
- Klenke, Dietmar. "Ein ‚Schwur für's deutsche Vaterland‘. Zum Nationalismus der deutschen Sängerbewegung zwischen Paulskirchenparlament und Reichsgründung." In *Liberalismus, Parlamentarismus und Demokratie. Festschrift für Manfred Botzenhart zum 60. Geburtstag*, edited by Michael Epkenhaus, 67–107. Göttingen: Cuvillier, 1994.
- Klenke, Dietmar. "Nationalkriegerisches Gemeinschaftsideal als politische Religion: Zum Vereinsnationalismus der Sänger, Schützen und Turner am Vorabend der Einigungskriege." *Historische Zeitschrift* 260 (1995): 395–448.
- Klenke, Dietmar. "Das nationalheroische Charisma der deutschen Sängerfeste am Vorabend der Einigungskriege." In *Heil deutschem Wort und Sang! Nationalidentität und Gesangskultur in der deutschen Geschichte*, edited by Friedhelm Brusniak and Dietmar Klenke, 141–96. Augsburg: Wissner, 1995.
- Klenke, Dietmar. "Deutsche Sängerfeste des 19. Jahrhunderts im Spiegel der Medienwelt – politische Funktionalität oder Gesangsästhetik?" In Loeser and Werbeck, *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum*: 9–39.
- Koldau, Linda Maria. "Träger nationaler Gesinnung: Luther-Oratorien im 19. Jahrhundert." In *Musik zwischen ästhetischer Interpretation und soziologischem Verständnis*, edited Tatjana Böhme-Mehner and Motje Wolf, 55–84. Essen: Die blaue Eule, 2006.
- Konečni, Vladimir J. "Does Music Induce Emotion? A Theoretical and Methodological Analysis." *Psychology of Aesthetics, Creativity, and the Arts* 2 (2008): 115–29.
- Konstantinou, Evangelos. "Griechenlandbegeisterung und Philhellenismus." In *Europäische Geschichte Online (EGO)*, edited by the Institut für Europäische Geschichte (IEG). Mainz, 2012-10-22. URL: <http://www.ieg-ego.eu/konstantinoue-2012-de> URN: urn:nbn:de:0159-2012102202 [2017-11-01].
- Küsgens, Philipp. *Horizonte nationaler Musik: Musiziergesellschaften in Süddeutschland und der Deutschschweiz 1847–1891*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2012.
- Lappalainen, Seija. "Gesang- und Musikfeste in Finnland seit 1884. Kulturelle und politische Aspekte." In Loeser and Werbeck, *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum*: 237-52.
- Leese, Matthew William. *British influence on New Zealand choral traditions: A study of the relationship between choral festivals and societies in the United Kingdom and in New Zealand, with focus on New Zealand's high school festival 'The Big Sing'*, PhD diss., University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign, 2012.
- Lengová, Jana. "Die Slowakische Chorbewegung in der zweiten Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts." In *Zborovska glasba i pevna društva ter njihov pomen v razvoju nacionalnih glasbenih kultur / Choral music and choral societies, and their role in the development of the national musical cultures*, edited by Primož Kuret, 233–9. Ljubljana: Festival Ljubljana, 2004.

- Loeser, Martin. "Musikgeschichte und Vergleich: Neue Einblicke in alte Themen? Die Anfänge des französischen und deutschen Laienchorwesens im 19. Jahrhundert aus der Perspektive von historischem Vergleich und Kulturtransfer." In *Musik mit Methode: Neue kulturwissenschaftliche Perspektiven*, edited by Corinna Herr and Monika Woitas, 157–173, Cologne, Weimar and Vienna: Böhlau, 2006.
- Loeser, Martin and Walter Werbeck, ed. *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum im späten 19. und frühen 20. Jahrhundert – Rezeption und Kulturtransfer, Intentionen und Inszenierungsformen*. Berlin: Frank und Timme, 2014.
- Loos, Helmut. "Deutsche Männergesangsvereine im Ostseeraum und der Anfang der lettischen Singbewegung." In Loeser and Werbeck, *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum*: 221–35.
- Lütteken, Laurenz. "Die Apotheose des Chorals. Zum Kontext eines kompositionsgeschichtlichen Problems bei Brahms und Bruckner." *Colloquia Academica. Akademievorträge junger Wissenschaftler G*: Stuttgart: Franz Steiner, 1997: 7–38.
- McWhirter, Christian. *Battle Hymns: The Power and Popularity of Music in the Civil War*, Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2012.
- Markovič, Tatjana. "The specific nature of the activities of choral societies in a multi-ethnic context: A case study of Serbian choral societies in Banat (Pančevo and Veliki Bečkerek) in the 19th century." *New sound: International magazine for music* 28 (2006): 1–16.
- Markovič, Tatjana. "Serbian (musical) national identity: from international to the national concept." In *Music and the Construction of National Identities in the 19th Century*, edited by Beat A. Föllmi, 195–207. Baden-Baden: Koerner, 2010.
- Merrick, W. Percy. *Folk-Songs from Sussex*. London: Novello & Co., n.d.
- Milewski, Barbara. "Poland." In Grazia, *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*: 383–6.
- Minor, Ryan. *Choral Fantasies: Music, Festivity and Nationhood in Nineteenth-Century Germany*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Minor, Ryan. "Choral Music and Choral Singing in Germany and Austria." In Grazia, *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*: 115–25.
- Mirka, Danuta (ed.). *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Mohn, Barbara. "Musikfeste in Großbritannien – Vorreiter und Vorbild?" In *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum im späten 19. und frühen 20. Jahrhundert – Rezeption und Kulturtransfer, Intentionen und Inszenierungsformen*, edited by Martin Loeser and Walter Werbeck, 89–99. Berlin: Frank und Timme, 2014.
- Morel Borotra, Natalie. "Lieux et pratiques musicales à Bayonne: 1841–1914." In *La musique dans le Midi de la France*, vol. 2: *XIX^e siècle*, edited by François Lesure, 153–84. Paris: Klincksieck, 1997.
- Müller, Bertram. *Anton Bruckners Fünfte Symphonie: Rezeption, Form-, Struktur- und Inhaltsanalyse*. München: Katzbichler, 2002.
- Müller, Sven Oliver. *Das Publikum macht die Musik. Musikleben in Berlin, London und Wien im 19. Jahrhundert*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht, 2014.
- Nagore Ferrer, María. "Orígenes del movimiento coral en Bilbao en el siglo XIX." *Revista de musicología* 14 (1991): 125–34.
- Nagore Ferrer, María. "La música coral en España en el siglo XIX." In *La música española en el siglo XIX*, edited by Emilio Casares Rodicio and Celsa Alonso Gonzalez, 425–62. Oviedo: Universidad de Oviedo, 1995.
- Nagore Ferrer, María. "Un aspecto di asociacionismo musical en el España: las sociedades corales." *Cuadernos de Música Iberoamericana* 8–9 (2001): 211–25.
- Niemöller, Klaus Wolfgang. "Das Sängerfest des Deutsch-flämischen Sängerbundes 1846 in Köln unter Leitung von Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy und Franz Weber."

- Arbeitsgemeinschaft für Rheinische Musikgeschichte. Mitteilungen* 96 (August 2016): 15–36.
- Orr, N. Lee. "The United States." In Grazia, *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*: 475–99.
- Osterhammel, Jürgen. *Die Verwandlung der Welt. Eine Geschichte des 19. Jahrhunderts*. 5th ed. München: C.H. Beck, 2011.
- Pascall, Robert. "Johannes Brahms und Charles Villiers Stanford: Der Briefwechsel." *Brahms-Studien* 17 (2014): 97–111.
- Porter, Cecilia Hopkins. "The New Public and the Reordering of the Musical Establishment: The Lower Rhine Music Festivals, 1818–67." *19th-Century Music* 3 (1979/1980): 211–24.
- Raabe, Gerson. "Die Erscheinung des Heiligen in B-Dur. Eine Deutung von Anton Bruckners 5. Symphonie." In *Protestantismus zwischen Aufklärung und Moderne. Festschrift für Ulrich Barth*, edited by Roderich Barth, Claus-Dieter Osthöven and Arnulf von Scheliha, 327–46. Frankfurt a. M.: Peter Lang, 2005.
- Rapport, Mike. *1848. Year of Revolution*. London: Abacus, 2008.
- Reichardt, Johann F. *Vertraute Briefe aus Paris 1802/03*, edited by Rolf Weber. Berlin: Verlag der Nation, 1981.
- Richter, Carl Ludwig. *Zdenko Fibich. Eine musikalische Silhouette*. Prag: Fr. A. Urbanek, 1900.
- Riethmüller, Albrecht. "Wagner, Brahms und die Akademische Fest-Ouvertüre." *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 61 (2004): 79–105.
- Rolland, Eugène. *Recueil de Chansons Populaires*. Paris: without publisher, 1887.
- Rotter-Broman, Signe. "Die Schleswig-Holsteinischen Musikfeste 1875–1910." In Loeser and Werbeck, *Musikfeste im Ostseeraum*: 131–50.
- Rowden, Clair. "Choral music and music-making in France," In Grazia, *Nineteenth-Century Choral Music*: 205–212.
- Sancho García, Manuel. "Orfeonismo y canto coral en Valencia (1850–1910)." *Revista de musicología* 30/1 (2007): 103–26.
- Scheer, Monique. "Are Emotions a Kind of Practice (and Is That What Makes Them Have a History)? A Bourdieuan Approach to Understanding Emotion." *History and Theory* 51 (2012): 193–220.
- Schellenberg, Glenn E. and Christian von Scheve. "Emotional Cues in American Popular Music: Five Decades of the Top 40." *Psychology of Aesthetics, Creativity, and the Arts* 6 (2012): 196–203.
- Schmidt, John C. *The life and works of John Knowles Paine*. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research Press, 1980.
- Schmidt-Funke, Julia A. "Die 1830er Revolution als europäisches Medienereignis." In *Europäische Geschichte Online (EGO)*, edited by the Institut für Europäische Geschichte (IEG). Mainz, 2011-02-23. URL: <http://www.ieg-ego.eu/schmidtfunkej-2011-de> URN: urn:nbn:de:0159-2011020106 [2017-11-01].
- Serwer, Howard J. "Handel Commemoration: 1684(?)–1784–1984." *Handel studies: A Gedenkschrift for Howard Serwer*, edited by Richard G. King, 231–35. Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press, 2009.
- Silber, Judith. "Mendelssohn and His Reformation Symphony." *JAMS* 40 (1987): 310–336.
- Sipe, Thomas. *Beethoven: The 'Eroica' Symphony*. Cambridge, New York and Melbourne: Vambridge University Press 2003.
- Soullier, Charles. *Nouveau Dictionnaire de Musique Illustré*, Paris: E. Bazault, 1855.
- Stalla, Bernhard Josef. "Die Comeniusfeier zum dreihundertsten Geburtstag in München im Jahr 1892." Comenius Expertenforum, <http://www.comenius-expertenforum.de/comenius-expertenforum/comeniusfeier/> [November 16th 2017].
- Steinbeck, Wolfram. *Die Symphonie im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert*, vol. 1: *Romantische und nationale Symphonik*, Laaber: Laaber Verlag, 2002.

- Tyrell, John. *Czech Opera*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Tucker, Aviezer. *Our Knowledge of the Past. A Philosophy of Historiography*. Cambridge et al.: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Vaughan Williams, Ralph. *English Folk Songs*. London: The English Folk Dance Society, without year.
- Wagner, Günter. “Die Gutenbergfeiern 1837 und 1840 als musikgeschichtliche Ereignisse.” *Mitteilungen der Arbeitsgemeinschaft für mittelhheinische Musikgeschichte* 46 (1983): 230–49.
- Wald-Fuhrmann, Melanie. “*Ein Mittel wider sich selbst*”: *Melancholie in der Instrumentalmusik um 1800*. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2010.
- Weber, Max. “Die ‘Objektivität’ sozialwissenschaftlicher und sozialpolitischer Erkenntnis.” In *Gesammelte Aufsätze zur Wissenschaftslehre*. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1922:146–214.
- Wehler, Hans-Ulrich. *Nationalismus. Geschichte, Formen, Folgen*. München: C.H. Beck, 2001.
- Weinzierl, Stefan. *Beethovens Konzerträume: Raumakustik und symphonische Aufführungspraxis an der Schwelle zum modernen Konzertwesen*. Frankfurt a. M.: Bochinsky, 2002.
- Yasnitsky, Anton, René van der Veer, and Michel Ferrari (eds.). *The Cambridge Handbook of Cultural-Historical Psychology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.

Appendix 1: The Excerpts (in alphabetical order)

Since most accessible scores do not number the measures of the work, I will specify the passage in the most convenient way in each individual case.

- Alfvén, Hugo. Symphony No. 2 in D major op. 11, Finale, 4th mvt., second part: Fuga, “Canto fermo”, mm. 1–43 after figure 7 (1898)
- Arensky, Anton Stepanovich. Overture to *Dream on the Volga*, “Maestoso”, mm. 18–1 before the end (1891)
- Beethoven, Ludwig van. Symphony No. 3 in E-flat major op. 55, *Eroica*, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 381–96 (1803)
- Beethoven, Ludwig van. Symphony No. 6 in F major op. 68, *Pastoral Symphony*, Finale, 5th mvt., mm. 25–35 (1808)
- Beethoven, Ludwig van. Symphony No. 9 in d minor op. 125, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 543–90 (1824)
- Benedict, Julius. Symphony in g minor op. 101, Scherzo, 3rd mvt., mm. 44–64 after the beginning of the “misterioso” section / mm. 1–21 after rehearsal letter F (1874)
- Benoît, Peter. Overture to *Charlotte Corday*, “Maestoso ben sostenuto” until mm. 8 before the end (1876)
- Berlioz, Hector. Overture to *Benvenuto Cellini*, “un peu retenu”, mm. 401–27 (1838)
- Brahms, Johannes. *Variations on a Theme by Haydn* op. 56, mm. 444–57
- Brahms, Johannes. Symphony No. 1 in c minor op. 68, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 407–16 (1876)
- Brahms, Johannes. *Academic Festival Overture* in c minor op. 80, “Maestoso,” mm. 479–95 (1880)
- Bristow, George Frederick. Symphony No. 2, *Jullien*, Finale, 4th mvt., “Grandioso. L’istesso tempo,” mm. 406–22 (1854)
- Bruckner, Anton. Symphony No. 5 in B-flat major, Finale, 4th mvt., “Choral,” mm. 583–623 (1878 version) (1876)
- Cliffe, Frederic. Symphony 1, Finale, 4th mvt., “Andante maestoso,” mm. 7 after rehearsal letter R through m. 10 after rehearsal letter W (= mm. 27–4 before the end) (1889)
- Donizetti, Gaetano. Overture to *La favorite*, beginning of the C-major-section, mm. 64–45 before the end (1843)
- Dukas, Paul. *A Goetz de Berlichingen. Overture*. “Plus largement. Très soutenu,” mm. 342–51 (1883)
- Fibich, Zdeněk. *Komenský. Festive Overture* in D minor op. 34, “Quasi presto”, mm. 337–67 (1892)
- Flotow, Friedrich von. Overture to *Alessandro Stradella*, Più lento e maestoso, mm. 273–90 (1844)
- Flotow, Friedrich von. Overture to *Martha*, “Larghetto”, mm. 22–16 before the end (1847)
- Glazunov, Alexander. *The Kremlin* op. 30, “Maestoso,” mm. 1 after rehearsal letter R through m. 1 after rehearsal letter U (= mm 53–29 before the end) (1890)
- Glazunov, Alexander. *A la mémoire de Gogol. Prologue symphonique pour orchestre* op. 87, mm. 53-18 before the end (1909)
- Grieg, Edvard. Piano Concerto, Finale, 3rd mvt., “Andante maestoso”, mm. 422–40 (1869)
- Kalinnikov, Vasily. Symphony No. 2, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 3 after rehearsal letter U through m. 11 after rehearsal letter V (= mm. 66–46 ahead of the end) (1897)
- Karłowicz, Mieczysław. Symphony in e minor, *Rebirth*, Finale, 4th mvt., “Molto meno mosso, trionfante”, mm. 254–60 (1909)
- Kuhlau, Friedrich. Overture to *Elverhøy*, “meno Allegro”, mm. 52–33 before the end, 1828
- Litolff, Henry. Concerto symphonique No. 3, *Concert national hollandais*, Finale, 4th mvt., “pesante, grandioso,” mm. 13-47 after rehearsal letter A (1846)

- Liszt, Franz. *Battle of the Huns. Symphonic Poem No. 11*, from the rehearsal letter Q to one m. before S (= mm. 66–40 before the end) (1857)
- Mahler, Gustav. Symphony No. 1, *Titan*, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 679–95 (1888)
- Mahler, Gustav. Symphony No. 5, Finale, 5th mvt., “Pesante (etwas gehalten),” mm. 730–47 (1902)
- Marqués, Miguel. Symphony No. 1 in B-flat major, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 210–7 (1869)
- Marqués, Miguel. Symphony No. 2 in E-flat major, 1st mvt., mm. 254–68 (a) and mm. 268–75 (b) (1870)
- Massenet, Jules. *Esclarmonde* Suite, 1st mvt., 5 mm. before rehearsal number 14 until the end (1889)
- Mendelssohn, Felix. Symphony No. 5 in d minor op. 107, *Reformation Symphony*, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 306–26 (1830)
- Mendelssohn, Felix. Symphony No. 3 in a minor, *Scottish*, Finale, 4th mvt., “Allgro maestoso assai”, mm. 396–431 (1842)
- Mielck, Ernst. Symphony, Finale, 4th mvt., last 39 mm. (1897)
- Nielsen, Ludolf. Symphony No. 3 in C major op. 32, 1st mvt., “Maestoso”, mm. 24–08 before the end / figure 25 through 5 mm. after figure 26 (excerpt I) (1914)
- Nielsen, Ludolf. Symphony No. 3 in C major op. 32, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 22–16 before the end / mm. 1–7 after figure 26 (excerpt II) (1914)
- Paganini, Niccolò. *Maestosa sonata sentimentale*, Var. IV, “Allegro vivace”, mm. 223–39 (1828)
- Parry, Hubert. *Symphonic Variations*, 1m. after rehearsal letter 27A until 1 m. after 27b (= mm. 27–15 before the end) (1897)
- Raff, Joachim. Jubel-Ouverture, mm. 89–26 before the end (1864)
- Raff, Joachim. Symphony No. 9, 1st mvt., mm. 1–30 after rehearsal letter Q (1880)
- Rheinberger, Josef. Symphony No. 1, *Wallenstein*, 1st mvt., “Maestoso”, mm. 36–21 before the end) (1866)
- Rott, Hans. Symphony, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 439–62 (1880)
- Rubinstein, Anton. Symphony No. 2, *Océan*, Finale (4th or 7th mvt. respectively, depending on version), “Meno mosso”, mm. 66–20 mm. before the end (1851; first version)
- Rubinstein, Anton. *Eroica Fantasy*, mm. 200–180 before the end (1884)
- Saint-Saëns, Camille. Piano Concerto No. 1, Finale, 3rd mvt., m. 17 after rehearsal letter J through m. 15 after rehearsal letter K (= mm. 105–83 before the end) (1858)
- Saint-Saëns, Camille. Piano Concerto No. 4, Finale, 2nd mvt., mm. 1–16 after rehearsal letter Af (1875)
- Saint-Saëns, Camille. Violin Concerto No. 3, Finale, 3rd mvt., mm. 42–56 after rehearsal letter H (= until 22 mm. before rehearsal letter I) (1880)
- Saint-Saëns, Camille. Symphony No. 3 in c minor op. 78, Finale, 2nd movement, *Organ Symphony*, mm. 519–29 (1886)
- Scriabin, Alexander. Symphony No. 1 in E major, Finale, 6th mvt., mm. 24–14 (1900)
- Sibelius, Jean. Symphony No. 2 in D major op. 43, Finale, 4th mvt., mm. 221–33 (a) and mm. 356–73 (end) (1902)
- Smetana, Bedřich. *Vltava*, mm. 359–74 (1874)
- Stanford, Charles Villiers. Symphony No. 3 in f minor op. 28, *Irish*, m. 2 after P through m. 1 after R (mm. 62–23 before the end)
- Strauss, Richard. *Don Juan*, mm. 1 after Y through m. 7 after Z (1888)
- Suk, Josef. *Praga* in E-flat major op. 26, “Tempo I (ma molto largamente, maestoso e molto marcato)”, mm. 1–12 after figure 65 (1904)
- Tchaikovsky, Pyotr Ilyich. *Festival Overture on the Danish National Anthem*, “Meno mosso, maestoso” up to “Tempo primo (Allegro risoluto)” (1866)
- Tchaikovsky, Pyotr Ilyich. *The Tempest*, “Andante alla breve”, mm. 121–9 (1873)

- Tchaikovsky, Pyotr Ilyich. Symphony No. 3, Finale, 5th mvt., “Meno mosso”, mm. 255–74 (1875)
- Tchaikovsky, Pyotr Ilyich. *Swan Lake*, Finale, “Alla breve. Moderato e maestoso,” mm. 93–157 (1877)
- Tchaikovsky, Pyotr Ilyich. Symphony No. 5, Finale, 4th mvt., “Moderato assai e molto maestoso,” mm. 474–89 (1888)
- Vieuxtemps, Henri. *Greeting to America* op. 56, mm. 28–12 before the end (1844)
- Wagner, Richard. Overture to *Tannhäuser*, mm. 38–54 (1845)
- Weber, Carl Maria von. *Jubel-Ouvertüre zur 50jährigen Feier des Regierungsantritts König Friedrich Augusts I. von Sachsen am 20. September 1818* op. 59, “Andante”, mm. 356–69 (1818)

Appendix 2: The Features

		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	
Source (= excerpt from)	Year	<u>Dyn- amics</u>	<u>Key / mainly major chords</u>	<u>Mod- erate tempo</u>	<u>Vocal character of interval content</u>	<u>Synco- pation in melody</u>	<u>Formal aspects:</u> <u>repetition</u> // <u>juxtaposition</u>	<u>Rhythm:</u> <i>mainly one note value</i>	<u>Harmonic density</u> <i>(high, medium, low)</i>	Melody ornamen- tation ⁸⁴	Melody motion: arch (a) wave (b) one-dir. (c)	Tran- sition formu- las	Epi- sodes	Harmony (simple, medium, complex)	Domi- nated by brass	Domi- nated by strings	Cym- bals or drums	Dramaturgical position	Notes

The Majestic Chorale

Mendelssohn, <i>Reformation Symphony</i>	1830	ff / f	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	no // yes	yes	medium -	no	a/b	no	no	simple	(no)	no	no	end	Quotation: “Ein feste Burg”
Rubinstein, <i>Symphony 2</i>	1851	ff	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	no // yes	yes	high	yes (x)	c	no	(yes)	complex -	yes	no	no	end	
Liszt, <i>Battle of the Huns</i>	1857	ff	C major / yes	(yes)	yes	(yes)	no // yes	(yes)	medium -	(no)	(b)/a	no	yes	medium	yes	no	(yes)	towards the end	Quotation: “Crux fidelis”
Marqués, <i>Symphony 2 (b)</i>	1870	ff	E♭ major / no	yes	yes	no	yes // no	yes	high	yes (2,3)	c	yes	no	medium -	yes	no	no	end / first mvt.	
Tchaikovsky, <i>The Tempest</i>	1873	ff	E major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	yes // yes	(yes)	high	no	(c)	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	middle	
Tchaikovsky, <i>Symphony 3 (b)</i>	1875	fff	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	no // -	yes	high	yes (1,3)	a	no	no	simple +	yes	no	no	before final stretta	
Brahms, <i>Symphony 1</i>	1876	ff	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	no // -	no	high	no	b	no	no	complex	yes	no	no	before final stretta	
Bruckner, <i>Symphony 5</i>	1876	fff	B♭ major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	yes // yes	(yes)	high	yes (1,3)	b/c	no	yes	complex -	yes	no	no	end	Score: “Choral”
Fibich, <i>Komenský</i>	1892	ff	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	no // yes	yes	high	no	b	no	yes	medium	yes	no	no	before final stretta	Quotation from hymnal of 1659
Mielck, <i>Symphony</i>	1897	fff	F major / yes	yes	yes	no	no // yes	yes	medium -	yes (4,x)	a/b/c	no	yes	simple	yes	no	yes	end	
Alfvén, <i>Symphony 2</i>	1898	ff / pp	d minor / no	yes	yes	no	no // yes	yes	high	no	a/c	no	no	medium +	yes	no	no	middle / last mvt.	“Canto fermo”
Karłowicz, <i>Symphonie Rebirth</i>	1909	ff	E major / yes	yes	yes	(yes)	yes // no	(yes)	high	no	a/(b)	no	no	simple	no	no	no	before final stretta	Score: “trionfante”

Mixed Cases

Saint-Saëns, <i>Symphony 3 Organ</i>	1886	ff	F major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // (no)	(yes)	medium +	yes (x)	b	no	(no)	simple	yes	no	(yes)	middle / last mvt.	
Suk, <i>Praga</i>	1904	ff	G major / (yes)	yes	yes	no	yes // yes	no	medium +	no	b	no	no	complex -	yes	no	(no)	towards the end	Quotation: “Ye who are God’s warriors”
Glazunov, <i>Kremlin</i>	1890	ff	E♭ major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // yes	(yes)	medium -	yes (2)	b	no	yes	simple	yes	no	yes	before final stretta	
Glazunov, <i>A la mémoire de Gogol</i>	1909	ff / f	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // yes / no	no	medium +	(no) (1)	a/b	no	yes	complex -	yes	no	yes	towards the end	
L. Nielsen, <i>Symphony 3, I</i>	1914	ff	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	no // - /// yes // no	yes / no	medium + / low	yes (5,4)	c / b	no	no	simple	yes / no	no / yes	(no)	end / first mvt.	

⁸⁴ (1) Tremolos on one pitch or with changes of pitch that do not follow the shape of the melody, (2) moderate tone repetitions (3) moderate runs or arpeggios, (4) rapid passages or arpeggios (3 and 4 are overlapping, of course), (5) continuous kettle drum rolls or triangle tremolos, (x) other.

The Glorifying Hymnic

Beethoven, Symphony 3 <i>Eroica</i>	1803	ff	E♭ major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (3)	b	(yes)	no	simple +	yes	no	no	middle / last mvt.	
Beethoven, <i>Pastoral</i>	1808	ff	F major / yes	yes	no	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1)	b	no	no	simple	(no)	no	no	towards the beginning /last mvt.	
Weber, <i>Jubel-Ouverture</i>	1818	ff	E major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (4,5)	b	yes	no	simple +	yes	no	yes	end	Quotation: “God save the King” / “Heil dir im Siegerkranze”
Beethoven, Symphony 9 <i>(Ode to Joy)</i>	1824	ff	D major / yes	(yes)	yes	(yes)	yes // no	yes	low	yes (3)	b	no	no	simple	no	no	no	middle / last mvt.	Choir
Paganini, <i>Maestosa Suonata</i>	1828	f / p / ff	E major / yes	(yes)	(yes)	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (3,x)	b	yes	no	simple	no	yes	no	end	Quotation: „Gott erhalte Franz den Kaiser“
Kuhlau, <i>Elverhøj</i>	1828	ff	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (3)	b	no	(no)	medium +	(yes)	no	yes	before final stretta	Quotation: Danish king’s hymn
Mendelssohn, Symphony 3 <i>Scottish</i>	1829/ 1842	ff	A major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1)	b	no	no	simple +	no	no	no	end	
Berlioz, <i>Benvenuto Cellini</i>	1838	ff	G major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	yes // (no)	yes	medium +	yes (3)	b/(c)	no	no	medium	yes	no	yes	before final stretta	
Donizetti, <i>La favorite</i>	1843	ff	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1)	a/(b)	no	no	simple	no	no	yes	before final stretta	
Flotow, <i>Alessandro Stradella</i>	1844	fff	D major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (2)	b	no	(no)	simple	no	yes	yes	end	
Vieuxtemps, <i>Greeting</i>	1844	f	E major / yes	yes	yes	no	(no) // no	no	low	yes (3)	b	no	no	simple	(yes)	no	no	towards the end	Quotation: “Star-spangled Banner”
Wagner, <i>Tannhäuser</i>	1845	ff	E major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (3)	b	no	no	medium	yes	no	no	towards the beginning	
Litolff, Concerto Symphonique 3	1846	ff	B♭ major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes / no	no	low	yes (x)	b	no	no	low	yes	no	no	rather early in the finale	“Hymne national. (Wien Neèrlands bloed.)”
Flotow, <i>Martha</i>	1847	ff	A major / yes	yes	no	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (3)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	yes	before final stretta	
Bristow, Symphony 2 <i>Jullien</i>	1854	ff	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (3,5)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	end	
Saint-Saëns, Piano Concerto 1	1858	ff / f	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium +	yes (4)	b	no	no	medium	no	no	no	towards the end	
Raff, <i>Jubel- Ouverture</i>	1864	ff / mf	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (3,4)	b	no	no	medium	yes	no	no	towards the end	Quotation: “God save the King” / “Heil dir im Siegerkranze”
Rheinberger, Symphony 1 <i>Wallenstein</i>	1866	ff	D major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (3)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	towards the end / first mvt.	
Tchaikovsky, <i>Festival Overture</i>	1866	ff	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1,3)	b	yes	no	medium	yes	no	yes	before final stretta	Quotation: Danish king’s hymn
Marqués, Symphony 1	1869	ff	E♭ major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (3)	b	(yes)	no	simple	no	yes	no	towards the end	
Grieg, Piano Concerto	1869	f / fff ⁸⁵	A major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1,4)	b	no	no	complex	yes	no	no	end	
Marqués, Symphony 2 (a)	1870	ff	E♭ major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (2,3)	b	no	no	medium -	yes	no	no	end / first mvt.	
Brahms, <i>Haydn Variations</i>	1873	ff	B♭ major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (4)	b	yes	no	medium -	no	yes	no	towards the end	
Benedict, Symphony	1874	ff / p / ff	B major / yes	(yes)	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	middle / scherzo	
Smetana, <i>Vltava</i>	1874	ff	E major / no	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	(medium -)	yes (4)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	yes	towards the end	
Tchaikovsky, Symphony 3 (a)	1875	fff	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (1,5)	b	no	no	medium	yes	no	no	before final stretta	
Saint-Saëns, Piano Concerto 4	1875	f ⁸⁶	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (x)	b	no	no	complex	no	yes	no	middle / last mvt.	
Benoît, <i>Charlotte Corday</i>	1876	ff	C major / yes	yes	no	no	(no) // no	no	medium -	yes (4)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	towards the end	Quotation: “Marseillaise”

⁸⁵ The orchestra has f, the piano fff.

⁸⁶ There are many occurrences of this hymnic theme, one of which is even played ff; however, aside from dynamics, the passage selected here displays the most features of the *Hymnic*.

Tchaikovsky, <i>Swan Lake</i>	1877	fff	B major / yes	yes	no	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1,2)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	yes	end	
Rott, Symphony 1	1878	fff	E major / yes	yes	no	no	yes // (no)	no	low	yes (4,5)	b	no	no	complex	yes	no	no	end	
Brahms, <i>Academic Festival Overture</i>	1880	(f /) ff	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (4,3)	b	no	no	complex	yes	yes	yes	end	Quotation: “Gaudemus igitur”
Saint-Saëns, Violin Concerto 3	1880	ff	B major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	(yes)	medium -	yes (3)	b	no	no	simple +	yes	no	no	middle / last mvt.	
Raff, Symphony 9, <i>In Summer</i> (1 st mov.)	1880	f	E major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (2,3,5)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	middle / first mvt.	
Dukas, <i>Goetz</i>	1883	fff	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (4)	b	no	no	medium	yes	no	yes	end	
Rubinstein, <i>Eroica Fantasy</i>	1884	ff	F major / (yes)	yes	yes	no	(yes) // no	no	medium +	yes (3)	b	no	no	medium -	yes	no	no	middle	
Stanford, Symphony 3 <i>Irish</i>	1887	f / ff	F major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // yes	no	low	yes (1) / no	b	no	yes	medium	yes	no	no	end	Quotation: “Let Erin Remember the Days of Old”
Tchaikovsky, Symphony 5	1888	ff / fff	E major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (3)	b	yes	no	simple +	yes	yes	no	before final stretta	
Mahler, Symphony 1	1888	fff	D major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	yes // no	yes	low	yes (1)	(b)	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	before final stretta	(“Triumphal”)
Strauss, <i>Don Juan</i>	1888	ff	E major / yes	yes	(yes)	(no)	yes // no	no	low	yes (1)	b	yes	no	simple	yes	yes	no	middle	
Cliffe, Symphony 1	1889	ff	C major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1,5) / yes (3)	b	no	no	simple	no / yes	no	no	before final stretta	
Massenet, <i>Esclarmonde-Suite</i>	1889	ff / fff / p	D major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (3)	b	no	no	simple +	yes	no	yes	end of first movement	Referring to the Prologue of the opera, being a hymn for the imperatrix
Arensky, <i>Dream on the Volga</i>	1891	ff	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes / no	no	low	(yes) (1)	b	no	no	simple +	yes	no	yes	end	
Kalinnikov, Symphony 2	1897	ff	A major / yes	(yes)	no	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (1,3,4)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	towards the end (end)	
Parry, <i>Symphonic Variations</i>	1897	f / ff	E major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (4)	b	no	no	simple +	yes	no	no	before final stretta	
Scriabin, Symphony 1	1900	f / ff	E major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	medium -	yes (3)	b/(c)	no	no	medium	no	no	no	end	Choir
Sibelius, Symphony 2 (a)	1902	[ff] / con forza	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	low	yes (x)	b	yes	no	simple +	no	yes	no	middle / last mvt.	
Sibelius, Symphony 2 (b)	1902	fff	D major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // (no)	no	low	yes (1,5,x)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	no	end	
Mahler, Symphony 5	1904	fff	D major / yes	yes	(yes)	no	(no) // no	no	low	yes (3)	b	no	no	simple	yes	no	(no)	before final stretta	(“Höhepunkt”)
L. Nielsen, Symphony 3, IV	1914	f / ff	C major / yes	yes	yes	no	yes // no	no	high	yes (5)	b	no	no	simple	no	no	no	towards the end	

Appendix 3: Interval Content of the Melodies⁸⁷

MAJESTIC CHORALE

Mendelssohn, Symphony No. 5

14 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (14,2 %)
- Seconds:	07 (50 %)
- Thirds:	03 (21,4 %)
- Fourths:	02 (14,2 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Rubinstein, Symphony No. 2

31 Intervals

- Unisons:	06 (19,3 %)
- Seconds:	25 (80,6 %)
- Thirds:	00
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Liszt, Battle of the Huns

28 Intervals (end uncertain)

- Unisons:	04 (14,2 %)
- Seconds:	21 (75 %)
- Thirds:	02 (07,1 %)
- Fourths:	01 (03,6 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Marqués, Symphony No. 2 (b)⁸⁸

12 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (08,3 %)
- Seconds:	11 (91,6 %)
- Thirds:	00
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Tschaikowsky, *The Tempest*

10 Intervals

- Unisons:	00
- Seconds:	06 (60 %)
- Thirds:	00
- Fourths:	04 (40 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Tschaikowsky, Symphony No. 3 (b)

20 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (05 %)
- Seconds:	16 (80 %)
- Thirds:	03 (15 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Brahms, Symphony No. 1

10 Intervals (end uncertain)

- Unisons:	03 (30 %)
- Seconds:	05 (50 %)
- Thirds:	01 (10 %)
- Fourths:	01 (10 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

⁸⁷ Episodes and transition formulas have not been counted. Also, the interval between the last note of a melody section and the first note of the new section has not been counted. Finally, the step leading into a chord that ends a section very often falls outside the usual melody line and has in such cases therefore been dismissed. Sometimes decisions about caesuras

had to be made which might be subject to discussion; however, in no case should they affect the result in a significant way. Values are rounded.

⁸⁸ M. 271 (from the second eighth note onwards) has been considered as a transition formula and hence has not been counted.

Bruckner, Symphony No. 535 Intervals⁸⁹

- Unisons:	01 (02,9 %)
- Seconds:	24 (68,6 %)
- Thirds:	02 (05,7 %)
- Fourths:	01 (02,9 %)
- Fifths:	07 (20 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Fibich, Komensky

27 Intervals

- Unisons:	05 (18,5 %)
- Seconds:	16 (59,3 %)
- Thirds:	06 (22,2 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Mielck, Symphony

28 Intervals

- Unisons:	05 (17,9 %)
- Seconds:	19 (67,9 %)
- Thirds:	02 (07,1 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	01 (03,6 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	01 (03,6 %)

Alfvén, Symphony No. 2

25 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (04 %)
- Seconds:	21 (84 %)
- Thirds:	03 (12 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Suk, Praga37 Intervals⁹⁰

- Unisons:	08 (21,6 %)
- Seconds:	18 (48,6 %)
- Thirds:	08 (21,6 %)
- Fourths:	02 (05,4 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	01 (02,7 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

⁸⁹ The note repetitions in m. 613 et seq. have not been counted as melody notes.

⁹⁰ There are uncertainties concerning the melody

line. I chose the trumpet except for the two last measures and I considered the violins as finishing the melody line.

MIXED TYPE**Saint-Saëns, Symphony No. 3**

16 Intervals

- Unisons:	00
- Seconds:	12 (75 %)
- Thirds:	04 (25 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Glazunov, Gogol

74 Intervals

- Unisons:	05 (06,8 %)
- Seconds:	57 (77 %)
- Thirds:	10 (13,5 %)
- Fourths:	02 (02,7 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Karłowicz, Sym

9 Intervals (end uncertain)

- Unisons:	00
- Seconds:	08 (88,9 %)
- Thirds:	00
- Fourths:	01 (11,1 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

L. Nielsen, Symphony 3 (I)56 Intervals⁹¹

- Unisons:	06 (10,7 %)
- Seconds:	41 (73,2 %)
- Thirds:	01 (01,8 %)
- Fourths:	07 (12,5 %)
- Fifths:	01 (01,8 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

⁹¹ In this excerpt there is an ambiguity between a chorale and a Hymnic melody line treated

contrapuntally. The chorale line is, however, too short, to be included here.

GLORIFYING HYMNIC

Beethoven, Symphony No. 350 Intervals⁹²

- Unisons:	04 (08 %)
- Seconds:	30 (60 %)
- Thirds:	14 (28 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	01 (02 %)
- Sixths:	01 (02 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Beethoven, Symphony No. 6

21 Intervals

- Unisons:	00
- Seconds:	03 (14,3 %)
- Thirds:	13 (61,9 %)
- Fourths:	04 (19 %)
- Fifths:	01 (04,8 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Weber, Jubel-Ouvertüre

40 Intervals

- Unisons:	08 (20 %)
- Seconds:	30 (75 %)
- Thirds:	02 (05 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Beethoven, Ode to Joy

89 Intervals

- Unisons:	21 (23,6 %)
- Seconds:	62 (69,7 %)
- Thirds:	06 (06,7 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Paganini, Maestosa Suonata

69 Intervals

- Unisons:	06 (08,7 %)
- Seconds:	45 (65,2 %)
- Thirds:	11 (15,9 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	02 (02,9 %)
- Sixths:	02 (02,9 %)
- Sevenths:	02 (02,9 %)
- Octaves:	01 (01,4 %)

Kuhlau, Overture to Elverhøj

63 Intervals

- Unisons:	07 (11,1 %)
- Seconds:	45 (71,4 %)
- Thirds:	05 (07,9 %)
- Fourths:	07 (11,1 %)
- Fifths:	01 (01,6 %)
- Sixths:	01 (01,6 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	02 (03,2 %)

Mendelssohn, Symphony No. 3

29 Intervals (end uncertain)

- Unisons:	08 (27,6 %)
- Seconds:	15 (51,7 %)
- Thirds:	03 (10,3 %)
- Fourths:	03 (10,3 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Berlioz, Benvenuto

23 Intervals

- Unisons:	04 (17,4 %)
- Seconds:	09 (39,1 %)
- Thirds:	05 (21,7 %)
- Fourths:	02 (08,7 %)
- Fifths:	02 (08,7 %)
- Sixths:	01 (04,4 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

⁹² The middle section of the melody is almost like a long transition formula. This fact slightly distorts the numbers of the intervals since the 16th passages consist of seconds. Otherwise the thirds would turn

out to be even more important. The interval leaps before the 16th passages have not been considered to be part of the melody and hence have not been counted.

Donizetti, La favorite

29 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (03,4 %)
- Seconds:	22 (75,7 %)
- Thirds:	00
- Fourths:	05 (17,2 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	01 (03,4 %)
- Octaves:	00

Flotow, Alessandro28 Intervals⁹³

- Unisons:	10 (35,7 %)
- Seconds:	12 (42,9 %)
- Thirds:	03 (10,7 %)
- Fourths:	02 (07,1 %)
- Fifths:	01 (03,6 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Vieuxtemps, Greeting to America

43 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (04,7 %)
- Seconds:	26 (60,5 %)
- Thirds:	06 (14 %)
- Fourths:	05 (11,6 %)
- Fifths:	02 (04,7 %)
- Sixths:	02 (04,7 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Wagner, Overture to Tannhäuser

47 Intervals

- Unisons:	11 (23,4 %)
- Seconds:	29 (61,7 %)
- Thirds:	04 (08,5 %)
- Fourths:	03 (06,4 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Litolff, Concerto symphonique No. 3

65 Intervals

- Unisons:	10 (15,4 %)
- Seconds:	39 (60 %)
- Thirds:	11 (16,9 %)
- Fourths:	02 (03,1 %)
- Fifths:	01 (01,5 %)
- Sixths:	02 (03,1 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Flotow, Overture to Martha

17 Intervals

- Unisons:	00
- Seconds:	10 (58,8 %)
- Thirds:	02 (11,8 %)
- Fourths:	04 (23,5 %)
- Fifths:	01 (05,9 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Bristow, Symphony No. 2

35 Intervals

- Unisons:	04 (11,4 %)
- Seconds:	25 (71,4 %)
- Thirds:	03 (08,6 %)
- Fourths:	03 (08,6 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Saint-Saëns, Piano Concerto No. 1

47 Intervals

- Unisons:	08 (17 %)
- Seconds:	31 (66 %)
- Thirds:	03 (06,4 %)
- Fourths:	02 (04,3 %)
- Fifths:	01 (02,1 %)
- Sixths:	02 (04,3 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Raff, Jubel-Ouvertüre

61 Intervals

- Unisons:	12 (19,7 %)
- Seconds:	43 (70,5 %)
- Thirds:	06 (09,8 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Rheinberger, Symphony No. 1

23 Intervals

- Unisons:	04 (17,4 %)
- Seconds:	11 (47,8 %)
- Thirds:	04 (17,4 %)
- Fourths:	01 (04,3 %)
- Fifths:	01 (04,3 %)
- Sixths:	02 (08,9 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

⁹³ The D46 cadence has been dismissed.

Tchaikovsky, *Festival Overture*

75 Intervals

- Unisons:	07 (09,3 %)
- Seconds:	50 (66,7 %)
- Thirds:	08 (10,7 %)
- Fourths:	09 (12 %)
- Fifths:	01 (01,3 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Marqués, *Symphony No. 1*

16 Intervals

- Unisons:	04 (25 %)
- Seconds:	11 (68,8 %)
- Thirds:	00
- Fourths:	01 (06,3 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Grieg, *Piano Concerto*

38 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (05,3 %)
- Seconds:	22 (57,9 %)
- Thirds:	08 (21,1 %)
- Fourths:	04 (10,5 %)
- Fifths:	02 (05,3 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Marqués, *Symphony No. 2 (a)*

44 Intervals

- Unisons:	13 (29,5 %)
- Seconds:	27 (61,4 %)
- Thirds:	02 (04,5 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	02 (04,5 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Brahms, *Haydn Variations*

50 Intervals

- Unisons:	04 (08 %)
- Seconds:	38 (76 %)
- Thirds:	07 (14 %)
- Fourths:	01 (2 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Benedict, *Symphony*

38 Intervals

- Unisons:	06 (15,8 %)
- Seconds:	22 (57,9 %)
- Thirds:	05 (13,2 %)
- Fourths:	03 (07,9 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	02 (05,3 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Smetana, *Vltava*

16 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (06,3 %)
- Seconds:	07 (43,8 %)
- Thirds:	05 (31,3 %)
- Fourths:	03 (18,8 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Tchaikovsky, *Symphony No. 3 (a)*

27 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (07,4 %)
- Seconds:	21 (77,8 %)
- Thirds:	00
- Fourths:	03 (11,1 %)
- Fifths:	01
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Saint-Saëns, *Klavierkonzert 4*

41 Intervals

- Unisons:	05 (12,2 %)
- Seconds:	21 (51,2 %)
- Thirds:	08 (19,5 %)
- Fourths:	02 (04,9 %)
- Fifths:	03 (07,3 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Benoit, *Overture to Charlotte Corday*

26 Intervals

- Unisons:	06 (23,1 %)
- Seconds:	08 (30,8 %)
- Thirds:	06 (23,1 %)
- Fourths:	04 (15,4 %)
- Fifths:	02 (07,7 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Tchaikovsky, Swan Lake

33 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (03 %)
- Seconds:	12 (36,4 %)
- Thirds:	11 (33,3 %)
- Fourths:	03 (09,1 %)
- Fifths:	06 (18,2 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Rott, Symphony

70 Intervals

- Unisons:	06 (08,6 %)
- Seconds:	44 (62,9 %)
- Thirds:	05 (07,1 %)
- Fourths:	07 (10 %)
- Fifths:	06 (08,6 %)
- Sixths:	02 (02,9 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Brahms, Academic Festival Overture

57 Intervals

- Unisons:	12 (21,1 %)
- Seconds:	26 (45,6 %)
- Thirds:	12 (21,1 %)
- Fourths:	04 (07 %)
- Fifths:	02 (03,5 %)
- Sixths:	01 (01,8 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Saint-Saëns, Violin Concerto No. 3

22 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (04,5 %)
- Seconds:	14 (63,6 %)
- Thirds:	04 (18,2 %)
- Fourths:	03 (13,6 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Raff, Symphony No. 9

40 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (2,5 %)
- Seconds:	23 (57,5 %)
- Thirds:	09 (22,5 %)
- Fourths:	06 (15 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	01 (2,5 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Dukas, A Goetz de Berlichingen

25 Intervals

- Unisons:	05 (20 %)
- Seconds:	12 (48 %)
- Thirds:	04 (16 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	01 (04 %)
- Sixths:	01 (04 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	02 (08 %)

Rubinstein, Eroica Fantasy

42 Intervals

- Unisons:	05 (11,9 %)
- Seconds:	22 (52,4 %)
- Thirds:	10 (23,8 %)
- Fourths:	03 (07,1 %)
- Fifths:	01 (02,4 %)
- Sixths:	01 (02,4 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Stanford, Irish

85 Intervals (end uncertain)

- Unisons:	11 (12,9 %)
- Seconds:	52 (61,2 %)
- Thirds:	13 (15,3 %)
- Fourths:	07 (08,2 %)
- Fifths:	01 (01,2 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	01 (01,2 %)

Tchaikovsky, Symphony No. 5

74 Intervals

- Unisons:	25 (33,8 %)
- Seconds:	43 (58,1 %)
- Thirds:	06 (08,1 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Mahler, Symphony No. 1

32 Intervals

- Unisons:	03 (09,4 %)
- Seconds:	19 (59,4 %)
- Thirds:	02 (06,3 %)
- Fourths:	08 (25 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Strauss, Don Juan

39 Intervals

- Unisons:	00
- Seconds:	26 (66,7 %)
- Thirds:	05 (12,8 %)
- Fourths:	04 (10,3 %)
- Fifths:	01 (02,6 %)
- Sixths:	02 (05,1 %)
- Sevenths:	01 (02,6 %)
- Octaves:	00

Cliffe, Symphony

27 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (03,7 %)
- Seconds:	15 (55,6 %)
- Thirds:	05 (18,5 %)
- Fourths:	02 (07,4 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	01 (03,7 %)
- Sevenths:	01 (03,7 %)
- Octaves:	02 (07,4 %)

Massenet, Esclarmonde Suite

57 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (03,5 %)
- Seconds:	21 (36,8 %)
- Thirds:	21 (36,8 %)
- Fourths:	09 (15,8 %)
- Fifths:	02 (03,5 %)
- Sixths:	01 (01,8 %)
- Sevenths:	01 (01,8 %)
- Octaves:	00

Glazunov, The Kremlin

64 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (03,1 %)
- Seconds:	54 (84,4 %)
- Thirds:	07 (10,9 %)
- Fourths:	01 (01,6 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Arensky, Overture to Dream on the Volga

59 Intervals

- Unisons:	08 (13,6 %)
- Seconds:	45 (76,3 %)
- Thirds:	02 (03,4 %)
- Fourths:	04 (06,8 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Kalinnikov, Symphony No. 2

87 Intervals (Ende unklar)

- Unisons:	03 (03,4 %)
- Seconds:	34 (39,1 %)
- Thirds:	33 (37,9 %)
- Fourths:	17 (19,5 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Parry, Symphonic Variations

38 Intervals

- Unisons:	03 (07,9 %)
- Seconds:	24 (63,2 %)
- Thirds:	07 (18,4 %)
- Fourths:	03 (07,9 %)
- Fifths:	01 (02,6 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Sibelius, Symphony No. 2 (b)

29 Intervals

- Unisons:	03 (10,3 %)
- Seconds:	23 (79,3 %)
- Thirds:	01 (3,4 %)
- Fourths:	01 (3,4 %)
- Fifths:	01 (3,4 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Mahler, Symphony No. 5

13 Intervals

- Unisons:	00
- Seconds:	08 (61,5 %)
- Thirds:	03 (23,1 %)
- Fourths:	01 (07,7 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	01 (07,7 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Nielsen, Sym 3 (IV)

17 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (05,9 %)
- Seconds:	08 (47,1)
- Thirds:	05 (29,4 %)
- Fourths:	03 (17,6 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

ROLLAND, CHANSONS POPULAIRES

No. 177a (p. 1)

35 Intervals

- Unisons:	09 (25,7 %)
- Seconds:	22 (62,9 %)
- Thirds:	02 (05,7 %)
- Fourths:	01 (02,9 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	01 (02,9 %)
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 177c (p. 4)

55 Intervals

- Unisons:	18 (32,7 %)
- Seconds:	31 (56,4 %)
- Thirds:	03 (05,5 %)
- Fourths:	03 (05,5 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 178 (p. 5)

12 Intervals

- Unisons:	05 (41,7 %)
- Seconds:	04 (33,3 %)
- Thirds:	02 (16,7 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	01 (08,3 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 179a (p. 10)

24 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (04,2 %)
- Seconds:	15 (62,5 %)
- Thirds:	08 (33,3 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 179b (p. 11)

35 Intervals

- Unisons:	03 (08,6 %)
- Seconds:	28 (80%)
- Thirds:	04 (11,4 %)
- Fourths:	00
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 180a (p. 15)

60 Intervals

- Unisons:	14 (23,3 %)
- Seconds:	34 (56,7 %)
- Thirds:	09 (15 %)
- Fourths:	03 (05 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 180b (p. 16)

44 Intervals

- Unisons:	14 (31,8 %)
- Seconds:	27 (61,4 %)
- Thirds:	01 (02,3 %)
- Fourths:	02 (04,5 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 180c (p. 18)

44 Intervals

- Unisons:	13 (29,5 %)
- Seconds:	28 (63,6 %)
- Thirds:	01 (02,3 %)
- Fourths:	02 (04,5 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 180d (p. 19)

36 Intervals

- Unisons:	12 (33,3 %)
- Seconds:	15 (41,7 %)
- Thirds:	07 (19,4 %)
- Fourths:	01 (02,8 %)
- Fifths:	01 (02,8 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

ERK, LIEDERHORT

No. 1 (p. 1)

29 Intervals

- Unisons:	06 (20,7 %)
- Seconds:	12 (41,4 %)
- Thirds:	09 (31 %)
- Fourths:	02 (06,9 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 2 (p. 5)

24 Intervals

- Unisons:	04 (16,7 %)
- Seconds:	12 (50 %)
- Thirds:	06 (25 %)
- Fourths:	02 (08,3 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 2a (p. 6)

40 Intervals

- Unisons:	07 (17,5 %)
- Seconds:	14 (35 %)
- Thirds:	13 (32,5 %)
- Fourths:	03 (07,5 %)
- Fifths:	03 (07,5 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 3 (p. 8)

32 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (06,3 %)
- Seconds:	22 (68,8 %)
- Thirds:	04 (12,5 %)
- Fourths:	04 (12,5 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 4 (p. 8)

23 Intervals

- Unisons:	08 (34,8 %)
- Seconds:	11 (47,8 %)
- Thirds:	00
- Fourths:	03 (13 %)
- Quinten:	01 (04,3 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 5, erste Melodie (p. 11)

30 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (03,3 %)
- Seconds:	15 (50 %)
- Thirds:	04 (13,3 %)
- Fourths:	07 (23,3 %)
- Fifths:	02 (06,7 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	01 (03,3 %)

No. 5, zweite Melodie (p. 11)

31 Intervals

- Unisons:	04 (12,9 %)
- Seconds:	21 (67,7 %)
- Thirds:	02 (06,5 %)
- Fourths:	03 (09,7 %)
- Fifths:	01 (03,2 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 6 (p. 12)

34 Intervals

- Unisons:	06 (17,6 %)
- Seconds:	16 (47 %)
- Thirds:	09 (26,5 %)
- Fourths:	01 (02,9 %)
- Fifths:	02 (05,9 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 7 (p. 17)

41 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (04,9 %)
- Seconds:	13 (31,7 %)
- Thirds:	22 (53,7 %)
- Fourths:	04 (09,8 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 7a (p. 18)

26 Intervals

- Unisons:	08 (30,8 %)
- Seconds:	12 (46,2 %)
- Thirds:	04 (15,4 %)
- Fourths:	02 (07,7 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

VUAGHAN WILLIAMS, *ENGLISH FOLK-SONGS*

No. 1 (p. 5)

31 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (06,5 %)
- Seconds:	24 (77,4 %)
- Thirds:	03 (09,7 %)
- Fourths:	01 (3,2 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	01 (3,2 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 2a (p. 6)

44 Intervals

- Unisons:	08 (18,2 %)
- Seconds:	22 (50 %)
- Thirds:	08 (18,2 %)
- Fourths:	03 (06,8 %)
- Fifths:	01 (02,3 %)
- Sixths:	02 (04,5 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 2b (p. 6)

41 Intervals

- Unisons:	06 (14,6 %)
- Seconds:	21 (51,2 %)
- Thirds:	09 (22 %)
- Fourths:	03 (07,3 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	02 (04,9 %)
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

No. 3 (p. 13)

38 Intervals

- Unisons:	04 (10,5 %)
- Seconds:	28 (73,7 %)
- Thirds:	02 (5,3 %)
- Fourths:	03 (07,9 %)
- Fifths:	01 (02,6 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Sevenths:	00
- Octaves:	00

MERRICK, *FOLK-SONGS FROM SUSSEX*

p. 1

44 Intervals

- Unisons:	01 (02,3 %)
- Seconds:	31 (70,5 %)
- Thirds:	08 (18,2 %)
- Fourths:	02 (04,5 %)
- Fifths:	01 (02,3 %)
- Sixths:	01 (02,3 %)
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

p. 16

38 Intervals

- Unisons:	02 (05,3 %)
- Seconds:	17 (44,7 %)
- Thirds:	15 (39,5 %)
- Fourths:	04 (10,5 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

p. 4

63 Intervals

- Unisons:	11 (17,5 %)
- Seconds:	39 (61,9 %)
- Thirds:	08 (12,7 %)
- Fourths:	03 (04,8 %)
- Fifths:	01 (01,6 %)
- Sixths:	01 (01,6 %)
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

p. 6

54 Intervals

- Unisons:	07 (13 %)
- Seconds:	26 (48,1 %)
- Thirds:	17 (31,5 %)
- Fourths:	04 (07,4 %)
- Fifths:	00
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

p. 10f.

68 Intervals

- Unisons:	17 (25 %)
- Seconds:	29 (42,6 %)
- Thirds:	16 (23,5 %)
- Fourths:	02 (02,9 %)
- Fifths:	01 (01,5 %)
- Sixths:	02 (02,9 %)
- Seventhths:	01 (01,5 %)
- Octaves:	00

p. 12

36 Intervals

- Unisons:	08 (22,2 %)
- Seconds:	19 (52,8 %)
- Thirds:	05 (13,9 %)
- Fourths:	02 (05,6 %)
- Fifths:	02 (05,6 %)
- Sixths:	00
- Seventhths:	00
- Octaves:	00

Appendix 4: The Sources

Ludwig van Beethoven, Symphony No. 3, *Eroica* (1803)

- [1] Anonymous (1811), quoted in Sipe, *Beethoven*, p. 78: “The composer has called it ‘Sinfonia Eroica’ and seems to have portrayed in it the picture of a battle. One hears the courageous assaults, the wild rage, the unrelenting attacks and confused anger, the loud, groaning lamentation, and finally, exultation and jubilation.”
- [2] Amadeus Wendt (1815), quoted in Sipe, *Beethoven*, p. 78: “[The *Eroica*] takes us onto the battlefield, where the golden hopes of the people and a glorious heroic age perishes, while another [heroic age] celebrates its day of resurrection.”
- [3] M. “Berichte: Mörsers Akademie, am 30. December 1829.” *Berliner allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol 7, no. 1 (January 2, 1830), p. 7: “Kunst, Geist und Kraft beider Kompositionen vereinte sich in Beethovens *Eroica* mit kolossalem Ideengang.”
- [4] G. D’Ortigue. “Le sinfonie di Beethoven. Sinfonia Eroica.” *Gazzetta musicale di Milano*, vol. 3, no. 23 (June 9, 1844), pp. 93–4, here p. 94: “Questo però non toglie che la sinfonia eroica sia uno dei più grandi concepimenti del genio, pel suo costante carattere di nobiltà, per la grandezza della ispirazioni, e per quella solenne espressione di tristezza che penetra l’anima e la riempie di sublimi emozioni.”
- [5] Adolph Bernhard Marx. *Ludwig van Beethoven. Leben und Schaffen*, vol. 1. Leipzig: Gebrüder Reinecke, 1902 [original ed. 1859], p. 202–3: “Hier tritt nun jenes Thema, das wir schon in zwei Werken gefunden, in voller Bedeutung auf. Ist es in seiner Lieblichkeit und Harmlosigkeit Beethoven seit dem Prometheus-Ballet im Sinne geblieben? ist es Volkslied?—wir wissen es nicht [...].”
- [6] Anonymous. “Breslauer Theater-Kapelle (9. Abonnementskonzert).” *Schlesische Theater-Zeitung*, vol. 1, no. 11 (March 15, 1863), p. 3: “Auch die übrigen Sätze gelangen vortrefflich, mit einziger Ausnahme des hymnusartigen Schlusses im letzten Satze, in welchem die Stimmung keine ganz reine war.”
- [8] J. van Santen Kolff. “Geschichtliches und Aesthetisches über das Erinnerungsmotiv IV.” *Bayreuther Blätter*, vol. 8, no. 10 (October 1885), pp. 312–20, here p. 318: “Auch das bei Berlioz und Liszt so beliebte Mittel der Vergrößerung des Motivs hat Beethoven, wenn auch sparsam, schon angewendet, z. B. in der soeben erwähnten Episode im ‘Eroica’-Finale, wo die Bässe im Verein mit den Hörnern jene Melodie in wuchtiger Breite einsetzen, unter Begleitung des kontrapunktierenden Orchesters”
- [9] Amédée Boutarel. “Les transformations modernes de la symphonie.” *Le Guide musical*, vol. 30, no. 24 (1884), pp. 157–177, here p. 176: “Le finale, admirable chant d’apothéose, est entrecoupé d’épisodes d’une tristesse mortelle. La gloire coûte cher aux nations. Après la victoire, quand tout le peuple fête le triomphateur, combien de visages se couvrent de pleurs en songeant aux soldats moissonnés!”
- [10] Wilhelm Joseph von Wasielewski. *Ludwig van Beethoven*, vol. 1. Berlin: Brachvogel und Ranft, 1888, p. 226: “Um aber das Gemüth desselben schließlich in eine gehobene Stimmung zu versetzen, fügt er noch eine Andante-Variation hinzu, deren erbaulicher Charakter sich wie eine gen Himmel gerichtete Danksagung ausnimmt. Sie bedeutet die Krönung des ganzen Satzes. Prachtvoll gedacht ist die Verlegung des Thema’s in den Baß.”
- [11] George Grove. *Beethoven and His Nine Symphonies*. London: Novello and Company, 1896, p. 86–7: “The theme gradually spreads to the entire orchestra, and forms a splendid passage of full and heavenly harmony, set off with every orchestral device, and producing the noblest and most ‘heroic’ impression. [...] The *Poco Andante* is his [sc. the hero’s] flight to the skies.”
- [12] Ernest Walker. *Beethoven*. New York: Brentano’s, 1905, p. 39: “Finally, another pause leads to a *Poco andante*, a variation of the original melody, but expanded (though without any fresh

material at all) and forming a most noble and dignified section.”

- [13] J.-G. Prod’homme. *Les Symphonies de Beethoven*. Paris: Librairie Ch. Delagrave, 1906, p. 107–8: “Andante, le motif [...] sonne à l’harmonie, piano, puis au quatuor [...], les instruments aigus le varient, paraissent se jouer légèrement autour de ce thème, mais bientôt les cuivres surgissent et de leur voix puissante le répètent avec une ampleur majestueuse; il triomphe, plane sur tout l’orchestre.”
- [14] Paul Bekker. *Beethoven*. Berlin: Schuster und Löffler, 1912, p. 226: “Ein ins Unendliche der Erscheinungen sich steigerndes Leben breitet sich aus, bis, hinweg über alle Regungen irdischer Art, der Geist seinen letzten großen Aufstieg nimmt: gebetsartig beginnend und dann zu einem Triumphgesang anschwellend, der das ganze Weltall zu durchströmen scheint. Nach diesem ekstatischen Aufschwung sinken in leiser Ermattung die Kräfte bis derselbe Prometheus Befehl, der dieses ganze Leben hervorzauberte, sie wieder aufruft und in freudigem Bewußtsein des Gewonnenen das Werk enthusiastisch ausklingen läßt.”

Ludwig van Beethoven, Symphony No. 6, *Pastoral* (1808)

- [15] Anonymous. “Recension: Sinfonie pastorale [...], composée [...] par Louis van Beethoven. Propriété des éditeurs. No. 6. OEuv. 68. À Leipsic, chez Breitkopf et Härtel.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 12, no. 16 (January 17, 1810), pp. 241–53, here p. 252: “Mit dem 25ten Tacte bekommen die Viola und das Violoncell jenen Gesang, den die Clarinetten und Hörner durch Verdoppelung stark herausheben, während die erste Violine das Accompagnement in Sechzehnteltriolen übernimmt; die anderen Blasinstrumente unterstützen kräftig durch aushaltende Töne—kurz, alles malt den höchsten Grad des Frohsinns, der sich dem lauten Jubel nähert.”
- [16] Ernst Ortlepp. “Aus Leipzig.” *Zeitung für die elegante Welt*, vol. 32, no. 234 (November 29, 1832), coll. 1871–2; reprinted in Kim and Hagels, *Symphonie-Rezeption*, no. 200: “Das Schreckensschauspiel eines Gewitters greift seltsam mahnend in die Fröhlichkeit ein – und da es vorüber ist, schallen dankbare, fast heilige und choralartige, freudige Melodien.”
- [17] O. “Zweytes Concert spirituel; den 8. März.” *Allgemeiner Musikalischer Anzeiger*, vol. 10, no. 12 (March 22, 1838), pp. 45–7; reprinted in Kim and Hagels, *Symphonie-Rezeption*, no. 224: “Es gemahnet, als sähe man, nach wiederhergestellter Eintracht und Ruhe, den farbigen Friedensbogen am Wolkendome ausgespannt; das Alphorn tönt und die heimische Schalmey, und unaufhaltsam bricht neuerdings hervor der gestörte Jubel des rührigen Völkchens, um mit ein sich zu mischen in den majestätischen Chorgesang der feyernden Natur, zum Lob und Preis, und zur Verherrlichung der Gottheit.”

Carl Maria von Weber, Jubel-Ouvertüre (1818)

- [18] W—t. “Concert.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung, mit besonderer Rücksicht auf den österreichischen Kaiserstaat*, vol. 6, no. 23 (March 20, 1822), coll. 180–2, here col. 180: “Die Composition ist feurig und effectvoll. Es kommt einem vor, als sagte immer eine Stelle um die andere, ‘Wie glücklich sind wir einen so guten König zu haben, wie lieben wir ihn!’”
- [19] Anonymous. “Concerte.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung, mit besonderer Rücksicht auf den österreichischen Kaiserstaat*, vol. 6, no. 26 (March 30, 1822), coll. 201–5, here col. 201: “Webers Tonsatz ist pompös.”
- [20] Anonymous. “Nachrichten. Leipzig: Vom neuen Jahre 1823 bis Ostern.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 25, no. 25 (June 18, 1823), coll. 399–401, here col. 399: “*Jubel-Ouvertüre* von C. M. Weber, stark und prächtig instrumentirt. [...] Das bekannte herrliche Lied: *God save the king* reihet sich mit sehr vollem Orchester, glanzvoll bearbeitet, an die eigene

Erfindung.”

- [21] G. W. Fink. “Jubel-Ouverture von K. M. v. Weber. Berlin, bei Ad. Mt. Schlesinger.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 43, no. 47 (November 24, 1841), col. 975: “Was diese Ouvertüre sagt und sagen will, weiß alle Welt. Welches Feuer und Leben in ihr jubelt, hat sich tausendfach an dem entzückten Publikum erprobt. Bei jeder neuen Aufführung, so oft sie auch an fast allen Orten, die ein Orchester zu besitzen gross genug sind, gegeben wurde, berauscht sie Alle ohne Unterschied von Neuem, wie sie es immer that, und ist sich selbst ein Zeugniß, dass sie bleibe und in Wirksamkeit bestehen wird, wenn gar manches namhaft Zeitgemässe um sie und nach ihr schon längst zu Grabe gegangen ist. Hier braucht es keiner weiteren Worte, nicht einmal für den Kunstjünger, dass er sich die Partitur anschaffe, um daraus zu sehen, was rhythmisieren und prachtvoll instrumentieren heisst.”
- [22] Anonymous. “Correspondence.” *The Musical Times*, vol. 5, no. 4 (May 29, 1852), p. 39: “The playing of this overture as *it was played* was a most joyful and triumphant close, for the concert, and for the series of concerts. [...] The national air of England here also, and is regarded as the same national tune of loyalty, and I believe elsewhere in the German states.”
- [23] J.-L. Heugel and J. Lovy. “Nouvelles diverses.” *Le Ménestrel*, vol. 20, no. 16 (March 20, 1853): p. 63: “C’est une œuvre pleine de verve et de mouvement; elle se termine par l’air de *God save the king*, dit par tous les instruments à vent, pendant que les instruments à cordes exécutent un contrepoint en triples croches qui donne à ce thème une allure solennelle et grandiose.”
- [24] Anonymous. “Berlin. Musikalische Revue. Der Geburtstag Sr. Majestät des Königs.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 7, no. 36 (October 22, 1853), p. 284: “Die Festvorstellung wurde durch einen Prolog eingeleitet, dem die Jubel-Ouverture von C. M. von Weber voranbrauste. Ein dreifaches Lob auf den Monarchen erscholl, und das darnach begehrte: ‚Heil dir im Siegerkranz‘, bei dessen Klängen alle Anwesenden in erhobener Stellung blieben, bildete das patriotische Finale des Prologes.”
- [25] Anonymous. “Nachrichten: Berlin.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 8, no. 42 (October 18, 1854), p. 332: “Die Volkshymne, stürmisch von dem anwesenden glänzenden Publikum verlangt, ”wurde, während das Publikum sich erhob, gesungen, und schloss mit einem dreimaligen begeisterten Lebehoch auf Sc. Maj. Den König.”
- [26] Anonymous. “Nachrichten. Hannover.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 8, no. 51 (December 20, 1854), p. 405: “Den Schluss [...] bildete die [...] Jubel-Ouverture von Weber, die mit ergreifender, riesenhafter Gewalt die weiten Räume des Saales durchzitterte. Ein endloser, stürmischer Jubel ertönte, als kaum die letzten Töne verklungen waren, und beseligt von dem herrlichsten Genuss, verliess das Publikum den Saal mit der süßen Hoffnung, dass ihm auch das nächste Concert gleich Grosses und Erhabenes bieten werde.”
- [27] Die Redaktion. “Berlin. Revue.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 13, no. 1 (January 5, 1859), pp.3–4, here p. 4: “Die Feier begann mit der Jubel-Ouverture, die unter Taubert’s energischer Leitung feurig und schwungvoll aufgeführt, die Zuhörer zur Begeisterung hinriss.”
- [28] Quien Sabe. “Boston.” *The Musical Review and Musical World*, vol. 11, no. 22 (October 27, 1860), pp. 318–9, here p. 319: “Weber’s ‘Jubel’ overture, introducing the festival, commenced with the following Ode, written by Oliver Wendell Holmes, sung in unison, to the air ‘God save the Queen’.”
- [29] Carl Plato. “Beethoven und Weber.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 17, no. 27 (July 1, 1863), p. 212: “ In welche festliche Stimmung versetzt uns der Anfang der Jubelouverture und wie geht diese Stimmung durch das ganze Stück, bis sie in dem beschließenden: ‚Heil Dir im Siegerkranz‘ sich zum höchsten Jubel steigert!”
- [30] Anonymous. “Neisse.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 17, no. 34 (August 19, 1863), p. 270: “Das erste allgemeine Gesangsfest des ‘schlesischen Sängerbundes’ fand hier am 26. und 27. Juli statt. [...] Nun begann das zweite Concert mit dem Bundesliede von Mozart, welchem die Jubel-Ouverture von Weber folgte. Den Schluss bildeten Massen- und Einzelgesänge der verschiedenen Vereine.”

- [31] Anonymous. "Berichte, Nachrichten und Bemerkungen: Leipzig." *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 6, no. 6 (February 8, 1871), p. 93: "Das 15. Gewandhaus-Concert wurde mit Weber's Jubel-Ouvertüre eröffnet, die bei dem Feuer, mit welchem sie executirt wurde, dazu in einem etwas übertriebenen Tempo, für den fein akustischen Saal zu mächtig war. Man hatte sie, wie das folgende ‚Halleluja‘ für Sopran aus Händel's Esther, wohl wieder zur Feier der politischen Ereignisse ausgewählt."
- [32] Anonymous. "Berichte. Nachrichten und Bemerkungen. Leipzig." *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 6, no. 51 (December 20, 1871), coll. 813–4, here col. 814: "[...] ein Orchesterstück, das einen grösseren Raum zur Entfaltung seiner Pracht bedingt, als den kleinen Gewandhaussaal."
- [33] Anonymous. "Nachrichten. Köln." *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 26, no. 37 (September 11, 1872), p. 293: "Ueber die Einzelheiten ist zunächst mitzutheilen, dass die Jubel-Ouvertüre unter Leitung des Capellmeisters Catenhusen mit grosser Präzision und mit demjenigen Feuer ausgeführt wurde, welches diesem an sich sehr feurigen Tonsatz erst den seines Namens würdigen Effect zu verleihen vermag."
- [34] Friedrich Wilhelm Jähns. *Carl Maria von Weber. Eine Lebensskizze*. Leipzig: Friedrich Wilhelm Grunow, 1873, p. 27: "So entstand diese Jubel-Ouvertüre, die für alle Zeit und für jede bedeutsamere Feier des deutschen Volkes der unübertroffene, feurig-erhabene Ausdruck patriotischer Empfindungen geworden ist."
- [35] Anonymous. "Nachrichten." *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung* vol. 31, No. 20 (May 17, 1877), p. 158: "Als 'Heil dir im Siegerkranz' intoniert wurde, erhob sich die Versammlung wie ein Mann und stimmte mit ein. Der Kaiser hörte das Volkslied stehend an."
- [36] Julius Benedict. *Weber*. New York and London: Scribner and Welford + Sampson Low, Marston, Searle and Rivington, 1881, p. 151: "From the solemn beginning [...] to the grand ending and the happy introduction of the National Anthem, 'Heil Dir im Siegerkranz' (the same as 'God save the Queen'), the hearer is carried away by the exuberant spirit and dazzling colouring of this masterpiece. Here we find real enthusiasm instead of inspiration by command."
- [37] Anonymous. "Bruges." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 21, no. 52 (December 30, 1875), p. 348: "[...] morceau classique de d'un style large dont le développement majestueux arrive aux effets les plus grandioses."
- [38] Anonymous. "Lille." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 23, no. 40 (October 4, 1877), p. 248: "L'ouverture de *Jubel*, de Weber, a été exécutée avec brio et vigueur."
- [39] Anonymous. "Nachrichten." *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 32, no. 7 (February 14, 1878), p. 53: "Das neue Hoftheater in Dresden ist am Sonnabend, den 2. d. M., in Gegenwart des sächsischen Hofes und einer auserlesenen, glänzenden Gesellschaft in feierlicher Weise eröffnet worden. [...] Die dem Prologe folgende Weber'sche Jubel-Ouvertüre konnte ihre nie versagende Wirkung heute um so weniger verfehlen. Noch einmal ertönten die Klänge der Sachsenhymne und noch einmal erhob sich das Publikum, um begeistert mit einzustimmen."
- [40] Anonymous. "Nachrichten." *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 37, no. 13 (March 29, 1883), p. 102: "Die Akademie der Künste feierte unseres Kaisers Geburtstag am Mittag des 21. März. [...] Die weihe- und freudenvollen Klänge der nun folgenden, die Feier beschliessenden Jubel-Ouverture von C. M. von Weber, standen im schönsten Einklange mit der froh und festlich gehobenen Stimmung der Versammelten."
- [41] Anonymous. "Der Potsdamer Männergesangverein." *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 41, no. 12 (March 24, 1887), p. 94: "Hieran schloss sich, als Vorfeier zu Kaisers Geburtstag, die Jubel-Ouverture von Weber; beim Einsetzen des 'Heil Dir, im Siegerkranz' erhob sich mit dem Chor das gesamte Publikum und stimmte mit ein."
- [42] Hermann Gehrman. *Carl Maria von Weber*. Berlin: Harmonie, 1899, p. 52: "Noch heute übt sie ihren unwiderstehlichen Zauber aus und kein Stück [...] besitzt unsere moderne Musikkultur, das in so populärer und zugleich kunstgerechter Weise eine allgemeine

nationale Festfreude auszudrücken vermöchte [...]. Das Ganze durchzieht, abgesehen von dem für unser modernes Empfinden etwas süßlich-trivialen zweiten Allegrothema ein chevaleresker pompöser Zug von der majestätischen Eileitung an bis zu dem imposanten Schluss mit der Nationalhymne, deren Melodie in den Blasinstrumenten liegt und von den Streichinstrumenten, genau wie in der Schlachtmusik (No. 2) von ‚Kampf und Sieg‘ jauchzend umspielt wird.”

- [43] Anonymous. “Posen.” *Bayreuther Blätter*, vol. 37, no. 1 (January-March 1913), p. 72: “Die Jubel-Ouvertüre gab der Feier einen patriotischen Ausklang.”
- [44] W. H. L. “Boston Audience Rises for ‘America’ in German Overture.” *Musical America*, vol. 19, no. 11 (January 17, 1914), p. 41: “When the players came to the strain of ‘Heil dir im Siegerkranz,’ identical with our ‘America,’ which is embodied in this composition some good patriotic gentlemen stood up, and immediately everyone in the hall did likewise.”
- [45] D. B. F., “New Orchestra in New Orleans Debut.” *Musical America*, vol. 20, no. 1 (May 9, 1914), p. 21: “The first number on the program was Weber’s ‘Jubel’ Overture and when the strains upon which ‘America’ is based were reached, the entire audience rose and the display of patriotic enthusiasm almost drowned the music.”

Ludwig van Beethoven, symphony No. 9 (1824)

- [46] Adolph Bernhard Marx. *Ludwig van Beethoven. Leben und Schaffen*, vol. 2. 5th ed. Berlin: Otto Janke, 1901 [original ed. 1859], p. 402–3: “Weit und prachtvoll, fugatomässig, führt das Orchester für sich allein den Festzug bis zum Siege weiter, bis endlich (auf der 160. Partiturseite) zum Sturmflug aller Saiten und den rhythmischen Rufen der Bläser der Volkschor wieder den ersten Vers in der einfachen Weise anstimmt und im bacchischen Jubelton durchführt.”

Felix Mendelssohn, Symphony No. 5, Reformation (1830)

- [47] Anonymous. “Ms. works of Mendelssohn brought to light (from the London Telegraph).” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 27, no. 20 (December 21, 1867), pp. 154–5, here p. 155: “[...] and the grand chorale, having overcome all opposition, is finally given out with all the force of the full orchestra—a symbol of the certain ultimate triumph and universal supremacy of the Church of Christ, in its simplest, purest, and holiest form. With this noble annunciation of the Lutheran hymn doth the reformation symphony conclude.”
- [48] Anonymous. “Mendelssohn’s Reformation Symphony (from the *London Times*).” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 27, no. 21 (January 4, 1868), pp. 162–3, here p. 163: “The climax is put off with grand effect, and at length when it is reached, the leading phrase of ‘Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott’ being given out in lengthened notes by the entire orchestra, fortissimo, we feel that a noble effort has been nobly and thoroughly achieved.”
- [49] Anonymous. “New Philharmonic concerts.” *The Musical World*, vol. 46, no. 19 (May 9, 1868), p. 318: “The performance of this noble composition [...] was for the most part very fine.”
- [50] Anonymous. “Mendelssohn’s Reformation Symphony.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 28, no. 19 (December 5, 1868), p. 354: “In this wonderful movement Mendelssohn evidently designed to illustrate the triumph of the Reformation over all obstacles. [...] Thus the result is never long doubtful, not even when the fugue enters a second time in a more elaborate guise than before, for the chorale triumphantly pursues its course unimpeded by the novel obstacle. [...] Grandly, and with ever-increasing interest, it [the fugue] is worked up, till at length the entire orchestra joins in delivering the opening bars of the Lutheran tune, and thus proclaims the success of the reformed belief.”
- [51] Anonymous. “New Philharmonic concerts.” *The Musical World*, vol. 47, no. 18 (May 1, 1869),

p. 306: “[...] we need only say it exercised the same charm as ever, by its mingled dignity, beauty, and science.”

- [52] Anonymous. “The Philharmonic Society.” *The Musical World*, vol. 49, no. 12 (March 25, 1871), p. 172: “[...] and the skilful treatment of the Lutheran chorale, ‘Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott,’ culminating in jubilant triumph at the victory of the reformed faith, were heard with pleasure.”
- [53] Anonymuos. “Mendelssohn and the Reformation Symphony. M. Coquerel at the Lowell Institute.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 31XXI, no. 17 (November 18, 1871), p. 131: “Then came the tremendous, overwhelmingly glorious chords of Luther’s choral, and the symphony finally ended with a fugue, in which Protestant faith in the reformation triumphed in the noblest harmonies.”
- [54] G. Anfossi. “Società Orchestrale del Teatro alla Scala. Secondo concerto. Milano, 9 maggio.” *Gazzetta musicale di Milano*, vol. 52, no. 19 (May 13, 1897), p. 276: “Il fanatismo religioso prende quindi il sopravvento sul sentimento artistico ed ai soave temi melodici mendelssohniani vengono sostituiti i caratteristici canti sacri della Riforma, quegli austeri, biblici *Corali* uniformi per ritmo et intonazione che s’ergono rigidi ed acuti, come le arcate di una gotica architettura, snella e pur pesante, non ricca e pur pregevole, ricercata e non gentile, grande, ma non grandiosa. E appunto perciò che in questa composizione aleggia la fede e Mendelssohn fa da cornice—da aureola quasi—alla gigantesca figura di Lutero.”

Hector Berlioz. Overture to *Benvenuto Cellini* (1838)

- [55] Anonymus. “Berlin. Revue.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 26, no. 9 (February 28, 1872), pp. 66–9, here p. 69: “Alles kam auf’s schönste zur Geltung, natürlich auch die noch einmal kraftvoll aber unschön auftretende Hauptmelodie in der Bassposaune – ein sonderbarer Charakterzug der sehr realistisch gefärbten Kraftäusserung der der modernen und modernsten Instrumentatoren.”

Felix Mendelssohn, Symphony No. 3, *Scottish* (1842)

- [56] Felix Mendelssohn in a letter to Ferdinand David, March 12th, 1842, in *Sämtliche Briefe*, vol. 8, edited by Susanne Tomkovič, Christoph Koop and Sebastian Schmideler, Kassel et al.: Bärenreiter, 2013, p. 355: “Der Eintritt des letzten a dur 6/8 ist ohne Zweifel jetzt hundertmal besser instrumentirt. Manchmal ist man doch wie mit Blindheit geschlagen. Klingt die Melodie jetzt immer noch nicht ganz klar heraus, so laß die d Hörner stärker markiren. Und hilft auch das nicht, so autirisire ich dich hiemit feierlich die 3 Paukenwirbel in den ersten 8 Tacten wegzulassen; aber dies letzte Mittel nur in der höchsten Noth! Ich hoffe, es braucht das nicht, und klingt jetzt ordentlich deutlich und stark wie ein Männerchor (so möchte ich’s nämlich, und deswegen würd ich mich am Ende auch von der Pauke losreißen, so leid mir’s thäte).”
- [57] †, Leipzig, in: *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 44, no. 12 (March 23, 1842), coll. 253–60: “Der Charakter dieses letzten Satzes ist keck und kräftig, zuweilen fast stürmisch; in ihm tritt der volksthümliche Charakter der Motive am Klarsten und Deutlichsten hervor, die Behandlung derselben wird nach und nach immer gedrängter, chorartiger und massenhafter, bis auf merkwürdige, höchst geniale Weise kurz vor dem Schlusse noch einmal die Hauptmelodie des letzten Satzes, während die Streichinstrumente ruhig *pp*. Aushalten, in Blasinstrumenten ganz einfach vorgeführt wird und in einem langen Decrescendo nach und nach verklingt, um sofort in den großartigen und prächtigen Schluss (Maestoso assai, A dur, 6/8) überzugehen, der wie ein grosser Volkschor in gewaltiger Masse ein eigenes, begeistertes Gefühl auszusprechen scheint, auf dessen Macht und Kraft die ganze Zukunft und Hoffnung eines Volkes beruht. Die

Wirkung dieses Schlusses ist ungemein grossartig und regt unwillkürlich auf, wie wenige Musikstücke es vermögen.”

- [58] A. K., “Recension: Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, Symphonie No. 3. Op. 56, Leipzig, bei Breitkopf u. Härtel.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 45, no. 19 (May 10, 1843), coll. 341–44, here col. 343: “Dann tritt ein kurzes Allegro maestoso, 6/8, A dur, unerwartet, gleichsam ein selbständiger Hymnus, der Alles beschliessen soll, auf [...]. In feierlich prächtiger Weise und Fülle schließt das Werk.”
- [59] E. Mayer. “Revue im Stich erschienener Musikalien. Symphonie Nr. 3 von Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy. Op. 56. Partitur. Leipzig bei Breitkopf und Härtel [Schluß].” *Allgemeine Wiener Musik-Zeitung*, vol. 3, no. 148 (December 12, 1843), p. 626: „[...] und so tritt ein Moment der Ruhe und heiligen Stille ein, wie vor den Pforten eines Tempels, in welchem wir das Ziel unserer kühnsten Wünsche erreichen sollen, und den wir aus heiliger Scheu noch nicht zu betreten wagen; ein Moment einer Größeres verheißenden Sammlung, der auch endlich im Allegro maestoso assai, 6/8 A-dur mit einem eben so erhaben sich aufschwingenden Thema, von Violon, Horn, Fagott und Clarinett eingeführt, als ebenso innigen und lieblichen Thema, in immer größerer Verstärkung zur beseligenden Vollendung führt, zum Momente, wo der Siegesjubel alle Erinnerungen und gehabte stürmische und schmerzensbange Kämpfe überschallt, und man rufen möchte: ‚Heil dir vollendet majestätischer Siegerin!‘
- [60] Felix Bamberg. “Die Pariser Concert-Saison.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 47, no. 14 (April 2, 1845), coll. 233–5, here col. 234: “Der letzte Satz, Allegro in A moll, hat wieder einige Längen, entschädigt aber durch den in der That majestätischen Schluss.”
- [61] H. Kr. “Berlin. Kammermusik.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 1, no. 5 (February 3, 1847), pp. 47–8, here p. 48: “Die vier Sätze sind zusammenhängend und folgen unmittelbar aufeinander; sie bilden so gewissermaßen einen ganzen Lebensabschnitt, dessen verschiedene Situationen in den einzelnen Sätzen bald elegisch, erotisch, bald neckisch, im letzten Satze kriegerisch und siegend gezeichnet sind.”
- [62] Anonymous. “The Birmingham Musical Festival.” *The Musical World*, vol. 24, no. 36 (September 8, 1849), pp. 564–9, here p. 568: “[...] the fire and impetuosity imparted to the whole of that movement, and the magnificent ensemble of the hymn of thanksgiving with which the symphony so nobly concludes, were such as we have rarely heard, even in London [...].”
- [63] Anonymous. “Philharmonic Society.” *The Musical World*, vol. 32, no. 12 (March 25, 1854), pp. 198–9, here p. 199: “The *adagio*, one of Mendelssohn’s finest inspirations, and the *finale*, with its exciting and majestic *coda*, were so well played as to make amends for the deficiencies of the first two movements.”
- [64] Anonymous. “Concerts. Second orchestral concert.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 8, no. 11 (December 15, 1855), pp. 85–6, here p. 86: “There is a short finale, in A major, in kindred rhythm and melody with the first Allegro, but with a bold and somewhat swaggering pomp of movement, as if all were breaking up and marching off home from a glorious festival.”
- [65] Anonymous. “Concert-Bericht.” *Monatschrift für Theater und Musik*, vol. 3, no. 1 (January 1857), pp. 50–6, here p. 51: “Zu der Tempo-Frage zurückkehrend, können wir uns mit dem Scherzo, dem Adagio und dem ersten Theil des Finales, keineswegs aber mit dem letzten Allegro assai maestoso ♩ = 104 einverstanden erklären, welch letzteres etwa ♩ = 80, daher jedenfalls,—auch in Bezug auf den Character eines Schluss-Triumphgesanges, zu langsam, zu gedehnt erschien.”
- [66] G. A. Macfarren. “Programme zu Konzerten.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 4, no. 21 (May 26, 1869), pp. 161–4, here p. 163: “Sie [sc. the coda] besteht gänzlich aus der einzigen breiten, strömenden Melodie, welche während ihrer Dauer dem Ohre in steigender Anschwellung sich vernehmlich macht, weil die Instrumentation beständig voller und voller wird, bis die den höchsten Punkt der Kraft erreicht, und damit dieses Meisterwerk einem würdigen Schlusse zuführt. Mendelssohn sagte, dass er bei der Abfassung dieser Coda fühlte, dass die Arbeit von Jahren vollendet war, und dass er glücklich, wenn nicht stolz war, sein

Werk so beendet zu haben.”

- [67] W. A. Lampadius. *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy. Gesamtbild seines Lebens und Wirkens*. Leipzig: F. E. C. Leuckart, 1886, p. 78: “Es ist ein Kampf der Elemente und menschlicher tragischer Leidenschaft, den diese Symphonie darstellt, eine kaum zu ertragende Melancholie, wenn nicht im letzten Satz noch die Sonne des Friedens durchbräche.”
- [68] Ernst Wolff. *Mendelssohn Bartholdy*. Berlin: Harmonie, 1906, p. 154: “Den Schluss des Ganzen bildet ein getragenes, weit von der Schablone abweichendes Allegro maestoso assai (A-dur, 6/8), das sich in mächtiger Steigerung aufbaut; es folgt wie ein feierlicher Siegesgesang auf den tobenden Kampf des Allegro guerriero. Dem Tondichter schwebte dabei die Klangfarbe eines Männerchores vor.”

Friedrich von Flotow, Overture to *Alessandro Stradella* (1844)

- [69] Anonymous. “Chronique départementale.” *La Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris*, vol. 32, no. 19 (May 7, 1865), p. 151: “L’hymne finale qui sauve la vie de Stradella, et qui sert de thème à l’ouverture, est une inspiration des plus remarquables qui émeut vivement.”

Richard Wagner, Overture to *Tannhäuser* (1845)

- [70] F. K. “Nachrichten. Weimar.” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 50, no. 49 (Dezember 6, 1848), coll. 794–8, here col. 795: “Endlich das christlich-gläubige, getragen von dem frommen Pilgergesange, welcher die Overture beginnt und in immer machtvollerer Instrumentation sich breiter und breiter entfaltend das Werk abschließt.”
- [71a] Theodor Uhlig. “Die Overtüre zu Wagners *Tannhäuser*.” *Bayreuther Blätter*, vol. 27, No. 7 (July–September 1904) [originally published 1851], pp. 237–46, here p. 240: “[...] nachdem das Treiben im Venusberge e) den höchsten Gipfel erreicht hat, beginnt wie von ferne f) der Choral, kommt näher und immer näher und breitet sich endlich mit siegreicher Allmacht in vollster Kraft und alleiniger Geltung aus.”
- [71b] Theodor Uhlig. “Die Overtüre zu Wagners *Tannhäuser*.” *Bayreuther Blätter*, vol. 27, No. 7 (July–September 1904) [originally published 1851], pp. 237–46, here p. 246: “Dieses Programm muss die Hauptidee des Dramas und der Overtüre nennen, die Introduction der letzteren als den ‚Choral der Pilger‘, den Hauptteil des Allegro als die ‚Venusbergmusik‘ und den Schluss desselben als die ‚siegreiche Wiederkehr des Chorals‘ bezeichnen.”
- [72] Franz Liszt. *Lohengrin e Tannhäuser de Richard Wagner*. Leipzig: F. A. Brockhaus, 1851, p. 150: “Bientôt on entend venir de loin un chœur de pèlerins; durant ses pauses la voix du berger qui se recommande à leurs prières, forme un nouveau contraste, longtemps maintenu par le retour du refrain en guise de contre point figuré, qui suspend et enguirlande sa mélodie pastorale, semblable à un festonnage de fleurs champêtres, sur les graves contours du pieux cantique, s’élevant comme les arceaux d’une voûte ogivale. Les pèlerins approchent, paraissent, s’avancent, et leur chant où se trouve intercalé la seconde moitié du thème religieux de l’ouverture, est d’une calme et pieuse solennité. Dans cette quiétude, des élans exaltés vibrent cependant, et l’on y discerne une extase contenue, un secret ravissement.” (English version: 74c)
- [73] Friedrich Chrysander. “Über Wagner’s *Tannhäuser*.” *Zeitschrift der Internationalen Musik-Gesellschaft*, vol. 5, no. 5 (1904) [originally published 1852], pp. 208–219, here p. 217: “Die beiden Grundmotive, der Pilger- und der Venusgesang, lösen einander ab, und zwar so, daß die einfache Pilgerweise zuerst ertönt, ohne Mißlaut, in tiefer Ruhe, wie um anzudeuten, eine himmlische Kraft throne über der folgenden Verwirrung, diese lösend und heilend. Hierauf der Venusgesang; nach dessen rollendem Verschwinden wieder die Pilgerweise und zwar mit all

der Kraft und Freudigkeit, welche ein errungener Sieg verleiht. Durch diese einfache Gliederung ist das Ganze licht und klar und von ergreifender Wirkung.”

- [74a] Franz Liszt. “Wagner’s ‘Tannhäuser’ (translated by the editor) I.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 4, no. 8 (November 26, 1853), pp. 57–8, here p. 58: “The quivering, spasmodic tones now groan, now command in lawless alternation, until the resistless yearning for the infinite, the religious *thema*, gradually comes in again, subdues to itself all these sounds, melts them together into a sublime harmony and unfolds the wings of a triumphal hymn to their fullest breadth.”
- [74b] Franz Liszt. “Wagner’s ‘Tannhäuser’ (translated by the editor) II.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 4, no. 9 (December 3, 1853), pp. 65–6, here p. 65: “[...] the figure in sixteenth-triplets, repeating itself only in every second measure, produces a decrease of the rhythm, corresponding to the decrease of power and fullness.”
- [74c] Franz Liszt. “Wagner’s ‘Tannhäuser’ (translated by the editor) IV.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 4, no. 10 (December 10, 1853), pp. 73–5, here p. 74: “The pilgrims approach [...] and their song, in which the second half of the religious theme of the overture is interwoven, wears a calm and serenely pious character. In this repose, however, there vibrates a certain exaltation and enthusiasm and you can distinguish in it an enduring ecstasy, a secret uncontainable delight.”
- [75] Richard Wagner. “Richard Wagner. Tannhäuser. The overture to it. Synopsis of the overture to it.” *The Musical World*, vol. 31, no. 51 (December 17, 1853), pp. 795–6, here p. 795: “A procession of pilgrims is passing. Their chant, full of faith and penitence, pervading our hope and trust in salvation, is heard gradually approaching; then, close at hand, it swells into a mighty wave, and finally retires” [= English translation of 103a; English translation also in *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 24, no. 17 (November 12, 1864), pp. 338–9].
- [76] Wagner quoted in Anonymous. “Zwei Programme.” *Fliegende Blätter für Musik*, vol. 1, no. 2 (1855), pp. 76–8: “Ihr Gesang, gläubig, reuevoll und bußfertig, zur Hoffnung und Zuversicht des Heils sich erhebend, nähert sich im Anfange, schwillt dann – wie in nächster Nähe – zum mächtigen Ergüsse an und entfernt sich endlich” [English translation: 75].
- [77] Anonymous. “First Philharmonic concert.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 20, no. 16 (January 18, 1862), pp. 334–5, here p. 334: “It [sc. the overture] is imposing, startling in its effect, contrasting solemn religious tranquillity and triumph with delirious, despairing rapture of the senses [...]”
- [78] Anonymous. “First Philharmonic concert.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 10, no. 15 (January 10, 1857), pp. 117–8, here p. 118: “The Mendelssohn *Notturmo*, that delicious bit of dream music, had lost nothing of its charm. It could pass for an intermezzo, remote enough in character, between the Faust yearnings and despairs, and the Tannhäuser chorus of the Pilgrims who had found rest, and whose song therefore breathes the pure joy and satisfaction of the soul that has found God. We were all familiar with the strain as introduced in the beginning and conclusion of the overture. Here it is first sung (to words above) by male voices in the same rich four-part harmony, followed by hallelujahs, and then repeated in unison *fortissimo*, with the tremendous accompaniment of violin figures, as in the overture.”
- [79] Anonymous. “France. Paris.” *Le Guide musical*, vol. 5, no. 48 (January 26, 1860), p. 191: “A l’une de répétitions, dit la Presse Théâtrale, après le magnifique Chant de Pèlerins, de *Tannhäuser*, l’effet a été tellement saisissant que les exécutants en masse sont levés et ont applaudi avec enthousiasme d’un effet véritablement irrésistible.”
- [80] Richard Pohl. *Richard Wagner: Studien und Kritiken*. Leipzig: Bernhard Schlicke, 1883, p. 10: “Wir müssen den Tannhäuser noch sterben sehen, Wolfram verzweifeln an der Bahre der Elisabeth, von Fackeln umgeben, im engen Thalgrund, wo die Morgenröte den Venusberg magisch durchglüht, und dazu den Friedensgesang der Versöhnung hören: ‘Der Gnade Heil ist dem Büsser beschieden. / Er geht nun ein in den seligen Frieden.’ Das ist eine Andacht, die das Herz erschüttert.”

- [81] Anonymous. "Tannhaeuser a l'opera en 1861." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 41, no. 20 (May 19, 1895), pp. 463–8, here p. 467 (quotations from Saint-Valry): "De cette réprobation générale sont exceptée l'ouverture, 'symphonie curieuse, compliquée et infiniment trop longue', chœur des pèlerins, 'très belle inspiration où le sentiment religieux est exprimé avec grandeur et onction', la marche, la prière d'Elisabeth."
- [82] Francis Hueffer. *Richard Wagner*. 3rd edition London: Sampson Low, Marston, Searle, and Rvington, 1888 [original edition 1872], p. 23–4: "The overture itself is a master-piece of its kind: it foreshadows the keynote of the drama itself, the victory of good over evil, the former represented by the solemn strains of the Pilgrims' Chorus, the latter by the sensuous melodies which accompany the joys of the Venusberg."
- [83] Engelbert Humperdinck. "Wintergedanken über Sommerfreuden." *Bayreuther Blätter*, vol. 15, no. 2 (February–March 1892), pp. 57–60, here p. 60: "[...] dazu die ernste, feierliche Vollstimmigkeit des vorbeiziehenden Pilgerchores [...]."
- [84a] Edouard Schuré. *Le Drame Musical: Richard Wagner. Son Œuvre et son Idée*. Paris: Librairie académique Didier, 1895, p. 50: "Mais voici l'aube; l'hymne religieux revient avec elle. A mesure qu'il se rapproche, que le jour chasse la nuit, ce murmure des airs, qui semblait, le gémissement, d'âmes, damnées, se change en un doux ondolement, et lorsque enfin le soleil se lève, lorsque le cantique éclate dans son auguste magnificence, cet ondolement devient le ruissellement d'une joie sublime. Le triomphe de l'Esprit est le salut pour tous. La montagne maudite est délivrée, son peuple purifié se joint à l'hymne rédempteur."
- [84b] Edouard Schuré. *Le Drame Musical: Richard Wagner. Son Œuvre et son Idée*. Paris: Librairie académique Didier, 1895, p. 64: "Sur la sombre vallée émerge le soleil; l'hymne triomphal de l'ouverture sort de cent bouches et roule ses ondes magnifiques sur le corps inanimés des amants qui ont cessé de souffrir. Il s'élève maintenant comme le puissant soupir de l'humanité espérante et militante, qui monte incessamment de la terre aux cieux et emporte sur ses ailes les âmes des élus."
- [84c] Edouard Schuré. *Le Drame Musical: Richard Wagner. Son Œuvre et son Idée*. Paris: Librairie académique Didier, 1895, p. 48: "Leur chant plein de foi et de repentir célèbre l'espérance de salut."
- [85] Max Seiling. "Auch ein Jubiläum." *Bayreuther Blätter*, vol. 24, no. 7 (July–September 1901), pp. 254–258, here p. 255: "Dies erste Anhören Wagner'scher Musik, zumal des Pilgerchores, machte auf mich einen ganz unvergesslichen Eindruck: ich fühlte mich wie von einem Zauber umspinnen."
- [86] William James Henderson. *Richard Wagner, His Life and His Dramas: A Biographical Study of the Man and an Explanation of His Work*. New York and London: G. P. Putnam's son, 1923 [original ed. 1902], p. 266: "This thought is employed as the melody of a chorus of pilgrims, and it reappears in a triumphant proclamation at the end of the drama when the good principle emerges victorious from the battle against the evil [example]. The intoning of this solemn melody is interrupted in the overture by the intrusion of the music of the bacchanalian orgies in the cave of Venus [...]" (cf. pp. 261 and 263).
- [87] Alfred Ernst. "L'art de Richard Wagner." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 52, no. 49 (December 9, 1906), pp. 775–8, here p. 775: "Nous citons dans un paragraphe précédent l'attribution du ton de *mi b* majeur, dans la troisième acte de *Tannhäuser*, à l'élément religieux, chrétien, dont le chœur de pèlerins et mélodiquement et harmoniquement le cantique essentiel et la caractérisation triomphante."
- [88] W. J. Robson. "The Overture Tannhäuser, Wagner." *Musical Canada*, vol. 3II, no. 10 (February 1, 1909), p. 411: "As this subsides the Pilgrim's song returns, and growing ever more and more powerful and triumphant, finally proclaims the heavenly message of deliverance in a climax to the majesty of which the literature of music offers few parallels. The noble theme, thundered out on the trombones with the emphasis of a Divine command, the feverish, passionate insistence of the clarionetes, with which ever growing excitement, incessantly repeats a figure

expressing the ‘pulse of life’ [...], combine to produce an effect the sustained grandeur of which, had Wagner written nothing else, would alone have placed him among the great ones of the earth.”

Anton Rubinstein, *Symphony No. 2, Ocean* (1851)

- [89] –f. “Die musicalische Winter-Saison in Holland.” *Niederrheinische Musik-Zeitung*, vol. 6, no. 51 (December 18, 1858), pp. 402–3, here p. 403: “Die mit feinsten Nuancierung von den Violinen, Flöten und Oboen ausgeführten Crescendo’s und Diminuendo’s, so wie der im vierten Satze von den Blech-Instrumenten gleichsam gesungene Choral verdienen unsere besondere Anerkennung.”
- [90] Anonymous. “Correspondenzen: Leipzig.” *Deutsche Musik-Zeitung*, vol. 1, no. 10 (March 3, 1860), p. 79–80, here p. 80: “Der am Schluss eintretende Choral schien uns störend; ein solches ganz fremdes Element gehört sicher nicht in ein reines Instrumentalwerk, dem kein ausführliches Programm ausdrücklich zu Grunde gelegt ist.”
- [91] A. de Gasperini. “Revue de concerts.” *Le Ménestrel*, vol. 33, no. 1 (December 3, 1865), p. 4–5, here p. 5: “A ce moment, un large cantique de joie, d’adoration, plane sur la mer rassénérée, cantique qui monte de plus en plus dans les inaccessibles régions de la prière.”
- [92] Anonymous. “Bruxelles.” *Le Guide musical*, vol. 14, no. 15 (April 9, 1868), p. 113–4, here p. 114: “La majesté sereine et la profondeur infinie de l’adagio suffiraient pour justifier le titre quelque peu ambitieux de l’œuvre entière.”
- [93] Anonymous. “Liège.” *Le Guide musical*, vol. 14, no. 13 (March 26, 1868), pp. 100–1, here p. 101: “Le grandeur et la majesté de cette œuvre [...]”
- [94] Anonymous. “Rubinstein and his Ocean Symphony in New York (For the Tribune, April 1).” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 33, no. 1 (April 19, 1873), p. 4: “The finale leads up to a magnificent climax in Luther’s choral, gradually introduced with many ingenious progressions and scored with surprising richness—a hymn in recognition of the Almighty who holds the sea in the hollow of his hands.”
- [95] Anonymous. “The Ocean Symphony.” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 33, no. 4 (May 31, 1873), p. 31: “[...] *Finale*, consisting of a short *Adagio* leading into an *Allegro con fuoco*, in the original C-major key, which moderates in tempo before concluding with a strong religious Chorale in full chords (by no means ‘Ein feste Burg,’ as several of the New York critics wrote of it!). [...] The finale did impress us more this time, especially the religious choral portion toward the close.”
- [96] Emil Naumann. “Dresden, den 25. Februar.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 29, no. 9 (March 4, 1875), pp. 67–8, here p. 68: “Das Gebet, das den letzten Satz eröffnet und schließt, mit den in geistreicher Behandlung und reizvoller Mischung ihrer Klänge fortschreitenden Holzbläsern über den wogenden Figuren des Streichorchesters ist coloristisch höchst interessant und wirkungsvoll.”
- [97] Emil Naumann. “Dresden, den 25. Februar [part 2].” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 29, no. 10 (March 11, 1875), p. 75–6: “Nirgends auch tritt hier eine Stockung des wohlthuenden Flusses des Tönestromes oder eine Unterbrechung der edlen Haltung, die dem Ganzen eigen ist, ein, was nach dem coupirten und zerrissenen Wesen der vorhergehenden Sätze doppelt wirkt.”
- [98] August Wilhelm Ambros. “Rubinstein as opera, oratorio and symphony composer (translated for this journal).” *Dwight’s Journal of Music*, vol. 36, no. 11 (September 2, 1876), pp. 289–90, here p. 290: “[...] the roar of the waves is the organ tone, the altar tapers shine in the eternal stars, masses of mist ascend as incense, and in procession [*recte* ‘as curtain’] before the altar move the clouds! There all turns of itself to a solemn choral, such as Rubinstein employs with thrilling power for the last movement of his Symphony. As it resounds in mighty trombone

chords, while the stringed instruments storm against it and again sink into the deep, one is reminded of the sublime sentence in the Old Testament: ‘Then the Lord said to the sea: Thus far shalt thou go and no farther, here are thy bounds, etc.’”

- [99] Aug. Morel. “Concerts annoncés.” *Le Ménestrel*, vol. 43, no. 11 (February 11, 1877), p. 86: “[...] le finale, d’un mouvement modéré, se termine par de grands accords en forme de choral.”
- [100] A. M. “Concerts et soirées.” *Le Ménestrel*, vol. 44, no. 1 (December 2, 1877), p. 7: “Le final, très-mouvementé se termine majestueusement par un motif de choral d’une grande puissance d’effet.”
- [101] Anonymous. “Concerts et auditions musicales.” *La Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris*, vol. 44, no. 48 (December 2, 1877), p. 381–2, here p. 382: “Après le finale, qui termine avec effet un beau choral, hymne de reconnaissance de passagers échappés aux tempêtes, trois formidables salves d’applaudissements ont éclaté [...]”
- [102] Anonymous. “Berichte: Leipzig.” *Musikalisches Centralblatt*, vol. 3, no. 3 (January 18, 1883), p. 26–8, here p. 27: “Dem Schlusssatze hat der Componist einen Choral einverleibt, der uns jedoch in die ganze Anlage dieses Satzes nicht so ganz hinein zu passen schien, jedenfalls nicht den Eindruck hervorbrachte, den er hervorbringen sollte.”
- [103] Anonymous. “Marseille.” *Le Guide musical*, vol. 38, no. 50 (December 11, 1892): p. 361–2, here p. 362: “Je me risque à déclarer que j’admire l’*Océan* au plus haut point, que, comme clarté du plan, noblesse du style, sentiment poétique, en juste concordance avec le sujet, abondance et naturel de la mélodie, cette symphonie me paraît égaler toutes celles venues depuis Beethoven.”
- [104] Anonymous. “Second Concert by the Philharmonic.” *Musical America*, vol. 7, no. 4 (December 7, 1907), p. 8: “There was a fine spiritual uplift in the last movement [...]”

Franz Liszt, *Battle of the Huns* (1857)

- [105] Anonymous. “Domenico, Vienna, 14 dicembre.” *Gazzetta musicale di Milano*, vol. 30, no. 52 (December 26, 1875), pp. 426–7, here p. 427: “[...] il frenetico giubilo dei vincitori.”
- [106] Richard Pohl. *Franz Liszt: Studien und Erinnerungen*. Leipzig: Bernhard Schlicke, 1883, p. 401: “Immer fanatischer wogt der Vernichtungskampf, immer grimmiger wird das Gewühl—bis plötzlich Licht durch die finsternen Wolken blitzt: es geht vom siegenden Kreuze aus. Mächtige Fanfaren verkünden den Triumph des Christentums!”
- [107] G. B. Nappi. “I concerti della Società del Quartetto.” *Gazzetta musicale di Milano*, vol. 41, no. 50 (December 12, 1886), pp. 366–7, here p. 367: “Del lungo pezzo preferisco il secondo periodo, là dove l’organo entra in scena a produrre un bellissimo contrasto cogli effetti strumentali, unendosi poi all’ orchestra, nell’intonare un grandioso soggetto di carattere corale.”
- [108] Arthur Seidl. “Die Leipziger Erinnerungsfeier zum Andenken an Franz Liszt (Fortsetzung).” *Kastners Wiener musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 3, no. 9 (December 12, 1886), pp. 129–34, here p. 131–2: “[...] bis zum endgiltigen Sieg der christlichen Idee, symbolisch angedeutet durch die Weise des Choralen und deren musikalischen Sieg.”
- [109] Franz Liszt, quoted in Amédée Boutarel. “Revue de Grands Concerts.” *Le Ménestrel*, vol. 69, no. 2 (January 11, 1903), p. 13: “Les deux thèmes se rapprochant toujours, finirent par se toucher, s’êtreindre, lutter corps à corps, comme deux géants, jusqu’à ce que celui qui s’identifie avec le vrai divin, la charité universelle, les progrès dans l’humanité, l’espérance transmondaine, fût victorieux et répandit sur toutes choses son jour radieux, transfigurant, éternel!”
- [110] M.-D. Calvocoressi. *Franz Liszt*, Paris: Librairie Renouard, 1906, p. 83: “*La Batailles de Huns*, où se trouve un identique mouvement, montre de même un tumulte initial qui s’apaise peu à peu pour céder la place à un hymne triomphant.”

- [111] Arthur Hahn. *Liszt, Symphonische Dichtungen (Meisterführer no. 8)*, Berlin: Schlesinger'sche Buch- und Musikhandlung, 1910, p. 148: "Nach nochmaliger kurzer Steigerung fällt endlich der Choral fortissimo ein, jetzt in raschem Tempo als rauschender Siegesgesang dahinstürmend, in den das gesamte Orchester im Verein mit der Orgel einstimmt."
- [112] J. Jemain. "Concerts-Lamoureux." *Le Ménestrel*, vol. 76, no. 3 (January 15, 1910), p. 21: "Deux thèmes, l'un symbolisant la furie des passions barbares, l'autre la force calme et sereine en sa douceur de l'idée chrétienne, luttent en des épisodes de saisissants contrastes jusqu'à la péroraison vraiment grandiose, où le *Crux fidelis* du chant grégorien s'établit enfin victorieux en sa majesté reposante. Une éblouissante instrumentation, des rythmes sauvages du plus curieux effet, une onction impressionnante font de cette page [...]."

Josef Rheinberger, *Symphony No. 1, Wallenstein* (1866)

- [113] A. Ritter. "Rheinberger, Jos., Op. 10. Wallenstein. Symphonisches Tongemälde für Orchester, Part. Leipzig E. W. Fritzsch." *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 23, no. 31 (August 4, 1869), pp. 249–51, here p. 250: "Das nun glänzend auftretende Maëstoso in Dur bringt in den Bläsern jenes choralartige Motiv, welchem wir zuerst in der Durchführungspartie begegneten."

Peter Benoit, *De Schelde* (1867)

- [114] Anonymous, Belgique. "Bruxelles." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 15, no. 11 (March 18, 1869), pp. 82–84, here p. 84: "Nous annonçons, pour la semaine prochaine, la mise en vente de l'Air national *Wilhelmus van Nassauwen*, intercalé dans le grand finale de l'Oratorio *de Schelde*, et qui a provoqué un si formidable enthousiasme."
- [115a] Anonymous. "De Schelde (L'Escaut), Oratorio de M. Pierre Benoit, Opinion de Presse Belge." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 15, no. 13 (April 1, 1869), pp. 97–9, here p. 97: "La plupart des morceaux du 2^e acte, dont le *Wilhelmus-Lied* forme le couronnement, ont été particulièrement remarqués. Une sorte de commotion électrique a parcouru l'assistance après cette page grandiose, et le final entier a été repris au milieu d'unanimes acclamations. [...] Comme le *Wilhelmus-Lied* a de caractère d'un hymne, les sons du gigantesque instrument ajoutent à la grandeur de son allure."
- [115b] Anonymous. "De Schelde (L'Escaut), Oratorio de M. Pierre Benoit, Opinion de Presse Belge." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 15, no. 13 (April 1, 1869), pp. 97–9, here p. 98: "Le chant des Gueux, le *Wilhelmus Lied*, est l'âme de cette seconde partie qui provoque une émotion analogue à celle qu'on éprouve en lisant la fameuse ballade allemande, cette funèbre revue des armées impériales qui se groupent autour de leurs chefs, aux Champs Élysée; mais quelle incomparable puissance [de] toutes les voix réunies de chœurs, de l'orchestre et de l'orgue donnent à cette grandiose et solennelle impression! C'est le succès de l'œuvre au point de vue de l'effet qui est irrésistible. Le public est littéralement entraîné dans ce belliqueux tourbillon, et s'il ne se retenait pais, il finirait par faire chorus avec les exécutants, et par entonner le chant de Gueux, dont le compositeur a savamment amené l'explosion."
- [116] Anonymous. "Gand. Festival." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 21, no. 30 (July 29 and August 5, 1875), pp. 190–1, here p. 191: "Quant à l'hymne final, fièrement enlevé par le chœurs, il a excité des transports d'enthousiasme."
- [117] F. Wambach. "Correspondances. Anvers." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 44, No. 19 (May 8/15, 1898), pp. 443–4, here p. 444: "Nous n'avons pas ressenti cette fois cette forte commotion qui électrisait les masses."

Edvard Grieg, *Piano Concerto* (1869)

- [118] Hans Aufrecht. “Die Tonkünstlerversammlung des allgemeinen deutschen Musikvereins zu Magdeburg.” *Musik-Welt*, vol. I, no. 36 (June 25, 1881), pp. 412–5, here p. 414: “[...] sonst stellt es ihn, zuweilen ein wenig prahlerisch, als einen Componisten dar, welcher mehr sucht, als findet; dieses Pathos halte ich für angelernt und diese Grösse für geliehen. Reizte das Werk nicht fast durchweg den ausführenden Virtuosen, welchem darin höchstinteressante Geschenke gemacht werden: es wäre verloren, trotz seines charakteristischen Adagios und trotz seiner national-norwegischen Merkzeichen. Ich möchte diese grosse Kraft lieber spielen als ringen sehen; in diesem Concerte ringt sie mit dem Würgeengel der Originalitätssucht.”

Johannes Brahms, *Haydn Variations* (1873)

- [119] Hermann Deiters. *Johannes Brahms*. Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härte, 1889, lecture I, p. 342/24: “Außer anderen, feinen technischen Zügen interessirt namentlich der ausführliche Schlußsatz mit der immer wiederkehrenden Baßfigur, welche dann auch von anderen Instrumenten aufgenommen wird und zu der die üppigste Mannigfaltigkeit von Motiven und Figuren sich gesellt, bis in unaufhaltsamem, feierlichem Zuge, in welchem Triangel und Piccoloflöte in ganz eigenthümlicher Weise den Glanz erhöhen, das Stück ausklingt.”
- [120] Heinrich Reimann. *Johannes Brahms*. 5th ed., extended by Bruno Schrader, Berlin: Schlesische Verlagsanstalt, 1919 [original ed. 1897], p. 66: “Allmählich finden sich Anklänge an das Thema ein, immer bestimmter werdend, bis es endlich mit siegender Kraft einsetzt. So gelangt das Ganze zu einem äußerlich glänzend bewegten, innerlich aber tief beruhigenden Schluss.”
- [121] Max Kalbeck. *Johannes Brahms*, vol. 2. 2nd ed. Berlin: Deutsche Brahms-Gesellschaft, 1908, p. 473–5: “Selig der Mann, der die Prüfung bestanden hat! Ihn feiert das Finale, welches siebzehn und mehr Variationen in eine einschließt. Sie sind über einen ebenso oft wiederholten Basso ostinato aufgebaut: [example] und dieser Baß, durch rhythmische Modifikation des Hauptthemas [example] gewonnen, bringt endlich nach großartigen Steigerungen thematischer, instrumentaler und dynamischer Art das ‘Chorale St. Antoni’ im Triumphe zurück, als hätte es der oberste Feldherr der himmlischen Heerscharen mitten in das feindliche Getümmel der anstürmenden Höllensöhne hineingeworfen gehabt, damit es von seinem Heiligen herausgeholt werde.”

Pyotr Ilyich Tchaikovsky, *The Tempest* (1873)

- [122] Vladimir Stasov in a letter to Tchaikovsky (1873), quoted on http://en.tchaikovsky-research.net/pages/The_Tempest (accessed December 27th, 2017): “Starting with *the the sea*, the uninhabited island, the mighty and forbidding figure of the magician *Prospero*, then switching to the graceful and womanly *Miranda*, rather like the primordial *Eve*, she has never laid eyes on any breed of man (besides *Prospero*), until struck by the tempest she is flung ashore with the handsome youth *Ferdinand* [...]”

Bedřich Smetana. *Vltava* (1874)

- [123] Anonymous. “Music in Glasgow.” *The Musical World*, vol. 60, no. 5 (February 4, 1882), p. 71, quoting programme notes by A.M.: “[...] in broad majestic currents sweeps past Prague and the ancient and noble fortress of the Vyschrad.”
- [124] Nezaboudka Hamlet. “Heidelberg.” *Gazzetta musicale di Milano*, vol. 51, N. 4 (January 23,

1896), p. 61: “[...] il cammino attraverso le rocche spumeggianti sino al largo letto, dove tranquillamente, maestoso scorre verso Praga, accolto dall’antico e venerabile Vysherad (rocca del re), per poi sparire in lontananza agli occhi del poeta” [cf. 125].

- [125] William Ritter. *Smetana*. Paris: Félix Alcan, 1907, p. 210: “Puis s’étalant dans son lit élargi, elle roule majestueusement vers Prague où l’accueille Vysehrad antique et solennel. Ici en pleine force et gloire, la Vltava se perd aux yeux du poète dans le lointains infinis [...]” [cf. 124].
- [126] A. D. “Lille.” *Le Guide musical*, vol. 56, no. 10 (March 6, 1910), p. 197: “C’est un tableau pittoresque d’une originalité séduisante, qui décrit fort agréablement le cours de la Moldau à travers le pays de Bohême et son épanouissement majestueux dans la ville de Prague.”

Camille Saint-Saëns, Piano Concerto No. 4 (1875)

- [127] A. M. “Concert et soirées.” *Le Ménestrel*, vol. 46, no. 21 (April 25, 1880), p. 166–7, here p. 166: “le finale don’t les motifs ont une allure de choral d’un grand caractère.”
- [128] Otto Neitzel. *Camille Saint-Saëns*. Berlin: Harmonie, 1899, p. 71: “Mehr der Improvisation sich zuneigend, obschon zuerst der Variation folgend, im Scherzo (Allegro vivace) und im letzten $\frac{3}{4}$ -Tact mit seinen majestätischen Unisonen wieder regelmässig gearbeitet, ist das vierte Concert.”
- [129a] Émile Baumann. *Le Grandes Formes de la Musique. L’Œuvre de Camille Saint-Saëns*. Paris: Société d’éditions littéraires et artistiques, 1905, p. 230: “Involontairement, le concerto en *ut* mineur représente les deux périodes successives des destinées humaines: d’abord les antiques fatalités; puis la délivrance, la révélation de la béatitude; et, dans l’acceptation passagère des pesantes limites terrestres, une activité régénérée, des espoirs sans bornes.”
- [129b] Émile Baumann. *Le Grandes Formes de la Musique. L’Œuvre de Camille Saint-Saëns*. Paris: Société d’éditions littéraires et artistiques, 1905, p. 231: “Graduellement, ce désir se dramatise, une agitation colossale s’accélère au piano, et au bout de son trille en octaves, qui s’exaspère comme le cri d’une attente frénétique le choral apparaît, dépassant sa beauté première, en *ut* majeur et à trois temps: [exemple]. Il apporte le message de paix, le nôme d’une existence identifiée pour jamais au Principe de toute joie. Le piano le proclame avec le frémissement de trompettes sacrées. Quoique nettement close, par la fière impulsion du rythme elle ouvre à l’allégresse un champ illimité, et se développe dans une immense plénitude, forme idéale d’une cité d’élus. Saint-Saëns transfigure ainsi son lyrisme: en effaçant les modes fragiles de sa sensibilité sous le triomphe de la règle, sous une apothéose liturgique, il met en son chant les prémices d’une vie béatifiée, il prélude au cantique qui sortira des êtres unanimes, à l’aurore de la résurrection.”

Peter Benoit, Overture to *Charlotte Corday* (1876)

- [130a] M. Th. “Belgique. Bruxelles.” *Le Guide musical*, vol. 23, no. 16 (April 19, 1877), pp. 121–2, here p. 122: “Et le tout se termine, comme l’ouverture, par la *Marseillaise*, entonnée sur un mouvement très-lent, comme une sorte d’hymne personnifiant la grande œuvre de la Révolution.”
- [130b] M. Th. “Belgique. Bruxelles.” *Le Guide musical*, vol. 27, no. 17 (April 28, 1881), pp. 132–3, here p. 132: “C’est une page puissante, colorée, volontairement hachée et heurtée, afin de préparer l’explosion finale de la *Marseillaise*, traité comme un choral, dans un mouvement très-lent, très-largement.”
- [131] Philibert Chalarieu. “Concerts populaires.” *L’Art musical*, vol. 22, no. 48 (December 6, 1883), p. 380: “La *Marseillaise* y règne d’un bout à l’autre: elle ouvre le morceau [...] et finit par être

jouée comme le grands thèmes de Wagner, par les cuivres omnipotents, accompagnés ici d'une de ces tenues persistantes des violons qui passionnent l'ouverture."

- [132] H. Barbedette. ["Concerts et soirées."] *Le Ménestrel*, vol. 50, no. 2.1 (9 December 1883), p. 16: "En combinant ces trois motifs sujets, l'auteur arrive à une explosion saisissante, où dominent les mâles accents de *la Marseillaise*."
- [133] Balthasar Claes. "La Musique Belge." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 35, no. 40 (October 6, 1889), pp. 236–7, here p. 237: "Mais je ne comprends pas dans quelle intention, quand *la Marseillaise* est rappelée à la fin en guise de péroration et de couronnement triomphal, l'auteur lui a donné cette allure pesante, cette couleur terne et opaque."

Johannes Brahms, Symphony No. 1 (1876)

- [134] Anonymous. "The new symphony by Brahms (from the *London Times*)."
Dwight's Journal of Music, vol. 37, no. 2 (April 28, 1877), p. 9–10, here p. 10: "The coda, where the time is increased to '*più allegro*,' is glorious, and brings to a triumphant end a great, though unequal, work."
- [135] Anonymous. "The C-minor Symphony by Brahms." *Dwight's Journal of Music*, vol. 37, no. 19 (December 22, 1877), pp. 149–50: "But these defects are richly compensated by the bold, majestic way in which the final movement builds itself up."
- [136] Anonymous. "Cincinnati (May 14): Orchestra and College choir concert." *Dwight's Journal of Music*, vol. 39, no. 995 (June 7, 1879), pp. 95–6, here p. 95: "There is an earnestness and nobility pervading every part [...]."
- [137] Anonymous. "Stuttgart (Schluss)." *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, vol. 16, no. 51 (December 21, 1881), coll. 809–12, here col. 811: "Dieser letzte Satz ist ein Siegeshymnus der erhabensten Art."
- [138] Hermann Deiters. *Johannes Brahms*. Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härte, 1889, lecture I, p. 344/26: "Von allem Glanze des Orchesters ist dieser Schlusssatz getragen, der nach allen Kämpfen, Zweifeln, Hoffnungen die Siegesstimmung malt und wie ein Triumphzug vorüberschreitet."
- [139] Richard Barth. *Johannes Brahms und seine Musik*, Hamburg: Otto Meißner, 1904, p. 46: "[...] und nun setzt die herrliche, breite Melodie der ‚zehnten‘ Symphonie ein und reißt uns mehr und mehr und hinein in den Taumel des Entzückens, Triumphes und göttlicher Freude, wie er höher und berauschender nicht zu denken und wohl auch nicht zu überbieten ist!"
- [140] Arthur L. Tubbs. "Philadelphia Gives Hofmann Ovation." *Musical America*, vol. 19, no. 4 (November 29, 1913), p. 40: "Its academic austerity, if one chooses to call it thus, never oppressed, for the melodious message back of it all was glowingly delivered, and the grandeur of it made manifest."
- [141] H. E. Krehbiel. "An Interesting Concert for Charity—Brahm's First Symphony Superbly Played." *Musical America*, vol. 19, no. 17 (February 28, 1914), p. 20: "[...] this noble symphony [...]."

Anton Bruckner, Symphony No. 5 (1876)

- [142] M. R. "Correspondances: Berlin." *Le Guide musical*, vol. 44, no. 44 (October 30, 1898), pp. 809–10, here p. 810: "Les périodes fuguées et déclamées alternent en progression jusqu'à l'entrée du second orchestre formé de quatre cors, trois trompettes, trois trombones et un basse-tuba. C'est absolument grandiose quand la masse métallique attaque le choral tandis que les gros instruments de l'orchestre chevauchent et que tous les thèmes s'éparpillent aux voix supérieures."

Pyotr Ilyich Tchaikovsky, *Swan Lake* (1877)

- [143] Edwin Evans. *Tchaikovsky*. London J. M. Dent and Co., 1906, p. 100: “When Siegfried discovers his error and hears the news of Odetta’s death, he also puts an end to his life, the souls of both are reunited in the magic world of everlasting happiness.”

Johannes Brahms, *Academic Festival Overture* (1880)

- [144] Carl Polko. “Musikbrief (III): Breslau.” *Musikalisches Centralblatt*, vol. 1, no. 2 (January 14, 1881), pp. 14–5, here p. 15: “[...] bis endlich alles Hin- und Herwogen der Stimmung unaufhaltsam ausbricht in ein geradezu imposant instrumentiertes und demgemäss wirkendes ‚Gaudeamus‘. Von Anfang an gefesselt, sind wir am Schluss gewonnen und überzeugt und stimmen in diesen stolzen Jubel mit ein.”
- [145] Anonymous. “Correspondenz. Breslau.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 35, no. 3 (January 20, 1881), p. 20: “[...] am Schluss in festlicher Weise das ‚Gaudeamus‘!”
- [146] Anonymous. “Richter concerts.” *The Musical World*, vol. 59, no. 21 (May 21, 1881), p. 322: “The themes of the German students’ *Lieder*, so ingeniously treated by Brahms, all stood out with admirable clearness, the familiar ‘Gaudeamus igitur’ being a truly exultant climax.”
- [147] M. G. “Berliner Aufführungen. Die königliche Kapelle.” *Musik-Welt*, vol. 1, no. 54 (October 29, 1881), pp. 592–3, here p. 593: “Eine Ausarbeitung, reich an kunstvollen Umformungen, Verschlingungen und Verwebungen [...] führt zu einer Steigerung, welche [...] schließlich zur Schlussgipfelung führt: zu dem ‚Gaudeamus igitur‘. Die pompöse Darstellung desselben beschäftigt das ganze Orchester, Becken und Triangel eingeschlossen.”
- [148] Anonymous. “Correspondenz. Das Musikfest in Bonn.” *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung*, vol. 39, no. 29 (July 16, 1885), pp. 228–9, here p. 228: “Festouverture [...], deren ‚Gaudeamus igitur‘ den Jubel der zahlreichen Bonner Studenten wachrief.”
- [149] Hermann Deiters. *Johannes Brahms*. Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1889, lecture II, p. 91/19: “Er nimmt Theil an dem frohen Jubel, ihm wird wohl dabei [...] und läßt die Freude schließlich in dem vom ganzen Instrumentenchore gespielten ‚Gaudeamus‘ brausend ausklingen.”
- [150] Johannes Brahms, letter to Charles Villiers Stanford printed in Pascall, “Johannes Brahms,” p. 105: “Ich wunderte mich nämlich bisweilen und meinte, die Studenten namentlich sollten es sich doch gar nicht nehmen lassen, den Schluß der Ouvertüre mitzusingen!”
- [151] Heinrich Reimann. *Johannes Brahms*. 5th ed., extended by Bruno Schrader, Berlin: Schlesische Verlagsanstalt, 1919 [original ed. 1897], p. 71: “All diese Lieder oder aus Liedern abgeleitete Motive werden mit vollendeter Kunst miteinander verbunden [...] bis nach der Steigerung gegen den Schluß hin als allgemeiner Jubel- und Festgesang (in der Weise des ‚God save the King‘ in Webers Jubelouverture) das ‚Gaudeamus‘ einsetzt, von auf- und abwirbelnden Passagen der Violinen, dann der tiefen Saiteninstrumente begleitet.”
- [152] C. A. B. “Antworten, III.” *Zeitschrift der Internationalen Musik-Gesellschaft*, vol. 3, no. 2 (1901), p. 85: “Commencing with the words ‘Hört, ich sing das Lied der Lieder, Hört es, meine deutschen Brüder’ it [sc. the song ‘Der Landesvater’] forms a sort of National Hymn of German students, and then in conjunction with specially solemn student ceremonies.”
- [153a] Max Kalbeck. *Johannes Brahms*, vol. 3. Berlin: Deutsche Brahms-Gesellschaft, 1910, p. 254: “Erst bei der letzten, von Moll endgültig nach Dur übergehenden Durchführung tritt sie im Fortissimoglanze des vollen Orchesters hervor, um dann, thematisch verbunden mit den Weisen des Landesvaters und des Fuchsriffs, in das majestätisch abschließende ‘Gaudeamus’ zu münden, das gleichsam als wogender Ozean der Freude sämtliche Zuflüsse in sich aufnimmt. [...]”
- [153b] Max Kalbeck. *Johannes Brahms*, vol. 3. Berlin: Deutsche Brahms-Gesellschaft, 1910, p. 255:

“So stürmisch und hinreißend würde das Gaudeamus bei Brahms nicht erschallen, wenn es nicht die aus dem Politischen ins Musikalische übertragenen Verwirrungen und Entwicklungen der Ouvertüre zur Voraussetzung hätte. ‚Freiheit, Ehre und Vaterland!‘, die Parole der deutschen Burschenschaft, ist auch die Devise der ‚Akademischen Festouvertüre‘.”

- [154] A. W. K. “New York’s First Brahms festival.” *Musical America*, vol. 15, no. 21 (March 30, 1912), p. 1: “[...] in the finale where the ‘Gaudeamus igitur’ enter, the chorus took part, and did well.”

Camille Saint-Saëns, Violin Concerto No. 3 (1880)

- [155] Otto Neitzel. *Camille Saint-Saëns*. Berlin: Harmonie, 1899, p. 71–2: “Zur Beschwichtigung der verstärkten Erregung des letzten Satzes dient ein Hymnus [...]”
- [156] Émile Baumann. *Le Grandes Formes de la Musique. L’Œuvre de Camille Saint-Saëns*. Paris: Société d’éditions littéraires et artistiques, 1905, p. 221: “L’allegro s’élance sur un motif nerveux, rebondissant; puis, l’hymne d’un orgueilleux triomphe (en mi majeur) se distend entre les deux phases d’un choral, contemplatif d’abord, ailé, diaphane, dardé jusqu’aux cimes, mais qui, s’incarnant dans les trombones, ressemble au cortège d’une apothéose. Le vertige du soliste, lorsqu’il sent toute une salle suspendue aux mouvements de son archet, au lieu d’aboutir à des traits extravagants, est extériorisé dans les formes exaltantes de pures mélodies, qui vont de lui à l’orchestre où leur magnificence se solennise.”

Charles Villiers Stanford, Symphony No. 3, *Irish* (1887)

- [157] A. L. T. “Stokowski offers ‘Irish’ Symphony.” *Musical America*, vol. 17, no. 19 (March 15, 1913), p. 41: “The last part also helps to justify the title, having a patriotic touch, with the introduction of two Irish melodies, ‘Remember the Glories of Brian the Brave’ and ‘Let Erin Remember the Days of Old’.”

Gustav Mahler, Symphony No. 1, *Titan* (1888)

- [158] Paul Stefan. *Gustav Mahler. Eine Studie über Persönlichkeit und Werk*. New ed. München: Piper und Co., 1920 [original ed. 1910], p. 119: “Noch lauterer Aufschwung, die sieben Hörner müssen alles, auch die Trompeten, übertönen. Wie ein Choral des Paradieses klingt nach den Höllenwogen ihr starker Klang. Gerettet!”
- [159] Richard Specht. *Gustav Mahler*. Leipzig and Berlin: Schuster und Löffler, 1913, p. 203–4: “Oder wenn sich nach neuer, eisern angespannter Gegeneinanderführung der thematischen Schlachtordnung plötzlich alles lichtet, das sieghafte Motiv [...] zu dem dröhnenden Weckruf der Hörner erklingt und zu anapästisch zuckenden Streichern und Pauken das Triumphthema in den Trompeten und Posaunen aufglänzt, immer mit dem trotzig auftrumpfenden Hauptmotiv hinein, strahlt plötzlich zur Vergrößerung des Hauptthemas ein stolzes Glorienthema auf: [example]. Aber erst wenn gleich darauf alles still wird, wieder gleich dem Naturlaut des Beginns sich das hohe und das tiefe d in weitem Bogen in den Streichern hinspannt und leise das Grundmotiv des Werks, die Quartenschritte des Beginns ertönen, [example] dann enthüllt sich plötzlich jenes gloriose, leuchtende sieghafte Thema als die Erfüllung jenes Beginns, als die Eroberung des Ziels, das dort hinter Morgennebeln verborgen lag, als das Gestaltwerden dessen, was zu Beginn gestaltlos hinter Schleiern stand.”

Richard Strauss, *Don Juan* (1888)

- [160] Anonymous. "Foreign notes." *The Musical World*, vol. 69, no. 48 (November 30, 1889), p. 849 (translation from German): "The writer says, 'The victorious theme of the hero, which is over and over again opposed to other manifold themes of feminine character, rises more and more through brilliant orchestral colouring to a marvellous energy.'"

Pyotr Ilyich Tchaikovsky, *Symphony No. 5* (1888)

- [161] Rosa Newmarch. *Tchaikovsky. His Life and Works*. London: William Reeves, 1908, p. 99: "The introduction to the *Finale – Andante maestoso* – is penetrated with religious feeling. [...] The *Finale* itself (*Allegro vivace*) grows gradually clearer as it proceeds, as though the heart had cast off a load of suffering and God's world shone out bright once more."

Frederic Cliffe, *Symphony No. 1* (1889)

- [162] Anonymous. "Mr. Frederic Cliffe's new symphony." *The Musical World*, vol. 69, no. 16 (April 18, 1889), p. 252: "The *Finale* contains much thematic matter of an almost old-world nature, introducing a fughetta on the first subject, and subsequently the theme of the *Ballade*, now given out as a song of triumph by the full orchestra, with a coda in 3-2 time, introducing a brilliant passage for the violins."

Zdeněk Fibich, *Komenský* (1892)

- [163] Carl Ludwig Richter [alias Anežka Schulzová⁹⁴]. *Zdenko Fibich. Eine musikalische Silhouette*. Prag: Fr A. Urbánek, 1900, p. 12: "Der Schlusssatz enthält in seinem reichen Themenmaterial eine Fülle nationalen Elementes; auch birgt er den Keim für die triumphale Coda, welche den Sieg der reformatorischen Ideen Komenský's in glanzvollen Tönen preist."

Hugo Alfvén, *Symphony No. 2* (1898)

- [164] Anonymous. "Record of current events." *The Musical World*, vol. 1, no. 10 (November, 1901), pp. 139–41, here p. 140–1: "The final movement is preceded by a dignified prelude which prepares the way for energetic fugal writing contrasted with chorale-like phrases."

Scriabin, Alexander. *Symphony No. 1* (1900)

- [165] C. M. „London Notes.“ *Zeitschrift der Internationalen Musik-Gesellschaft*, vol. 14, no. 6 (1913), p. 168: "There is no vocal work, except that the op. 26 symphony has as finale a chorus to glorify art substituted for religion."

Jean Sibelius, *Symphony No. 2* (1902)

- [166] O. D. "Sibelius's Virile Symphony Heard." *Musical America* XIII, no. 10 (14 January 1911),

⁹⁴ Tyrell, *Czech Opera*, 116.

p. 37. “The peroration at the end of this movement is simply titanic.”

Mieczysław Karłowicz, Symphony, *Rebirth* (1903)

- [167] Mieczysław Karłowicz, quoted in Keym, “Vom Patriotismus zum Pantheismus,” p. 260 (translation by the author): “The desired moment has come. The chains have been blast. Triumphant and happy, catching sight of the otherworld, the soul stands and shows all people the way to resurrection.”

Gustav Mahler, Symphony No. 5 (1904)

- [168] Paul Stefan. Gustav Mahler. *Eine Studie über Persönlichkeit und Werk*. New ed. München: Piper und Co., 1920 [original ed. 1910], p. 130: “In der gleichsam neuerlich schürfenden Coda zwei Steigerungen nach D, auf dem Höhepunkt ein Choral, aus dem der Sieg des letzten Satzes leuchtet.”
- [169] Olin Downes. “Mahler Symphony Revived by Muck.” *Musical America*, vol. 17, no. 25 (April 26, 1913), p. 8: “[...] and the fugue, with its chorale so triumphantly developed and its mighty accumulations over great thundering pedal points.”
- [170] Richard Specht. *Gustav Mahler*. Leipzig and Berlin: Schuster und Löffler, 1913, p. 289: “[...] der (im Finale erst ganz glanzvoll zur Entfaltung gelangende) Höhepunkt in einer jener schmetternden Chormelodien [...]”

DOI 10.17605/OSF.IO/KE68D

DOI 10.31219/osf.io/hgqnt