Should females play Australian football? You're asking the wrong question...

Aaron S. Fox ✉

Centre for Sport Research, School of Exercise
and Nutrition Sciences, Deakin University

Jason Bonacci

Centre for Sport Research, School of Exercise
and Nutrition Sciences, Deakin University

Samantha M. Hoffmann

Centre for Sport Research, School of Exercise
and Nutrition Sciences, Deakin University

Sophia Nimphius

Centre for Exercise and Sports Science Research,
School of Medical and Health Sciences, Edith
Cowan University
Sports Performance Research Institute New
Zealand, Auckland University of Technology

Natalie Saunders

Centre for Sport Research, School of Exercise
and Nutrition Sciences, Deakin University

Anterior cruciate ligament (ACL) injuries have been a rising concern in the early years of the women's Australian Football League (AFLW) – eliciting headlines of a “knee crisis” surrounding the league. There has been a focus on female biology as the primary factor driving the high rate of ACL injuries in the AFLW. Emphasising Australian football as being dangerous for females due to their biology may be misrepresenting a root cause of the ACL injury problem, perpetuating gender stereotypes that can restrict physical development and participation of females in the sport. We propose that that a framework addressing environmental and sociocultural factors, along with biological determinants, is required to truly challenge the ACL injury problem in the AFLW. Sports science and medicine must therefore strive to understand the whole system of female Australian football, and question how to address inequities for the benefit of the athletes.

The Australian Football League (AFL) is the major elite competition for Australian football (AF), and represents the pinnacle of the sport. In 2017, the AFL took the step of introducing an elite women's league (i.e. the AFLW) to their competition. While the introduction of this league has been viewed as a success,[1] the high rate of injury in the competition has not gone unnoticed. In particular, anterior cruciate ligament (ACL)

injuries have been acknowledged as a rising concern in the AFLW – with rates 6.2 and 9.2 times higher in the women's first two seasons compared to the men's AFL across the same years (4.31 vs. 0.7 and 6.47 vs. 0.7 per 1000 player hours in 2017 and 2018, respectively). The AFLW saw a drop in the rate of ACL injuries in the 2019 season (5.14 per 1000 player hours), however this rate remains substantially higher than other female sports.[2,3] The high-

✉ Corresponding author: aaron.f@deakin.edu.au

This work is a preprint and has not yet been peer-reviewed.

All authors have read and approved this version of the manuscript for pre-print.

Aaron S. Fox (@aaron_s_fox), Samantha M. Hoffmann (@shoffmann87), Sophia Nimphius (@DocSoph) and Natalie Saunders (@natsaunders) can be found on Twitter.

Please cite as: Fox, A.S., Bonacci, J., Hoffmann, S.M., Nimphius, S., & Saunders, N. (2020). Should females play Australian Football? You're asking the wrong question.... *SportRxiv*. doi: 10.31236/osf.io/3mqpb

rate of ACL injuries in the AFLW has been a drawcard for media attention. The 2019 season of the women's Australian Football League (AFLW) elicited media headlines of a "knee crisis"[4] after five anterior cruciate ligament (ACL) injuries in the first five rounds. A similar scenario appears to be playing out in the 2020 season, where three players sustained season ending ACL injuries in the first round of competition. Female biology is often stipulated as a primary factor in the ACL injury problem in the AFLW. Comments suggesting females are "made differently" and "more prone to do knees", [4] or that "female hormones may be related to injury"[5] are promoted as explanations. Australian football (AF) and the AFLW are important vehicles for ongoing female participation in sport. Females account for nearly one-third of the 1,649,178 AF players nationally, with the number of clubs with female teams doubling from 2016 to 2018.[1] Media attention emphasising AF as being dangerous for females due to their "biology" may be misrepresenting a root cause of the ACL injury problem, perpetuating gender stereotypes that can restrict physical development and participation of females in sport.

A biological problem, or something else?

A higher rate of ACL injuries in females over males has been observed in other sports,[2,3] with the supposition that differences due to biological sex leads to hazardous neuromechanical strategies being employed during sporting tasks.[6] However, this notion has been questioned in systematic reviews of the evidence;[7,8] and takes a myopic view that biological differences would solely explain such disparity, with no consideration of environmental and sociocultural differences due to gendered experiences.

The relative infancy of female participation in AF results in many AFLW players having limited to no AF experience during their youth.

In 2019, AFLW teams were also required to have at least two "cross-code rookies" (i.e. not played organised AF for the past three years) – a stark contrast to the typically lifelong developmental experience of men in the AFL. The combination of reduced sport-specific motor skill development acquired through deliberate practice,[9] along with very short pre-season training periods for the AFLW could create a 'perfect storm' of athletes with higher risk of ACL injury in a 'new' sport encompassing high-risk tasks.

AFLW players earned between A\$13,400 to A\$24,600 in the 2018 season.[1] The AFLW involves a condensed schedule (e.g. in 2019 the AFLW season included seven rounds plus two weeks of finals compared to the 23 rounds plus four weeks of finals in the men's competition), and subsequently AFLW salaries meet the minimum pay standards of the men's competition on a pro-rata basis. However, a significant pay gap still exists between the two competitions. Even the highest payment tier of an AFLW salary does not meet the minimum wage requirement in Australia (i.e. A\$719.20 per week, equating to A\$37,398.40 per annum), whereas the minimum base payment (A\$75,000) and average wage (A\$362,471) for the AFL[1] substantially exceeds minimum wage. AFLW players are likely managing training commitments with other employment – leading to reduced access to facilities, training opportunities and medical/athletic development staff. Additional financial support and access to environments that bridge the gap between men's and women's AF can maximise opportunities to prepare players to meet the sport demands.

What happens when these issues are addressed?

There is evidence to support the notion that addressing differences in experience, skill and conditioning can contribute to minimising sex differences in ACL injury rates and risk factors. Dance is an athletic profession where similar

training age and opportunity is observed between genders.[10] Dancers accumulate practice in landing technique throughout youth, and despite incorporating similar high-risk movements and training loads, the disparity in ACL injury rates is not present.[11] Female dancers also do not display hazardous landing strategies associated with ACL injury when compared to male dancers or team-sport athletes.[12,13] Orishimo et al.[13] observed similar landing biomechanics between male and female dancers, and found a relationship between the age at which dancers began training and the frontal plane hip angle (i.e. a noted component of the 'dynamic valgus' collapse linked to the ACL injury mechanism[14]) during landing. A later study by the same group observed that dancers of both sexes exhibited similar frontal-plane knee mechanics during landing to male team sport athletes.[12] In contrast, female team sport athletes landed with greater knee valgus angles compared to dancers and male team sport athletes.[12] Together, these findings suggest that the potential 'female-specific' hazardous landing pattern may not be driven by sex – but rather training age and exposure. Reviews collating the evidence for sex-differences in landing[8] and side-step cutting[7] biomechanics have observed inconsistent findings across the literature – perhaps due to the sex-specific cohorts being unmatched on factors such as training age, skill-level or strength. This view is supported by a recent study which found that neuromuscular differences between females and males that potentially contribute to the disparity in ACL injury rates vastly reduce when controlling for relative muscular strength and training age.[15] While limited, the available evidence suggests that when equality in opportunity, experience and training age occurs – the commonly observed disparity in ACL injury rates and risk factors between females and males vastly reduces or disappears.

What questions should we be asking?

Female participation in AF and the “knee crisis” has brought ACL injuries to the forefront of sports medicine in Australia. Other team sports (e.g. basketball, soccer) with longer histories have already encountered this problem. Despite persistent efforts across sports, the disparity in ACL injury rates between females and males has persisted for decades.[2,3] A continued focus on biological sex determinants is problematic. Evidence suggests that a framework encompassing environmental and sociocultural factors, along with biological determinants is required. If we continue to catastrophise ACL injury in AFLW we may discourage female participation in the sport. Women's sport has been catastrophised before – until 1972 women couldn't officially enter the Boston marathon for fear their physiology couldn't withstand the demand! Australian football must avoid repeating these mistakes. Sports science and medicine must strive to better understand the whole of system development of female athletes in the sport. We must question how to address the inequities in player development and training opportunities, financial support, and access to facilities and professional staff. Instead of asking whether females should play AF, we must ask what we can do to address the system leading to ACL injuries in women's AF – so that women and girls can continue to play, and do so safely. Only after maximising long-term development opportunities for female players can we begin to address any outstanding ACL injury problem.

References

1. Australian Football League. 2018 Annual Report. 2018.
2. Agel J, Rockwood T, Klossner D. Collegiate acl injury rates across 15 sports. *Clin J Sport Med* 2016; 26:518–23.
3. Hootman JM, Dick R, Agel J. Epidemiology of collegiate injuries for 15 sports: summary and recommendations for injury prevention initiatives. *J Athl Train* 2007; 42:311–9.
4. Sewell E. Knee Crisis Growing. Herald Sun, February 9th, 2019.
5. Wood L. ACL Link Probe. Herald Sun, February 18th, 2020.
6. Hewett TE, Myer GD, Ford KR. Anterior cruciate ligament injuries in female athletes: part 1, mechanisms and risk factors. *Am J Sports Med* 2006; 34:299–311.
7. Benjaminse A, Gokeler A, Fleisig GS, et al. What is the true evidence for gender-related differences during plant and cut maneuvers? A systematic review. *Knee Surgery, Sport Traumatol Arthrosc* 2011; 19:42–54.
8. Beaulieu ML, McLean SG. Sex-dimorphic landing mechanics and their role within the noncontact ACL injury mechanism: evidence, limitations and directions. *Sport Med Arthrosc Rehabil Ther Technol* 2012; 4:10.
9. Bruton MR, O'Dwyer N, Adams R. Sex differences in the kinematics and neuromuscular control of landing: biological, environmental and sociocultural factors. *J Electromyogr Kinesiol* 2013; 23:747–58.
10. Weiss DS, Shah S, Burchette RJ. A profile of the demographics and training characteristics of professional modern dancers. *J Danc Med Sci* 2008; 12:41–6.
11. Liederbach M, Dilgen FE, Rose DJ. Incidence of Anterior Cruciate Ligament Injuries among Elite Ballet and Modern Dancers. *Am J Sports Med* 2008; 36:1779–88.
12. Orishimo KF, Liederbach M, Kremenec IJ, et al. Comparison of landing biomechanics between male and female dancers and athletes, part 1: influence of sex on risk of anterior cruciate ligament injury. *Am J Sports Med* 2014; 42:1082–8.
13. Orishimo KF, Kremenec IJ, Pappas E, et al. Comparison of landing biomechanics between male and female professional dancers. *Am J Sports Med* 2009; 37:2187–93.
14. Hewett TE, Myer GD, Ford KR, et al. Biomechanical measures of neuromuscular control and valgus loading of the knee predict anterior cruciate ligament injury risk in female athletes: a prospective study. *Am J Sports Med* 2005; 33:492–501.
15. Nimphius S, McBride JM, Rice PE, et al. Comparison of quadriceps and hamstring muscle activity during an isometric squat between strength-matched men and women. *J Sports Sci Med* 2019; 18:101–8.