UNIVERSITY CASEBOOK SERIES®

LAND USE REGULATION

SECOND EDITION

STEWART E. STERK

H. Bert and Ruth Mack Professor of Law
Benjamin Cardozo School of Law, Yeshiva University

EDUARDO M. PEÑALVER

Allan R. Tessler Dean and Professor of Law
Cornell Law School

SARA C. BRONIN

Professor of Law and Faculty Director, Center for Energy and
Environmental Law
University of Connecticut School of Law

FOUNDATION
PRESS

The publisher is not engaged in rendering legal or other professional advice, and this publication is not a substitute for the advice of an attorney. If you require legal or other expert advice, you should seek the services of a competent attorney or other professional.

University Casebook Series is a trademark registered in the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.

© 2011 by THOMSON REUTERS/FOUNDATION PRESS
© 2016 LEG, Inc. d/b/a West Academic
444 Cedar Street, Suite 700
St. Paul, MN 55101
1-877-888-1330

Printed in the United States of America

ISBN: 978-1-62810-129-4

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE.....	iii
TABLE OF CASES.....	xv
Chapter One. Introduction	1
I. Why Regulate Land Use	1
A. Efficiency Concerns	1
Notes and Questions	1
B. Aesthetic Concerns.....	2
Notes and Questions	2
C. Community Concerns.....	3
Notes and Questions	4
II. Regulating the Regulators.....	6
A. Who Are the Regulators?	6
B. Planners and Planning	6
1. Some History and Theory	6
2. Planning on the Ground: The Role of Plans and Planners in the Regulatory Process	7
Notes and Questions	9
C. The Political Economy of Land Use Regulation.....	9
III. The Doctrinal Starting Point: Village of Euclid	11
Village of Euclid v. Ambler Realty Co.	12
Notes and Questions	19
Chapter Two. Zoning Basics	23
I. The Zoning Enabling Act	23
II. The Zoning Ordinance or Its Equivalent	23
A. Division into Districts	24
1. Use Restrictions.....	24
2. Area & Bulk Restrictions	24
3. Height Restrictions	25
Problems	25
B. The Zoning Map	26
C. Administrative Provisions	27
III. Variances	28
Sasso v. Osgood	29
Notes and Questions	35
IV. Tools for Increasing the Flexibility of Zoning Ordinances	39
A. Special Exceptions or Conditional Uses	39
Petition of Skeen	40
Notes and Questions	43
917 Lusk, LLC v. City of Boise.....	45
Notes and Questions	49
Chrismon v. Guilford County	51
Notes and Questions	56

B.	Incentive Zoning.....	59
East Midtown Rezoning: Looking for Extra Zoning Rights?		
They're for Sale.....	61	
Notes and Questions.....	62	
C.	Transferable Development Rights	63
Selling the Sky: Katz's Delicatessen and the Sale of Air		
Rights	64	
Notes and Questions.....	67	
V.	Accessory Uses	67
Matter of New York Botanical Garden v. Board of Standards and		
Appeals	67	
Notes and Questions.....	73	
VI.	Zoning Amendments	75
VII.	Non-Conforming Uses.....	76
Cleveland MHC, LLC v. City of Richland	76	
Notes and Questions.....	79	
Trip Associates, Inc. v. Mayor and City Council of Baltimore	80	
Notes and Questions.....	87	
Modjeska Sign Studios, Inc. v. Berle	88	
Notes and Questions.....	92	
VIII.	New Urbanist Zoning	93
Questions.....	96	
IX.	Review Problems	97

Chapter Three. Beyond Zoning: Large Developments, Historic Properties, and Aesthetics

I.	Regulating Large Developments.....	99
A.	Special Zoning Techniques	99
1.	Floating Zones and Planned Unit Developments	100
Campion v. Board of Aldermen of the City of New		
Haven	102	
Notes	108	
2.	Cluster Zoning.....	110
Nexum Development Corp. v. Planning Board of		
Framingham	111	
Notes and Questions	114	
B.	Subdivision Regulation.....	115
Andrews v. Planning and Zoning Commission of the Town of		
Wallingford	117	
Notes and Questions.....	120	
C.	Site Plan Review	129
Derry Senior Development, LLC v. Town of Derry.....	129	
Notes and Questions.....	134	
II.	Historic Preservation	135
A.	Designation.....	136
Billy Graham Evangelistic Association v. City of		
Minneapolis	136	
Notes and Questions.....	146	

B. Regulation.....	149
Norton v. City of Danville.....	149
Notes and Questions	154
III. Aesthetic Regulation.....	156
Anderson v. City of Issaquah	156
Notes and Questions.....	163
Chapter Four. Developer Challenges: State Law	171
I. Municipality Has Exceeded Its Powers	171
A. State Preemption of Municipal Powers	172
City of Springfield v. Goff.....	172
Notes and Questions	175
B. Extent of Municipality's Delegated Powers.....	176
City of Ocean Springs v. Homebuilders Association of	
Mississippi	176
Notes and Questions	181
Note on Special Assessments	183
C. Unlawful Exactions	184
520 Victor Street Condominium Ass'n v. Plaza	184
Notes and Questions	189
II. Vested Rights.....	190
A. Establishing Vested Rights	190
Metro Dev. Comm'n of Marion County v. Pinnacle Media,	
LLC.....	190
Geisler v. City Council of Cedar Falls.....	196
Notes and Questions	200
B. Determining the Scope of Vested Rights	202
New Castle Investments v. City of LaCenter.....	202
Notes and Questions	207
C. Terminating Vested Rights	208
Fountain Village Development Co. v. Multnomah County	208
Notes and Questions	212
III. Zoning Estoppel.....	213
West End Citizens Association v. District of Columbia Bd. of	
Zoning Adjustment.....	213
Town of West Hartford v. Rechel.....	217
Notes and Questions	222
IV. Public Policy	223
Gangemi v. Zoning Board of Appeals of the Town of Fairfield	223
Notes and Questions	227
V. Vagueness.....	228
Kosalka v. Town of Georgetown.....	228
SP Star Enterprises, Inc. v. City of Los Angeles	230
Notes and Questions.....	232
Chapter Five. Developer Challenges: Federal Law	235
I. Takings	235
A. Historical Background	235

	Mugler v. Kansas	235
	Pennsylvania Coal Co. v. Mahon	239
	Notes and Questions	243
B.	Theoretical Perspectives.....	244
	Notes and Questions	246
C.	<i>Penn Central</i> Balancing.....	247
	Penn Central Transportation Co. v. New York City.....	247
	Notes and Questions	258
D.	Per Se Rules	262
	Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council	262
	Notes and Questions	271
	Note on Judicial Takings	273
E.	Notice (and the Denominator Problem, Revisited)	275
	Palazzolo v. Rhode Island	275
	Notes and Questions	284
F.	Moratoria	286
	Tahoe-Sierra Preservation Council, Inc. v. Tahoe Regional Planning Agency.....	286
	Notes and Questions	297
G.	Unconstitutional Conditions: Limiting Municipal Power to Exact Benefits from Landowners.....	299
	Nollan v. California Coastal Commission	300
	Dolan v. City of Tigard	305
	Notes and Questions	315
	Koontz v. St. Johns River Water Management District	318
	Notes and Questions	325
H.	Remedies.....	327
	First English Evangelical Lutheran Church of Glendale v. County of Los Angeles.....	327
	Notes and Questions	335
	Problems	337
I.	Ripeness and Limitations on Access to Federal Court	338
	Williamson County Regional Planning Commission v. Hamilton Bank	339
	Notes and Questions	343
	San Remo Hotel, L.P. v. City and County of San Francisco.....	345
	Notes and Questions	351
J.	Property Rights Legislation	353
	Notes and Questions	357
	Question.....	359
II.	The Due Process Clause	359
	United Artists Theatre Circuit, Inc. v. Township of Warrington	360
	Notes and Questions	365
	Town of Rhine v. Bizzell.....	367
	Notes and Questions	373
III.	Discrimination Claims: Equal Protection and the Fair Housing Act	375
A.	Discriminatory Line-Drawing	376

Hernandez v. City of Hanford	376
Notes and Questions	382
Questions	383
B. “Class of One” Claims	384
Village of Willowbrook v. Olech	384
Loesel v. City of Frankenmuth.....	386
Notes and Questions	395
C. Discrimination Against Racial and Ethnic Minorities	398
Urban Neighborhood Regeneration and the Phases of Community Evolution After World War II in the United States	398
Village of Arlington Heights v. Metropolitan Housing Development Corp.	399
Notes and Questions	407
Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs v. Inclusive Communities Project, Inc.	408
Notes and Questions	417
Problem	420
D. Discrimination Based on Disability	421
Cinnamon Hills Youth Crisis Center, Inc. v. Saint George City	422
Notes and Questions	427
Problems	427
Problems	429
E. Discrimination Based on Family Composition	432
Moore v. City of East Cleveland.....	433
Notes and Questions	437
Problem	438
IV. Free Speech Claims.....	439
A. Sign Regulation	439
1. The Metromedia Case	439
2. City of Ladue v. Gilleo.....	440
Reed v. Town of Gilbert	441
Notes and Questions—Billboard Regulation.....	450
Notes and Questions—Residential Signs	451
B. Adult Use Regulation.....	453
City of Renton v. Playtime Theaters, Inc.	453
City of Los Angeles v. Alameda Books, Inc.	456
Notes and Questions	462
V. Religious Freedom Claims	466
Westchester Day School v. Village of Mamaroneck.....	469
Notes and Questions	477
Elijah Group, Inc. v. City of Leon Valley.....	481
Notes and Questions	484
Problem.....	486

Chapter Six. Neighbor Challenges to Municipal Land Use	487
Decisions	487
I. Standing	487
Matter of Sun-Brite Car Wash, Inc. v. Board of Zoning and Appeals	488
Notes and Questions	491
II. Neighbor Challenges to Zoning Amendments	493
A. Conformity with a Plan	494
Griswold v. City of Homer	494
Notes and Questions	498
B. Failure to Comply with Statutory Procedures	501
Wally v. City of Kannapolis	501
Notes and Questions	505
C. Spot Zoning	506
Little v. Winborn	506
Notes and Questions	510
D. Standard of Review	512
1. The Traditional (and Majority) Approach	512
DiRico v. Town of Kingston	513
Notes and Questions	516
2. The Change/Mistake Rule	517
Clayman v. Prince George's County	517
Notes and Questions	521
3. Are Zoning Amendments Legislative or "Quasi-Judicial"?	523
Fasano v. Board of County Commissioners	523
Notes and Questions	530
Problem	533
III. Neighbor Challenges to Administrative Determinations	533
Bontrager Auto Service, Inc. v. Iowa City Board of Adjustment	534
Notes and Questions	543
IV. Environmental Review	545
Problem	548
Chinese Staff and Workers Association v. City of New York	549
Notes and Questions	553
Bakersfield Citizens for Local Control v. City of Bakersfield	554
Notes and Questions	564
Problem	567
Chapter Seven. Development Problems	569
Problem One: Exurban Subdivision	569
Problem Two: Suburban Multi-Family Housing	593
Problem Three: Urban Redevelopment I	607
Problem Four: Urban Redevelopment II	625

Chapter Eight. Private Restrictions on Land Use and the Rise of Common Interest Communities.....655

I.	Introduction	655
A.	Nuisance	655
B.	Covenants	656
II.	The Mechanics of Creating a Common Interest Community	658
A.	The Declaration	658
B.	The Bylaws of the Community Association	659
C.	The Plat Map	659
D.	The Deed	660
	Notes and Questions	660
III.	The Power to Levy Assessments	662
	Parker v. Figure “8” Beach Homeowners’ Association, Inc.	663
	Notes and Questions	666
IV.	Private Architectural Controls	669
	Valenti v. Hopkins	670
	Notes and Questions	675
	Note on Standard of Review More Generally	677
	Notes and Questions	678
V.	Governance: Adapting to Change	679
	Weldy v. Northbrook Condominium Association, Inc.	680
	Notes and Questions	685
	Woodside Village Condominium Association, Inc. v. Jahren	688
	Notes and Questions	695
VI.	Public Policy Limits on Private Restrictions	697
	Committee for a Better Twin Rivers v. Twin Rivers Homeowners’ Association	697
	Notes and Questions	706
VII.	Business Improvement Districts	711
	Notes and Questions	712

Chapter Nine. The Problem of Scale in Land Use Lawmaking715

I.	Municipal Formation and the Fragmented Metropolis	716
	Notes and Questions	718
	Village of Barrington Hills v. Village of Hoffman Estates	720
	Notes and Questions	723
II.	Approaches to the Problem of Scale	725
A.	Getting Local Governments to Think Sublocally	725
	Notes and Questions	727
B.	Getting Local Governments to Think Regionally	727
1.	Obligations to Account for Regional Impacts in Zoning Decisions	727
	Associated Home Builders of the Greater Eastbay, Inc. v. City of Livermore	727
	Notes and Questions	734

2.	The <i>Mt. Laurel</i> Doctrine	738
	Southern Burlington County N.A.A.C.P. v. Township of Mount Laurel.....	738
	Notes and Questions	746
	Southern Burlington County N.A.A.C.P. v. Township of Mount Laurel (Mt. Laurel II)	747
	Notes and Questions	753
3.	Anti-Snob Zoning Statutes	756
	Problem.....	758
	Notes and Questions	759
C.	Creating Regional Governance	760
1.	Regional Governments.....	760
2.	Special Use Districts.....	761
	Wrestling with MUDs to Pin Down the Truth About Special Districts.....	761
	Questions	762
D.	Pouring New Wine into Old Wineskins	762
1.	City-County Consolidation	762
2.	State Land Use Regulation.....	762
	Rudd v. Malheur County	763
	Notes and Questions	768
3.	Federal Involvement in Land Use Planning	768
a.	Coastal Zone Management Act.....	769
b.	Urban Renewal.....	769
c.	Transportation Policy.....	770
d.	Environmental Statutes.....	771
	Rancho Viejo, LLC v. Norton.....	773
	Questions	781
E.	Land Use Law and Climate Change.....	781
	Cleveland National Forest Foundation v. San Diego Association of Governments	783
	Notes and Questions	791
	Chapter Ten. Local Government as Market Participant	793
	Kelo v. City of New London.....	794
	Notes and Questions.....	803
	Centene Plaza Redevelopment Corp. v. Mint Properties.....	806
	Notes and Questions.....	809
	INDEX	813